



# City of Richmond

City Hall  
900 East Broad Street

## Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review

---

Tuesday, November 22, 2022

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

---

[PDRPRES  
2022.077](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission Architectural Review

**Attachments:** [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW](#)

### Call to Order

This meeting was called to order at 3:35pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are present in City Hall.

### Roll Call

**Present --** 7 - \* Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., \* Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, \* Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, \* Commissioner Andrew Moore, \* Commissioner Sean Wheeler, \* Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and \* Commissioner John Grier

**Absent --** 2 - \* Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and \* Commissioner Mitch Danese

### OTHER BUSINESS

#### Approval of Minutes

#### Secretary's Report

Secretary Dandridge provided an update on staffing changes within the Planning Department.

#### Administrative Approval Report

#### Enforcement Report

Mr. Dandridge provided an update on ongoing CAR violations including a driveway on Hermitage Road, a bright restaurant sign on W. Broad Street, and a roof that was replaced on N. Arthur Ashe Boulevard without CAR and building review.

Rear porch work on 1830 W. Grace Street has been completed without review and approval by CAR, as well.

The business portion of the meeting was adjourned at 3:43pm.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

Commissioner Rodriguez arrived.

The regular portion of the meeting began at 4:00pm.

Mr. Dandridge re-read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the Regular Agenda to the Consent Agenda or vice versa.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to move 15 N. 29th Street to the consent agenda.

The applicant accepts staff recommendations.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 7 – Brewer, Grier, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Rodriguez, Wheeler

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Vice Chair Moore, to move 507 N. 28th Street to the consent agenda.

The applicant accepts staff recommendations.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 7 – Brewer, Grier, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Rodriguez, Wheeler

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to accept the consent agenda as amended.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 7 -** Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

1. [COA-120497-2022](#) 2900-2902 E. Franklin Street - Construct two, semi-attached, single-family dwellings on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: a final window and door schedule be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

6. [COA-120499-2022](#) 15 N. 29th Street - Construct a rear addition.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final color selections be submitted for administrative review and approval; first and second floor windows have a consistent pane configuration with true SDL's.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

9. [COA-120502-2022](#) 507 N. 28th Street - Construct a rear garage.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: windows be aluminum clad wood or wood; the siding either be wood or smooth unbeaded fiber cement; final color specifications be submitted for staff review and approval; final window and garage door designs and specifications submitted for staff review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**REGULAR AGENDA**

The regular portion of the meeting began at 4:06pm.

2. [COA-120501-2022](#) 219-225 W. Broad Street - Construct a new, 8-story, mixed-use building on a vacant lot, and rehabilitate the façade of an existing building.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked why the project is being treated as a demolition rather than an addition.

Mr. Dandridge said that the project cannot continue without partial or complete removal of the exterior wall. For demolitions of this scale, it's important to have detailed records and proof that other options were first considered.

The applicant, Rick Fischl from SMBW, commented that the HVAC system will not be visible. As for the demolition, the applicant is open to providing structural reports confirming disrepair and water damage. The defining characteristic of the structure is the front façade, but the western and southern walls become completely obstructed and effectively become interior walls. There were other options considered and demolition allows for greater density and opportunities for parking on-site. Above-grade parking is a suitable option for the district rather than below-grade.

Commissioner Morgan thinks the applicant should add windows to the east side wall of the new building facing 219 W Broad Street.

Fischl said that is still a possibility.

Commissioner Grier asked Mr. Dandridge if the design meets the overall zoning.

Mr. Dandridge said he has not reviewed zoning regulations.

Jennifer Mullins, on behalf of the applicant, said the project meets all aspects of zoning.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to approve the application as submitted with the condition that additional windows be added to the front portion of the structure.

Wheeler said the windows on the front portion of the structure that overlooks the existing building make the building seem like one project. If they aren't there, it reads as two buildings. He questioned the logic of the demolition.

Moore says he buys the applicant's argument of increased utility and the necessity to have parking. The applicants are doing a good faith effort to retain the front façade of the building—that matters most for the district.

Johnson agreed that a commercial project like this may have additional parking demands.

Mr. Dandridge suggested two separate approvals: one for demolition and one for new construction.

Moore retracted his motion.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to approve the partial demolition as submitted finding that the proposed demolition is in compliance with the standards for demolition outlined in section 30-930.7(d) of the City Code, specifically the additional considerations for demolition adopted by the commission, finding that the type and quality of construction replacing the demolished portion of the building is a better use of the site, and that the scope of the project will relates the City Master plan, increasing density and using strategic structured parking solutions.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 7 -** Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**3. [COA-120546-2022](#) 3833 Hermitage Road - Construct a pergola.**

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

The applicant, Louise Lockett Gordon, said the pergola is intended as a garden feature with flowering plants. The notch in the eave was not intentional and she hopes that the Commission can exercise some flexibility. The notch is 4 x 4 inches, relatively small compared to the overall eave size.

