



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, June 28, 2022

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

To access the meeting via Microsoft Teams, please use the following link:
<https://tinyurl.com/JuneCARMeeting> or dial *67-804-316-9457 and enter ID: 293 545 818#

[PDRPRES
2022.031](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW](#)

Call to Order

The meeting began at 3:30pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are present in City Hall.

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, * Commissioner John Grier and * Commissioner Mitch Danese

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Approval of Minutes

April 2022

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that the April 2022 meeting minutes be approved.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

May 2022

These minutes were not reviewed.

Secretary's Report

Mr. Dandridge spoke about the 2323 Venable Street appeal, which was heard at Council on Monday, June 27th. Council overruled the CAR decision.

Mr. Pearson asked if it was disclosed that the applicant was a City attorney. Mr. Dandridge said no.

Mr. Dandridge also talked about the VUU appeal situation and that they are appealing the fact that it was stricken from the agenda.

Mr. Dandridge also said staff met with the Washington Park community. They are interested in becoming an O&HD. They will get started with the process in the fall.

Administrative Approval

There were no comments from the Commission on the Administrative Approval Report.

Enforcement Report

Existing violations were discussed in the Secretary's Report.

Elections

Commissioner Wheeler said he would step up as Chair, and Commissioner Moore is considering to run as Vice Chair.

A motion was made by Wheeler, seconded by Pearson, to nominate Commissioner Wheeler as Chair.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Grier, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler
Excused – 1 – Johnson

A motion was made by Wheeler, seconded by Morgan, to nominate Commissioner Moore as Vice Chair.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Grier, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler
Excused – 1 – Johnson

A motion was made by Brewer, seconded by Wheeler, to accept the nominations for Chair and Vice Chair.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

CONSENT AGENDA

The regular portion of the meeting was called to order at 4:00pm.

Alex Dandridge re-read the announcement info for virtual meetings.

Commission Chair Wheeler explained that there is an order to the meeting, starting with the Consent Agenda, which are items earmarked for the staff recommendations to be approved by Commission without formal review, followed by the Regular Agenda, and

concluding with the Conceptual Review. At appropriate times, applicants will have an opportunity to speak in regard to their applications, or to request that their items from the consent agenda.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicants and/or Commissioners wished to move any items from the regular agenda to the consent agenda or vice versa.

3404 E. Broad said she did not agree with staff recommendations and would like to move their item to the Regular Agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to 3404 E. Broad St. to the Regular Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Grier, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Excused – 1 – Johnson

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to move 2209 E. Grace St. to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Wheeler said that the application was well thought-out and asked if the applicant was present. The applicant said they were fine being moved to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Grier, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Excused – 1 – Johnson

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if there was any public comment on the Consent Agenda. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Brewer, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

1. [COA-112863-2022](#) 1843 W. Grace Street - Construct a rear shed.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Brewer, seconded by Commissioner

Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Final paint color specifications be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

3. [COA-112857-2022](#) 1121 W. Franklin Street - Install window security and a fence.

Attachments: [Application & Plans \(6/28/2022\)](#)

[Staff Report \(6/28/2022\)](#)

[Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A Motion was made by Commissioner Brewer, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to defer the application to allow the applicant time to provide additional information on the requests. Prior to the next submission, staff recommends that the applicant: Provide additional information on the extent to which razor wire will be provided above the new portion of the fence; Consider a fence design that more closely matches the previously approved rear fence that is located between 1121 and 1125 West Franklin Street (COA-048413-2019); Provide additional information on the proposed design of the East Gate modifications (between 1111 and 1117 West Franklin Street), including sketches. Staff is generally not supportive of razor wire that will be visible from a main thoroughfare; Propose to paint the new security doors a color compatible with the exterior of the building; Provide plans for the proposed rehabilitation of the front door of 1111 West Franklin Street; and Install metal window bars using fasteners attached to the mortar, rather than the brick.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

4. [COA-112858-2022](#) 2519 E. Grace Street - Enclose a two-story rear porch; alter an existing opening in a brick wall and install a new wooden gate.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A Motion was made by Commissioner Brewer, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The new support pilasters reflect the historic width of the historic pilasters, which have left ghosting on the rear façade; The proposed recessed panels be constructed using a historically

compatible material, such as wood. Final material and color specifications to be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; The new exterior rear stairs be constructed of wood and painted or stained to complement the existing dwelling and proposed rear porch enclosure; and The new windows be constructed of wood or aluminum-clad wood with true or simulated divided lights. A final window schedule to be submitted to staff for review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

5. [COA-112864-2022](#) 2209 E. Grace Street - Use existing masonry wall for "Mending Walls" mural project.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A Motion was made by Commissioner Brewer, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application as submitted.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

REGULAR AGENDA

2. [COA-112856-2022](#) 3404 E. Broad Street - Extend an existing front porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Brewer asked if there was any precedent for this. Mr. Dandridge said he wasn't aware of any for an uncovered projection off of an existing porch.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant was present. Uma Nidmarty, the owner, responded yes. 3400 E. Broad has their porch built to the sidewalk, though it is covered.

