



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, May 24, 2022

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

This meeting will be held in-person at City Hall

[PDRPRES
2022.029](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW](#)

Call to Order

The meeting began at 3:30pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are present in City Hall.

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and * Mitch Danese

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner John Grier

OTHER BUSINESS

Approval of Minutes

Secretary's Report

Mr. Dandridge said that the appeal for 2323 Venable was introduced at Council last night and was sponsored by Councilwoman Newbille. It will be discussed at the next Land Use, Housing & Transportation meeting on June 21st.

He also said that elections for Chair & Vice Chair are usually done at the June meetings, so next month the Commission will have to elect those positions.

Administrative Approval Report

There were no comments.

Enforcement Report

Mr. Dandridge talked about some updates to the ongoing violations at 406 N. 24th St.

Commission Chair Johnson asked about the enforcements that were brought up by the public at the previous meeting. Mr. Dandridge gave updates on those enforcements, stating that staff was still currently working with property owners to abate those violations.

Commissioner Rodriguez said that the tile porch on West Grace hasn't been installed yet. She also asked about the Stuart Court apartment timeline. Mr. Dandridge said he would follow up on those past approvals.

The business portion was adjourned at 3:41pm.

Consideration of Continuances and Deletions from Agenda

Item 9, 529 Mosby Street, was continued to the June meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Sean Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, to continue item 9. 529 Mosby Street to the June 2022 Meeting.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

CONSENT AGENDA

The regular portion of the meeting was called to order at 4:00pm.

Alex Dandridge re-read the announcement info for virtual meetings.

Commission Chair Johnson explained that there is an order to the meeting, starting with the Consent Agenda, which are items earmarked for the staff recommendations to be approved by Commission without formal review, followed by the Regular Agenda, and concluding with the Conceptual Review. At appropriate times, applicants will have an opportunity to speak in regard to their applications, or to request that their items from the consent agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson said that 529 Mosby Street has requested to continue their application until June.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to continue 529 Mosby to the June 2022 meeting.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler
Excused – 1 – Grier

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the regular agenda to the consent agenda or vice versa.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to move 2618 E. Clay to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Dandridge said that

the applicant will not be in attendance today, but that they didn't have any concerns with the staff report.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler
Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to move 1606 W. Grace, to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Aaron Olson responded yes. They said they're fine with the staff recommendations.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

Commissioner Morgan asked if anyone had heard anything from West Grace Street Association. Nobody had heard anything.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked about windows being bricked in. Mr. Olson said that they're not altering any architectural details.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler
Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to move 106 Shockoe Slip, to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, representing the Martin Agency, said they were okay with staff recommendations.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler
Excused – 1 – Grier

Commissioner Moore asked about the wall at 3317 Monument Ave.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any Commission discussion on the

Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

1. [COA-111519-2022](#) 3317 Monument Avenue - Replace an existing rear aluminum fence with a stucco clad masonry wall and metal gate.

Attachments: [Applications & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the final gate design not include decorative elements, but rather be a simple design, similar to the existing gates, specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

5. [COA-111518-2022](#) 2618 E. Clay Street - Construct a new rear screened in porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the skylights be installed flush with the roof, to be noted and shown on the plans prior to applying for a building permit.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

6. [COA-111525-2022](#) 1606 W. Grace Street - Construct a new rear porch and brick wall.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Final material specifications for the brick wall and rear steps be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Applicant submit a final metal railing design and dimensions and the metal roof color to staff for administrative review and approval; The proposed covered porch columns be wood; and Either box or half round gutters be used, final specifications submitted for administrative approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

8. [COA-111528-2022](#) 106 Shockoe Slip - Construct a new rooftop addition on an existing building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final paint/stain colors be submitted for staff review and approval; and final specification on exterior light fixtures be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

REGULAR AGENDA

2. [COA-111537-2022](#) 1500 N. Lombardy - Retain four internally illuminated wall signs on the Belgian Building Tower.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Planning Director Kevin Vonck gave a presentation on the project.

Commissioner Wheeler asked why the project is coming back to CAR since they already voted on it. Mr. Vonck said enough time has passed, and the applicant should be able to provide more context than the original discussion.

Commissioner Pearson said that this should be stricken from the agenda.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to strike this item from the Agenda, finding that the original February 25, 2020 denial of the application COA-069101-2022 was still a valid decision, and the application presented on May 24, 2022 did not provide any additional information that would alter the Commission's original decision.

Commissioner Pearson said that because the sign hasn't changed and CAR has already heard it, it should not be heard again – they didn't appeal.