Commissioner Grier asked about the size of the pergola and expressed concern about the vines being so close to the building, potentially causing damage.

Gordon doesn't remember the size, but the design is high enough to account for draping plants.

Grier said that if the pergola was reduced in size, it would increase subordination to the main structure.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if the post goes through the roofing material or shingles.

Gordon said the roof is only impacted at the notch. The top lattice doesn't extend to the roofing material.

Rodriguez said the pergola must go through the roof membrane which will cause future water damage to the eave.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commission Chair Wheeler, to defer the application.

Wheeler noted that the way the pergola is currently going through the structure is not

good and will rot the post and eave.

Vice Chair Moore said that's speculation on the Commission's part. The more important factor is that the pergola damages the historic character. It seems punitive to tell the applicant to remove the pergola entirely.

Commissioner Morgan is sympathetic toward the applicant and wants to be mindful about suggesting remediation of the tiny bit of damage that's been done. She asked Gordon if the pergola posts are on the deck boards or to the ground.

Gordon said the posts go to the ground. There was no permit required for the pergola.

Commissioners are okay with the pergola design generally.

Commissioner Brewer asked if the pergola could be administratively approved if it didn't damage the eave.

Mr. Dandridge said it would not be administratively approved but staff would recommend approval to the Commission. Installation of the pergola is the issue.

Commissioners think it could be administratively approved if the damage is fixed.

Johnson withdrew his motion.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commission Chair Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: applicant investigate the need for a building permit for the pergola; submit a revised pergola design to staff for administrative review and approval that relocates the existing pergola support posts and/or lowers the pergola structure so that it is not damaging the eave of the primary dwelling; and the final color of the pergola submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

4. [COA-120498-2022](#) 8 N. Arthur Ashe Boulevard - Replace fire damaged windows in-kind, replace deteriorated trim in-kind, and enclose a rear porch.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Andrew Moore asked if the Commission had concern over the removal of an exterior portion of a masonry wall that would no longer be visible once the porch enclosure was complete. The Commission did not express concern over this, as it would no longer be in CAR's purview once hidden from view by the proposed enclosure.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez,**

to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: a color palette for the window trim and exterior board and batten to be administratively approved; and the work be performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions and the applicant submit any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

5. [COA-119143-2022](#) 605 N. 21st Street - Create new window openings, and construct a new one-story rear addition.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

The applicant, Sarah Blackburn, clarified that work was underway when she realized that CAR approval was needed. The trim on the new windows will match existing windows. There are no original material windows on the entire house, they are all vinyl. There are 4 other windows on the south elevation that are the small transom size and the proposed windows on the 1st floor match the other windows on the building.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked how far the house went back before all the rear additions.

Blackburn doesn't know. She suspects it's whatever falls under the a-frame.

A neighbor expressed support for the applicant's design through Microsoft Teams.

Vice Chair Moore questioned the Commission approving windows on front bays on new builds but not allowing much leeway on existing homes.

Morgan has no issues with the size of the windows as submitted.

Blackburn asked for more clarification on the front window which is not unheard of in the area.

Commission Chair Wheeler said it would probably be a corner lot where that would happen.

Morgan seconded that the front window would be a prominent change close to the front of the structure. Current guidelines aren't very flexible and the Commission exercises flexibility currently.

Rodriguez doesn't know if the Commission should approve transom windows. She asked if Morgan would be okay with amending her motion.

Morgan thinks it's specific to where it's located. The window would not be very visible.

Commissioner Brewer doesn't agree with the transom window but since it's not visible she doesn't mind. The front of the house is the only original part of the home so putting a window there hurts the historic fabric.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to partially approve the application. Specifically, the Commission partially approved the application;**

**denying the installation of the proposed window closest to the street on the northern elevation and the proposed window on the first floor, front bay on the southern elevation; and**

**approving a new window on the east side of the chimney on the north elevation, a larger window may be submitted if necessary for staff review and approval; a new window on the rear second story; the new rear addition; the proposed window opening on the second story of the southern façade, a larger window may be submitted if necessary for staff review and approval; and an enlarged rear sliding glass door.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 6 -** Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

**No -- 1 -** Commissioner John Grier

7. [COA-120548-2022](#) 401 Brook Road - Add a canopy and composite decking boards to an existing rooftop patio.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

The applicant, Gareth Whitlow, said there is 1,800 total square feet of decking space. Part of the deck would go towards drainage. The property is a condo, and he doesn't own the whole building. The planters would be extensions to the deck and therefore, not removeable.

