

# City of Richmond

City Hall 900 East Broad Street

# **Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review**

Tuesday, March 22, 2022

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

# This meeting will be held through electronic communication means.

**PDRPRES** 

Public Access and Participation Information - Commission of Architectural

2022.010

Review

Attachments: Public Access and Participation Instructions - COMMISSION OF

**ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW** 

## **Call to Order**

The meeting began at 3:32pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are electronically present, none are physically present in City

Hall.

### Roll Call

Present -- 6 - \* Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., \* Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, \* Commissioner Mitch Danese, \* Commissioner Sean Wheeler, \* Commissioner

Kathleen Morgan and \* Commissioner John Grier

Excused -- 3 -\* Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, \* Commissioner Andrew Moore and \* Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

# **OTHER BUSINESS**

## **Approval of Minutes**

January 2022

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the January 2022 minutes as submitted.

# The motion carried by the following vote:

Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

## Secretary's Report

Mr. Dandridge said that April 2022 most likely will be the first in person meeting that will

take place in City Hall.

He announced that the next Quarterly meeting will be on April 12th, and he thinks that it should be virtual.

# **Administrative Approvals Report**

There were no comments.

## **Enforcement Report**

Mr. Dandridge gave an update on enforcements, including an appeal for 2323 Venable.

The business portion was adjourned at 3:44pm.

# **CONSENT AGENDA**

The regular portion of the meeting was called to order at 4:00pm.

Alex Dandridge re-read the announcement info for virtual meetings.

Commission Chair Johnson explained that there is an order to the meeting, starting with the Consent Agenda, which are items earmarked for the staff recommendations to be approved by Commission without formal review, followed by the Regular Agenda, and concluding with the Conceptual Review. At appropriate times, applicants will have an opportunity to speak in regard to their applications, or to request that their items from the consent agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the regular agenda to the consent agenda.

Warren Davies, of 3203 Monument, requested to be moved from the Consent Agenda to the Regular Agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to move 1826 Monument Avenue to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 6 – Brewer, Danese, Grier, Johnson, Morgan, Wheeler Excused – 3 – Pearson, Moore, Butler-Rodriguez

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any Commission discussion on the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

## The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**Excused --** 3 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

COA-107849- 3108 E Marshall - Construct a shed in a rear yard.
 2022

Attachments: Marshall E 3108 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application as submitted.

## The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**Excused --** 3 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

2. COA-107937- 2906 E. Franklin Street - Construct a new, 3-story, single-family, detached residence on a vacant lot.

Attachments: Franklin E 2906 - Staff Report (2/22/2022)

Franklin E 2906 - Application & Plans (2/22/2022)

Franklin E 2906 - Application & Plans

**Staff Report** 

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application provided the following conditions are met: Window and door schedule be submitted for administrative review and approval.

#### The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**Excused --** 3 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

COA-107851- 2317 M Street - Demolish a non-original brick wall in a front yard.
 2022

Attachments: M 2317 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application provided the following conditions are met: Any new fence must be Administratively Approved by Staff.

### The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**Excused --** 3 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

COA-107856- 2430 Venable Street - Rehabilitate a storefront, install a rear landing & stairs, and alter existing window openings.

Attachments: Venable 2430 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application provided the following conditions are met: Final window and door survey be submitted for staff review and approval; The aluminum of the storefront be painted, and not unfinished; final color selections submitted to staff for review and approval; The rear stairs & landing be painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main structure; The three front façade, second-story windows have a 6/6 light configuration and be either true or simulated divided lights; Final siding paint colors be submitted to Staff for administrative review and approval; Any areas that are repointed match the original mortar in color and composition as closely as possible, and the new joints not be flush with the face of the brick, matching the reveal of the existing joints; Any new brick installed match the existing in dimension and style as closely as possible; and any salvageable, original storefront elements be maintained and incorporated into the design of the storefront.

#### The motion passed by the following vote:

- Aye -- 6 Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
  Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
  Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier
- **Excused --** 3 Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- **10.** COA-107857- 1826 Monument Avenue Install a 3 foot iron fence in a front yard. 2022

Attachments: Monument 1826 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

A motion was made by Commission Chair Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve approved the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The fence adhere to the zoning ordinance.