Commissioner Brewer asked if there was precedent for this. Mr. Dandridge said that the violation would still be outstanding if it was never abated, which it is. He said that the applicant has presented more information on the way the signage was installed. He also said the applicants missed the appeal deadline for the original February 2020 CAR decision to deny the signage installation.

Commissioner Morgan said she had to abstain from this matter.

Mr. Vonck said that because more information was provided, this body should consider that – both on the installation and the DHR easement.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if DHR has made an official statement. Mr. Vonck said no, it did not feel appropriate.

Commissioner Pearson said that the applicant didn't appeal, so at this point he can't justify spending more time on this. It could be considered a dangerous precedent for future denied applications.

Commissioner Wheeler asked about the time frame for an appeal. Mr. Dandridge said that the applicant has 15 days after the decision to appeal.

Mr. Vonck said that the applicant may be able to go through a Special Use Permit route.

Commissioner Wheeler said that the only new insight is that taking down the sign will cause damage to the building. He said he doesn't want to set a precedent.

Commission Chair Johnson said he didn't see any new information that would change his decision.

3. [COA-111523-2022](#) 611 N. 26th Street - Construct a new 2-story, rear addition and a new 2-story rear garage.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[22-0726 structural inspection](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alyson Oliver.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any questions for Staff from Commissioner.

Commissioner Moore asked about the conceptual review. Ms. Oliver said that the Commission wanted more structural information on the demolition.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Matt Jarreau said that his family is growing and wants to stay in Church Hill. He said he did the renovation and rebuilt it 11 years ago. The rear addition is problematic and is not sustainable. Mr. Jarreau said he was good with staff's recommendations.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner

Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The lap siding on the proposed rear addition and detached garage be smooth and without a bead and differentiated from the original dwelling in width. Final material and color specifications to be submitted to staff for review and approval; A final window schedule be provided for staff review and approval; and Final design and material specifications for the proposed fence be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

4. [COA-111529-2022](#) 815-821 Mosby Street - Construct a new 10-unit, 3-story, multi-family building on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if staff had pictures of the railing.

Mr. Dandridge said that staff was picturing Richmond Rail, but that perhaps the applicant should use metal instead of wood.

Commissioner Moore asked where the gutters are. Mr. Dandridge said there were no details submitted for this.

Commissioners Wheeler & Moore agreed that a historic rail might be inappropriate here due to the contemporary design of the proposed building.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present.

Todd Dykshorn, the applicant, said there wouldn't be any downspouts or gutters on the Mosby side; the north & south walls would be recessed. He said he was okay with all of the staff recommendations. He said the railing would be more modern and simple in profile.

Commissioner Morgan asked what the hyphen element connecting the two-story and three-story sections of the building would be used for. Mr. Dykshorn clarified that it would be a stair tower that would provide access to the individual units.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Resident, Nancy Lambert, said that they're creating new characteristic of height on Mosby. The Guidelines do overlay the zoning. CAR doesn't seem to be adhering to the Guidelines. By changing some characteristics, they'd be eroding what Union Hill would be designed for – this is a really slippery slope.

Commissioner Morgan said that staff does a wonderful job of referencing the Guidelines

with their conditions – for example, there are references to siting, form, height, width, proportion & massing – the Commission reviews those and accepts staff recommendations 9 out of 10 times because of their due diligence.

Commissioner Moore asked what kind of fence should be there – he said a vertically-oriented picket would be more in-keeping with the district.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The metal railings match the dimensions of railings found in the district, and that final material and design specifications for the railings and cornice be submitted for administrative review and approval; Staff recommends the either box or half round gutters be used, specifications submitted for administrative review and approval; The applicant provide additional information on parking lot screening for administrative review and approval; and Staff recommends that a detailed site plan that includes dimensioned drawings of the new retaining wall and the location of new sidewalks, stairs, and parking areas, HVAC units, and trash receptacles be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

7. [COA-111521-2022](#) 2317 M Street - Rehabilitate an existing dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present.

John Heberd, the applicant, said that they are fine with all staff conditions. He also said that this is a historic tax credit project, so they'll have DHR approvals as well.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if they'd submitted to DHR yet.

Mr. Heberd said no, they were going to go through the CAR process first.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if they had a register of the railing height. Mr. Heberd said they might be able to find where it was. All of the handrail was gone when they got the property, but there may be ghosting that indicates its original height.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The applicant either use a box gutter or a half round gutter on the rear of the building; The new wood, tongue and groove decking match the original in dimension and be installed perpendicular to the face of the building; The new mortar match the original in color and composition and any new brick match the existing as closely as possible; and Final pilaster and railing design for the exterior of the porch enclosures match the original if evidence exists, or have a similar dimension and reveal to historic railings and pilasters in the district, a final dimensioned design submitted for administrative review and approval.