Commissioner Johnson asked if the neighbors were on board with the design and if the deck is only accessible to Whitlow.

Whitlow said the upstairs neighbor is fine with it and noted that they wouldn't be able to see the work. He is the only one with access to the deck and maintains it.

Commissioner Morgan asked if Whitlow has considered how the canopy will meet the guard rail.

Whitlow said he has no plans to change the guard rail and there will be no roof replacement. The roof deck can't hold a lot of weight and the condo association is fine with attaching the canopy to the exterior wall.



Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant would need to adjust the door.

Whitlow said no.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Morgan wants to mitigate potential visibility issues. If this design were on a new construction, the Commission would require the rail to be set back. She is not okay with permanent planters against the rail and the decking not being set back.

Wheeler remembers when the structure had a pergola and garden space on the deck.

The Commission discussed previous canopy structure and deck garden.

Morgan revised her earlier comment about planters. There is a non-visible section of the deck where she approves of it. The exposed section shall still have setbacks and no planters.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to partially approve the application. Specifically, the Commission partially approved the application;**

**denying the proposed canopy structure as submitted; and**

**approving the installation of new composite decking, benches, and planters with the condition that they be set back a minimum of 3' from the edge of the exposed portion of the rooftop patio to reduce visibility.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**No --** 1 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler

8. [COA-120500-2022](#) 27 W. Broad Street - Install an ATM machine in an existing storefront window.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commissioner Johnson has concerns about security. He asked if the applicant is intent on keeping the ATM on the front façade.

Mr. Dandridge said there is a strong preference for the front due to safety and security.

The applicant, Will Gillette from Baker Development Resources, is fine with additional lighting for security. His client prefers that the ATM go on the front of the building for safety and increased usage since it's the most trafficked spot. The ATM cannot be located on the side of the building due to ADA requirements.

Johnson asked why the applicant didn't explore ATM installation indoors.

Gillette said the interior is designed to be open concept and there is no appropriate vestibule in the building.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked about paint colors.

Mr. Dandridge said that the lighting and colors would be administratively approved.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: additional sign details, design, and dimensions be submitted for administrative review and approval for conformance with the general signage guidelines outlined on page 75 of the Guidelines; light fixture specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez

10. [COA-120505-2022](#) 3025 E. Franklin Street - Renovate the exterior of an existing multi-family building.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)  
[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

The applicant, Will Gillette from Baker Development Resources, reiterated the interesting building design and presentation to the street. The existing stairs encroach onto neighboring property. The proposed canopy would be a better version of the 4x4 canopy which isn't in good shape and may not be original. If there are no dormers or some architectural feature the building will look like a box without character.

Vice Chair Moore asked about the intent with the 1x8 trim dividing the units.

Gillette said the trim is to break up the massing, so it isn't all siding.

Commissioner Morgan asked if the attic would become occupiable.

Gillette said no.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Wheeler said the applicant could make the windows bigger or even add windows.

Commissioner Johnson said this is a tough building.

Moore doesn't know if the design is making the building better. The dormers don't help. He is okay with the canopy design and doesn't think it's a character defining element.

Gillette asked if the Commissioner knew of other ways to break up the roof line. Could another design such as the 3rd floor being converted into habitable space be administratively approved, or would it require a full submission?

Mr. Dandridge said it would require a full submission.

Morgan said the dormers are problematic for a few reasons. The windows are distracting, and they don't line up properly with the other windows along the roof line.

Moore said the main shallow roof is problematic from a design standpoint and questioned if it could be made steeper.

**A motion was made by Commission Chair Wheeler, seconded by Vice Chair Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: a final window schedule with associated labeled plans be submitted for administrative review and approval; final material and color specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; dormer windows be removed from the proposed design; specifications on any hardscaping, HVAC, and trash receptacles be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval, as well as associated screening.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 7 -** Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

## **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

11. [COA-120503-2022](#) 2210 E. Marshall Street - Construct a new three story attached dwelling.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

[Decision Letter](#)

This application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

The applicant, Will Gillette from Baker Development Resources, noted that the house is semi attached which saves windows on the existing, neighboring building. Many nearby attached buildings are not vertically aligned because of topography and this design seeks to align.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if there are other 3-story buildings within the area.

Commissioners said no, only those with English basements.

Vice Chair Moore thinks the overall style is severe in comparison with everything else.

Commissioner Morgan has concerns about height and the lack of a pronounced front porch/stoop area.

Commission Chair Wheeler thinks the building should be detached. The narrowness can remain in the front and expand out in the back, so the structure won't lose square footage. The porch should continue all the way across and be pushed back to align better.

**This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.**

## **Adjournment**

This meeting was adjourned at 7:23pm.