#### The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier

**Excused --** 3 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

# **REGULAR AGENDA**

3. <u>COA-107852-</u> 3203 Monument Avenue - Reconstruct a front yard retaining wall, front steps, and landing.

Attachments: Monument 3203 - Application & Plans

**Staff Report** 

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if Mr. Dandridge had found any evidence of a different retaining wall. Mr. Dandridge said no, there wasn't any documentation, but it seems to be out of place with the overall character of the building.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Warren Davies, responded yes, and said that the current stairs are dangerous, the concrete porch is settling, and the retaining walls are leaning into the sidewalk. Part of the intent was to make the new walls to be more subtle both in height and will blend into the street as a whole but with a more contemporary look. He thinks the brick wall at 3015 Monument Avenue is a good example of what it would look like. Mr. Davies said that the granite paver pattern should not be in the CAR purview since it can't be seen from public ROW.

Commission Wheeler said that he wouldn't be surprised if the steps weren't brick with concrete coating.

Commission Chair Johnson had questions about the concrete cap – is there a reason why they chose a 4-inch cap? Mr. Davies said that one needs substance to protect from expansion and contraction of brick. Otherwise, they pop off easily. So, it's more likely to stay in place.

Sam Daniel, the owner of the property, chimed in. He said his understanding is that the existing wall was installed in the 1950s or 1960s when Monument Avenue was widened. That's why the first 4 stair treads have a different rise. The steps were painted red originally, when he purchased the property 20 years ago.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the application as submitted.

Commission Chair Johnson said that staff is doing their job with the conditions, but he is okay with the application as submitted. However, he said he would rather see a 2-inch cap, rather than a 4-inch cap. He said he doesn't mind the decking on the porch.

Commissioner Wheeler said he would compromise with 3-inch caps. Commission Chair Johnson said it's fine as long as everyone else agrees.

Commissioner Grier said that when you get further west, there is a lot of uniformity with retaining walls. Mr. Dandridge said that he thinks it'll better align with the existing retaining walls adjacent to the property. Since the wall is already a different height, he wouldn't be concerned about a change.

Mr. Davies said the house immediately to the west is fairly low, and the house to the east is taller, so there's no relationship for height for retaining walls.

Commissioner Morgan said she's comfortable with it as submitted.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the application as submitted.

#### The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 6 Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
  Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
  Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier
- **Excused --** 3 Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- **6.** COA-106340- 207 N. 31st Street Construct two new attached, 3- story single family residences.

Attachments: 31st N 207 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson said there was a problem from last meeting with the neighbors with the alley easement in the rear.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners. There were none.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicants, Josh Bosler and Greg Shron, responded yes. Mr. Bosler said they have done an extensive analysis of financial summary, standards for demolition, and have met with neighbors. There were concerns with the rear alley easement, and they have decided to preserve it as is. The previous 3rd floor has been revised to push it to the rear of the property. Lastly, they recessed the wall and provided options for various materials and colors for the back portion.

Commissioner Grier asked if the rear will be on grade or crawl space. Mr. Bosler said it will be crawl space.

Commissioner Grier asked if they think it'll be high enough and if the stairs will be adequate. Mr. Bosler said that the height between the grade and sill plate will be high

enough to avoid damage. Mr. Shron said they are at the limit for how many risers there can be

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Charlie Field said there's no drainage off the side. He believes that the lack of drainage is what damaged the existing building.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commission Chair Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: For the existing dwelling: Approval of the demolition of the existing dwelling located at 207 N. 31st Street; For the proposed new construction: The rear portion of the building use materials in "Pearl Grey" and offset paneling be used on the inset portions only; The foundation use a dark colored brick and corresponding dark mortar, rather than paint; and The second-story windows on the rear façade be modified to be vertically aligned with the third-story windows; and the front porch roofs return to the structure and taper at the ends.

Commissioner Wheeler said he would add an architectural detail to the front porch roof. It looks a little bulky on the ends, and usually they would turn the corner. He would add that as an amendment.

Commission Chair Johnson said it seems like Mr. Shron has a plan to address comments made by Mr. Field and Commissioner Grier.

Commissioner Wheeler said that the rear is less obtrusive.