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

9. [COA-111517-2022](#) 529 Mosby Street - Demolish an existing, frame, detached single family dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This item was continued to the June 2022 Meeting.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn

10. [COA-111526-2022](#) 965 Pink Street - Construct a new single family, two story detached dwelling on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Pearson recused himself from the item.

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any questions for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if the shakes should be smooth.

Commissioner Morgan asked if shakes can even be smooth.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present.

Will Gillette said that this was previously presented in March 2022 – the design is supposed to be compatible with the new construction in this area. Any additional reduction to the depth of the porch would reduce the livability of the space as a porch – any porch less than 6 feet isn't necessarily operable. Otherwise, they agree with the other staff comments.

Commissioner Moore asked about taking off the projecting bay. Mr. Gillette said this does a good job addressing the corner lot from both angles.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if the street wall could be pushed forward to align with the building on the left.

Mr. Gillette said that he wants to make sure it conforms to the zoning.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the plans be updated to demonstrate the shutters will be operable prior to applying to a building permit; that all final color and material specification be submitted to staff for review and approval; and that the front façade align with the front façade of 967 Pink Street to create a more uniform street wall.

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Mitch Danese

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

11. [COA-111520-2022](#) 713 N. 24th Street - Construct a new two story detached single family dwelling on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alyson Oliver.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any questions for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present.

Mark Baker said that they are agreeable to most conditions. The applicants are fine with standing seam metal. They're in agreement with the front yard setback, but the zoning doesn't allow them to align the adjacent buildings. He said that 715 and 713 N. 24th were once attached, but zoning wouldn't allow it. The neighbor is also opposed to it. His second issue is the window comment. The client wants to be able to put a bed on the interior.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commissioner Wheeler said that in regards to the window he still has issues.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The setback of the proposed building align with the neighboring building at 715 N. 24th Street as allowed by zoning; The width of the porch be reduced to accommodate the extra width added by the proposed gutters; A standard window size be used on the first bay left side elevation, which is expected to be visible from the public right-of-way; A metal

roof, or other compatible material, be used on the porch. Final material and color specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval; A window and door schedule be submitted to staff for review and approval; and any HVAC equipment be appropriately screened.

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Mitch Danese

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

12. [COA-111530-2022](#) 961 Pink Street - Construct a new duplex and garage on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Pink 961 - Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Pearson recused himself and left the meeting.

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Will Gillette said that there are a wide range of windows immediately adjacent. Otherwise, they are amicable to other staff comments.

Commissioner Morgan asked about the square footage of the garage building and if it would be an ADU. She said it's massive and almost as high as the primary building. She said she would favor a reduction in height, or it could just be a dwelling without a garage. She said she was happy to see multifamily housing in this area. Mr. Gillette said having 2 extra garage spaces would be useful.

Commission Chair Johnson asked about the easement and alley configuration in the rear. Mr. Gillette said there would be an easement around the back and would reconnect by the garage. Mr. Baker said that the curved part is a private easement. The back part is an alley in common. The client will be getting lot line adjustments soon.

Commissioner Rodriguez said that the cornice or trellis seems to stick out pretty far. Mr. Gillette said it was meant to be a trellis. She also asked if the 3 part window at the top is typical.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Brewer said the 3-bay configuration looks crowded with 4 columns, so they should consider getting rid of the center column. Overall, the front elevation feels crowded to her. She also agrees with comments about the trellis. And for the garage, she feels the scale is really large.

Commissioner Morgan said that some of the crowded-ness may be due to the cornice of the porch & necking of the columns, and the 4-over-1 windows. The applicant doesn't seem to take much of CAR's comments into consideration. The horizontal banding at the back usually stretches the entire face of the building. She's concerned about the scale of

the garage, even though it's separate. Reducing the height would be beneficial.

Commission Chair Johnson said maybe the garage height could be reduced by changing the roof design. He also agreed that the front elevation seems crowded. He also thinks that the height of the garage needs to be reduced to be subordinate to the main structure.

Commissioner Wheeler said that the garage was a separate parcel according to the Sanborn map. He sees it as not necessarily relating to the main structure. He would have more leeway in the size of the garage – it's not going to read as part of the duplex. The dormers on the garage are too small in width. The trellis element should be scrapped altogether if it's for planting. On the main house, the gable window should be a single window and it should be wider to better fit within that piece. There's a lot of ornamentation he's not a fan of and it's getting too cottage-y. They could consider having a door on the rear. He's not a fan of the shingles.

Commissioner Moore said the columns in the front are well-proportioned. The tri-partite windows are too much. They should come up with a simplified window type or family. The pergola feature is silly. The garage design could be improved – it could either relate more or be its own building. The dormers could be a shed and could improve the interior space.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:15pm.