Commissioner Morgan asked what the current depth of the front porch is now. Ms. Nidmarty said it's about 5 feet, and 2.5 feet where the bay window is.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to deny the application for the reasons cited in the staff report.

Commissioner Morgan said that it's unfortunate that the home was built with the width in front of the bay window. She said that they could review an application that modifies the existing covered porch in a way that retains the covered porch and is more in-keeping with the neighborhood.

Commissioner Moore said he agreed. The design is not in-keeping with the guidelines.

Commission Chair Wheeler said that the house on the corner has more leeway since it's a corner property.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to deny the application for the reasons cited in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

6. [COA-112853-2022](#) 2905 E. Broad Street - Replace existing wooden windows with new aluminum clad wood windows.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)
[Existing Conditions](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if there were any questions for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Moore asked about staff's interpretations of the Guidelines.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant was present. Meghan Zapiec, the applicant, brought a window representative.

He said that the bottom sash is completely rotted along with the grills. He doesn't believe they can be repaired. The windows don't open and have a gap in the bottom. Ms. Zapiec said that she would like to make the back windows 2-over-2 to match the front.

Commissioner Pearson asked how long she's owned the house. She said that over a year.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if any historic window specialists have come to look. Ms. Zapiec said no.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened floor for Commission discussion.

Commission Chair Wheeler said they understand, but windows are a hot topic. He recommends talking to a historic window specialist.

Commissioners Morgan and Danese said that the front 3 windows should be priority.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to deny the application for the reasons cited in the staff report with the following recommendations: Applicant identify the source of the water that is causing the damage, and that the sill be repaired or replaced in-kind; and Applicant consider installing interior or exterior storm windows, which can be administratively approved.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner John Grier
- No --** 3 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-112855-2022](#) 2511-2515 E. Franklin Street - Construct a rear addition onto 3 attached dwellings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans \(6/28/2022\)](#)
[Staff Report \(6/28/2022\)](#)
[2511-2515 E Franklin Street - Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant was present. Will Gillette is representing the applicant and they plan on making every effort to preserve the existing trees, which is represented in the plans. The addition is planned with the tree in mind. Applicants are asking for a modification to the comment about the back deck. The plan is to divide all three into separate family homes.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment.

Andrew McRoberts on behalf of an immediate adjacent neighbor who spoke against the application.

James Miniffee a neighbor whose backyard is where the tree is planted, spoke against the application, and stated that he would end up as the financial owner of this tree when it dies because of the backyard renovations at the applicant's site.

Crandall Brothers against the application 2909 E Franklin.

Troy Farmer 2512 E Franklin opposes this application.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened floor for Commission discussion. Mr. Wheeler would make a motion to defer to further study the impacts of the tree, slope of the site interaction, and location of the trees in question, and have an arborist investigate the

trees in question.

Ms. Morgan was unclear of the public right of way viewshed, and which trees are specific concerns.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to defer the application.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

8. [COA-112854-2022](#) 2810 E. Broad Street - Construct a rear addition on to an existing dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant was present. The Applicant stated that he was present and is okay with all conditions.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant would be okay extending the first floor deck to the face of the support piers of the proposed addition above, and applicant said yes.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Rear addition be supported by square brick piers, rather than the proposed square posts, final design submitted to staff for review and approval; Final window schedule be submitted for administrative review and approval; New rear basement door be a simple wood, or wood and glass design, final door specifications submitted to Staff for administrative review and approval; New second story, rear door fit within the existing width of the existing masonry opening; Applicant submit additional information on the exterior rehabilitation of the existing dwelling in a subsequent COA application to Staff for administrative review and approval; and Windows on the existing dwellings be retained and repaired.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

9. [COA-113062-2022](#) 620 N. 25th Street - Replace existing wood siding with a substitute material.

Attachments: [Application & Plans \(6/28/2022\)](#)

[Staff Report \(6/28/2022\)](#)

[Application & Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant was present. Applicant asked the Commission to reconsider the use of Hardie Plank which is already in use in the historic district in sight of the public view. Additionally, there is a supply shortage of old growth forests that would be used to replace the wood in kind. The burden is high for the property owners who also operate the business at the property.

Chair Wheeler asked if the cost of Southern Yellow Pine is higher than Hardi Plank and the contractor confirmed that yes, at this time, that is the case.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened floor for Commission discussion.

Mr. Pearson motioned to defer so the community, staff, and applicants can find a solution for the applicant and to conduct more research. A discussion was had on the merits and drawbacks to using Hardie plank or the original southern yellow pine.

Mr. Moore is willing to work with staff and the applicant to find a solution and other appropriate materials.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to defer the application.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

No -- 1 - Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

10. [COA-112865-2022](#) 2712 E. Franklin Street - Construct a new rear garage.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the applicant was present.

Applicant Will Gillette said that there are a wide range of windows immediately adjacent. Otherwise, they are amicable to other staff comments.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for Commission discussion.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:15pm.