A motion was made by Commission Chair Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: For the existing dwelling: Approval of the demolition of the existing dwelling located at 207 N. 31st Street; For the proposed new construction: The rear portion of the building use materials in "Pearl Grey" and offset paneling be used on the inset portions only; The foundation use a dark colored brick and corresponding dark mortar, rather than paint; and The second-story windows on the rear façade be modified to be vertically aligned with the third-story windows; and the front porch roofs return to the structure and taper at the ends.

#### The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 5 Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
  Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner
  John Grier
- **Excused --** 3 Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- Abstain -- 1 Commissioner Mitch Danese
- 7. COA-107855- 313 N. 32nd Street Construct a new 2-story duplex with a roof-top deck on a vacant lot.

Attachments: 313 N 32nd - Application and Plans (3/22/2022)

Staff Report (3/22/2022)

**Application & Plans** 

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Brian Spencer, responded yes. He said he appreciates staff's recommendations and he is happy to move forward.

Commissioner Wheeler asked what the proposed guard rail for the stair is. Mr. Spencer said Richmond Rail will continue to the roof. He asked if there's a tunnel. Mr. Spencer replied yes, it's a tunnel. Commissioner Wheeler asked where the downspouts will be. Mr. Spencer said it will drain to the vacant lot to the north.

Commission Chair Johnson asked about the vacant lot to the north. Mr. Spencer said the owners intend to keep it vacant.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if there will be waterproofing on the stair. Mr. Spencer said there will be a parapet.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Melissa Newel said she lives directly across the street from the project and had two questions. She said she's unsure of the height of the roof deck and is wondering whether she'll be able to see straight into the roof deck from her 2nd story porch. Mr. Spencer said that he doubts that she'll be able to see past the false mansard or the railing. Ms. Newell asked the projection above the rail line. Mr. Spencer said that is the roof stair access point. Her second concern if there will be an impact on the shade tree in front of the property. Commission Chair Johnson said it's out of CAR's purview.

Charlie Field said there seem to be a lot of details missing, including questions of the tunnel to the roof. He also said the rectangular block is one flat square, ignoring traditional forms.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler said he's still hung up on the rear piece, and would like to defer the application.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to defer the application to allow the applicant additional time to address the rear stair tower roof projection.

Commissioner Wheeler said there is more detail needed for the rear. He said another option would be to remove the rear porch roof.

Commissioner Morgan said that she'd be okay with approving besides the roof porch.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to defer the application to allow the applicant additional time to address the rear stair tower roof projection.

## The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 6 Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
  Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
  Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier
- **Excused --** 3 Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- **8.** COA-107853- 967 Pink Street Construct a new single family, two story detached house on a vacant lot.

Attachments: Pink 967 - Application & Plans

**Staff Report** 

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Amanda Seibert, responded yes. She said she was fine with staff comments besides the horizontal siding. She also said they opened up the top balcony and left the second section closed because it's next to the alley. She's curious for what type of cornice detail on the gable staff was looking for.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Charlie Field said that he thought that CAR guidelines for new construction would be clearly modern. He strongly supports this building because it's clearly modern and goes along with the neighborhood.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to approve approved the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Final exterior materials be submitted to staff for review and approval; and Final window and door schedule be submitted to staff for review and approval.

Commissioner Morgan said it looks like there's brick on the front and north facades. She said the attempt at a bay window is kind of lost; perhaps wrapping the siding instead of using brick, it could distinguish the bay window from the recessed plane. Ms. Seibert said it isn't brick, but is actually horizontal wood. Commissioner Morgan said the gable next door is what they're trying to achieve.

Commission Chair Johnson said it looks like 2 different colorings on the different renderings.

Commissioner Wheeler said he would like to strike the first staff condition from the motion as well.

Commissioner Morgan said it'll probably be a thicker element in reality. Commissioner Wheeler agreed.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to approve approved the application for the reasons cited in the staff

report provided the following conditions are met: Final exterior materials be submitted to staff for review and approval; and Final window and door schedule be submitted to staff for review and approval.

## The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 6 Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer,
  Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner
  Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier
- **Excused --** 3 Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- **9.** COA-100313- 309 N. 28th Street Revise a previously approved COA to include a change in footprint and a rear garage.

Attachments: Application & Plans (October 2021)

Staff Report (October 2021)

28th N 309 - Application & Plans

**Staff Report** 

Commission Chair Johnson said he was going to abstain from this project.

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if there was a question of the way the roof would slope. Mr. Dandridge said the height underneath the roof line seemed to be taller, but the applicant reduced it 2 feet.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Morgan asked about the rear elevation sheet, it looks like 2 different door types. One option looks like it has transoms above the door. Mr. Dandridge said it could be worked out at the Administrative level.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Scott Broaddus, responded yes. He said the footprint changed due to the foundation issues related to construction. He's fine with the staff comments. He also said there was some feedback from suppliers and vendors; brick was eliminated as a siding material for the house. They will use lap siding and use stucco on the foundation wall only. The slope of the garage roof slopes towards the garage alley. They are choosing the garage doors without transoms.

Commissioner Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commissioner Wheeler opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve approved the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the decorative cornice brackets align with the outer edges of the second-story, front façade windows and edges of the front façade, or removed from the design; all final exterior material specifications be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; a final window and door survey be submitted for administrative review and approval; Applicant submit specifications on the location of all mechanical equipment

for staff review; the garage be clad in the same material as the main house, and if the cladding is hardiplank, it be smooth and unbeaded; final material specification submitted to staff for review and approval; rear garage use a simple garage door design that does not incorporate faux hardware, final design to be submitted to staff for review and approval.

Commissioner Morgan said she's fine to include a condition about stucco. Commissioner Danese agreed.

Commissioner Morgan said she's having a hard time visualizing it.

Commissioner Wheeler spoke to the option of not having any brackets. Danese and Morgan both agreed.

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve approved the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the decorative cornice brackets align with the outer edges of the second-story, front façade windows and edges of the front façade, or removed from the design; all final exterior material specifications be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; a final window and door survey be submitted for administrative review and approval; Applicant submit specifications on the location of all mechanical equipment for staff review; the garage be clad in the same material as the main house, and if the cladding is hardiplank, it be smooth and unbeaded; final material specification submitted to staff for review and approval; rear garage use a simple garage door design that does not incorporate faux hardware, final design to be submitted to staff for review and approval.

# The motion carried by the following vote:

- **Aye --** 5 Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner John Grier
- **Excused --** 3 Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- Abstain -- 1 Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr.

# **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

**11.** COA-107846- 815-821 Mosby Street - Construct a new 10-unit, 3-story, multi-family building on a vacant lot.

Attachments: Mosby 815-821 - Application & Plans

**Staff Report** 

Commissioner Danese had to leave and excused himself.

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Todd Dykshorn, identified himself and said that the staff recommendations make sense and described the siting of the buildings. He said that the blank windows are not uncommon in Union Hill.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Nancy Lambert said that the street elevation along Mosby dwarf the other buildings, including the corner commercial and apartment complex and single family detached houses. She says the massing isn't there. She said it's an insult as an entryway into Union Hill and looks more like Scott's Addition.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler asked now that the retaining wall is demolished, what is the intention for grading at the site. Mr. Dykshorn said they like the slopes going out to the corner, and they want to use that opening to create a new set of steps. Site is steeply graded (6-7+ feet). They're trying to use the natural hill, which also slopes back down to the alley. If there is a strong desire for a retaining wall to unify the block's appearance, they are open to it, but he says applicant thinks nicer to have green space, less imposing appearance. Based on feedback, Mr. Dykshorn will work on anchoring the site at the corner so that it is better aligned, potentially reinstituting the retaining wall.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if they would continue the retaining wall section down the road. Mr. Dykshorn said there's no strong desire for that and thought the green lawn would be a little mellower.

Commissioner Wheeler said he would recommend continuing the retaining wall. Massing wise, he agrees with all of staff's recommendations. The two-story seems heavy at the corner. He also spoke about the change in material from brick to the lap siding. Mr. Dykshorn said they were going back and forth with using the weight of the two story to anchor the building. He also said he wanted to show a legible change in the mass and show changes of different units.

Commissioner Wheeler asked about the 'hyphen' in between the structure, as it falls apart at the top for him. He thinks the building on the right's cornice band. He thinks the 2 story piece should be aligned with the street and that there should be a detailing on the corner to make the 2-story piece less heavy.

Commission Chair Johnson said that the duplex in the middle of the block is more traditional than the apartments at the other corner and he would like to see a transition in this project. He thinks continuing the retaining wall is a good idea.

Commissioner Morgan said she thinks the applicant has done a nice job transitioning from 2 to 3 stories. This is an atypical block with different forms and styles, so there's flexibility granted here. She also said the porch or balconies seem to have unfinished ceilings.

Commissioner Grier asked if anyone else thinks that it might mess up the parking layout to have an entrance in the rear. Commission Chair Johnson said it's an interesting alley with a lot of traffic – screening would be a good idea.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

**12.** <u>COA-107845-</u> 3820 Hermitage Road - Construct a new 2-story rear garage. 2022

Attachments: Hermitage 3820 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Charlie Field, said yes. He said this would have typically been a barn, and barns wouldn't have had hipped roofs. He sees this not as a smaller copy of the original, and there are several details that tie it together.

The owner, Manuch Amir, also identified himself.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commission Chair Johnson asked for the total square footage of the structure - the applicant said that it's about 600 sq. ft. on the first floor.

Commissioner Wheeler said that putting roof tiles that match the house says that they're trying to relate to the house, so that's why staff may be trying to match the roof. He said it could also be a simplistic shed roof. It either needs to relate more to the house or deviate even further. He also said that he likes the board and batten and the horizontal bands, as opposed to the 2 different siding types.

Commission Chair Johnson agreed with Commissioner Wheeler's comments.

Commissioner Morgan said that she's not too concerned with the roof specifically mimicking the main structure. She would be fine with a similar roofing material, but that the cladding needs to be simplified. She thinks that the vertical siding is more appropriate. The cross gable seems to meet the ridge of the main gable roof and she would advise the cross gable ridge come down.

Commissioner Brewer and Commissioner Grier both agreed with Commissioner Wheeler's comments.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

2022

13. COA-107848- 965 Pink Street - Construct a new single family, two story detached house on a vacant lot.

Attachments: Pink 965 - Application & Plans

Pink 965 - Staff Report

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Amanda Seibert, said she was present.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commission Chair Johnson said he likes the project and understands the desire for a larger front porch, but there is a precedent to maintain a certain depth.

Commissioner Morgan asks if the shutters aren't going to be operable, they should be taken off. She agrees with the porch depth. The gable over the entry becomes a substantial feature with the porch as it is.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if they own the lot next door. Amanda Seibert said yes, they own 8 of 13 lots on the block. He said if there'll be another structure next door, the porch should be reduced. Otherwise, the massing is fine, but the articulation of the materials bother him. He thinks the shutters should be removed. He thinks the siding should be more monolithic and shy away from the shingles. He also thinks there's too much detailing on the columns. He would also consider using different handrails on the porch.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

2022

14. COA-107847- 611 N 26th - Construct a new 2-story, rear addition and a new 2-story rear garage.

Attachments: 26th N 611 - Application & Plans

Staff Report

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Matt Jarreau, said yes. He said that the issue is that the kitchen addition has only 8 inches of clearance. It's within 2 or 3 inches from the ground. He completely redid the house when he moved in 11 years ago. He can't get to the water lines underneath the kitchen and insulate it. There are also problems with the joists. He believes that the addition is not original to the home.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if he's planning on infilling the lots adjacent. Mr. Jarreau said that the garage is on the same parcel, but he intends to live here for a long time.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler said that demolishing the addition is against the guidelines. Since he owns both parcels, he could still be subordinate to the main massing and meet the guidelines if the addition is proud of the existing structure - he would be encasing the wall instead. He also spoke about the garage and that he's concerned that the outbuilding will be viewable from the street.

Commissioner Morgan disagreed with Commissioner Wheeler and stated that buildings constructed in this way have been problematic. The addition seems to be minimally visible from the street, but the documentation on the structural condition will be necessary and helpful for the next meeting. She wasn't sure if he had other site improvements planned for the lot with the garage, but it would be nice to see intentional treatment on the site besides the garage. She wants to know how tall the house is vs. the garage.

Commission Chair Johnson said he agreed with prior comments, but he was thinking there was a big tree blocking the site. Mr. Jarreau said that the trees obscure the view from 26th Street. Commission Chair Johnson said he wasn't as worried about seeing the garage from the street. He also said that maybe the addition could swing out to the side a bit.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

# Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:45pm.