



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, January 23, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

BEGINNING AT 3:30 PM

Call to Order

Mr. Yates called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 5 - * Bryan Green, * James W. Klaus, * Joseph Yates, * Neville C. Johnson Jr. and * Carey L. Jones

Absent -- 4 - * David C. Cooley, * Sanford Bond, * Gerald Jason Hendricks and * Andrew Ray McRoberts

Approval of Minutes

November 28, 2017

The November minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

December 19, 2017

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that the December minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

January 16, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

The January quarterly minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts introduced the newly appointed Commission member, Ms. Carey Jones.

Ms. Chen updated the Commission on the status of the White House of the Confederacy City Old and Historic District change request. She stated that the removal of the museum building would be treated as a zoning language amendment and the Commission will hold a public hearing to advise the Planning Commission.

Ms. Pitts gave a summary of the discussion that occurred at the January quarterly meeting.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts stated that staff is continuing to attempt to add additional information to the permit approvals so the reports will contain more information.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries stated that staff has been following up on a few new enforcement cases, with the expectation that applications will be received for the February meeting.

Other Committee Reports

Mr. Green stated that his term is ending and a new representative to the Urban Design Committee will need to be appointed. He then gave a summary of the applications recently heard by the UDC, including elementary school signage, new bus shelters, and the Planning Commission's acceptance of the Commission's comments on Abner Clay Park.

Please Note

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

BEGINNING AT 4:00 PM

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 1 [COA-025770-2017](#) 2610 East Grace Street - Convert second story rear porch to screened porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 1/23/18](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report 1/23/18](#)

[Application and Plans - 11/28/17](#)

[Staff Report - 11/28/17](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report.

- 3 [COA-028035-2017](#) 401 North Allen Avenue - Enclose small second story porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the new windows have simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar and the painting be removed or moved to a less prominent location. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 6 [COA-028142-2017](#) 3208 Monument Avenue - Construct new sunroom in the rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the new windows be aluminum clad, wood windows with simulated divided lites to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar, the fiber cement siding be smooth and without a bead, and paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 13 [COA-027039-2017](#) 3118 East Broad Street - Construct a new garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 1/23/18](#)

[Staff Report - 1/23/18](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Application and Plans - 12/19/17](#)

[Staff Report - 12/19/17](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: specifications for the garage door be submitted for administrative review and approval, the fiber cement siding on the addition be smooth and without a bead, and paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 17 [COA-028679-2018](#) 212 North Foushee and 1-3 West Broad Street - Install an awning.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

REGULAR AGENDA

- 2 [COA-028033-2017](#) 503 West 19th Street - Rehabilitate a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Green, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the wood shingles on the front porch and dormer shall remain; the historic siding beneath the asphalt shingles on the façade of the structure be retained or replaced in-kind if the applicant in coordination with staff determines the siding has deteriorated beyond repair; on the secondary elevations, the existing asphalt shingles and deteriorated wood siding be removed prior to the installation of the engineered wood siding and the engineered wood siding be smooth, without a bead, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal; the sidewalk be replaced in-kind with new concrete; and the roof color be submitted for administrative review. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 4 [COA-028036-2017](#) 808 North 21st Street - Amend previously approved plans to change materials on new construction.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Kleyman, the applicant, came forward to present the proposal. He stated that the project was initially a different building and was completely redesigned based on feedback from the Commission and the public. Mr. Kleyman explained that brick is too expensive for this location as it is 3.5 to 4 times the cost of hardie plank and the location will not support a higher rental rate.

Public Comment

Ms. Nancy Lampert, a member of the public, came forward to voice her support for the staff recommendations as it is a highly visible building and all surrounding buildings are brick.

End Public Comment

Mr. Green stated that a 2 foot brick return on the side is not an urban form. He added that the only breaking point on the structure is the midpoint of the north elevation and there is no other logical place to change material as the elevation is so visible.

Mr. Klaus stated that all the other structures on the street are brick and that the entire south elevation should be brick and perhaps the north side could be brick back to the midpoint.

Mr. Kleyman stated that it would still not be financially feasible to build the project even with the suggested compromise.

Mr. Klaus made a motion, seconded by Mr. Johnson, that the application be approved with the conditions listed in the staff report. The motion failed 2-2-1 (Green and Yates opposed, Jones abstained).

Mr. Green asked the applicant if he would be willing to present a compromise if the application was deferred. Mr. Kleyman responded that he might propose the front and south elevations be brick with the other two elevations in hardie plank.

Mr. Green made a motion, seconded by Mr. Klaus, that the application be approved with the condition that the east and south elevations be clad in brick and the north and west elevations be clad in hardie plank. The motion failed 1-3-1 (Green, Johnson and Yates opposed, Jones abstained).

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to explore other alternative changes to the proposed building materials. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

5 [COA-028135-2017](#) 3116-3118 East Marshall Street - Construct two duplexes.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Green, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the siding be smooth and without a bead, the rooftop mechanical equipment be located as to be minimally visible from the public right of way, and details of any hardscaping for the parking area be submitted for administrative review. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 7 [COA-028143-2017](#) 2207 Venable Street - Rehabilitate home and construct two story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: Window 'E', shown on the proposed first floor plan, be a six-over-six wood window with true or simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; the work be performed in conformance with a Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval; and any new paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 8 [COA-028144-2017](#) 2112 Venable Street - Rehabilitate home and construct two story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Green, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the work be performed in conformance with a Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval; and any new paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 9 [COA-028171-2017](#) 3112 East Marshall Street - Amend previously approved plans for new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the rear porch railings be Richmond rail; the rear porch structure be painted or opaquely

stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found in the main structure to be reviewed and approved by staff; the window head heights on each story be aligned; the siding be smooth and unbeaded; paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the windows be simulated or true divided lite; the porch roof be black or grey membrane; cornice and door details be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the corbels use a traditional alignment and align with the windows; and all glass in windows be clear. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 10 [COA-028307-2018](#) 8 East Broad Street - Install non-illuminated blade style, double sided project sign.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Green, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted as the Commission determined blade signs are a sign type found in the district. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 11 [COA-028462-2018](#) 533 Mosby Street - Modify approved plans for a new garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the roof slope be reduced to match the slope of the primary structure, while maintaining the same wall height. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 12 [COA-028538-2018](#) 1131-1137 West Grace Street - Construct a new multifamily building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 2/27/18](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report - 2/27/18](#)[Application and Plans - 1/23/18](#)[Staff Report - 1/23/18](#)

Ms. Lory Markham, the applicant, came forward to present the project. She stated that the design is under the maximum allowed by zoning in terms of height and setback.

Ms. Sarah Oxenham Allen and Mr. Rob Osborne, representatives of the property owner, came forward to speak about the church's need for the project.

Mr. Walter Parks, the project architect, came forward to present the changes that had been made in the current submission. He stated that the largest change was in the design of the courtyard.

Mr. Johnson asked if Mr. Parks could address the comments from the West Grace Street Association. Mr. Parks replied that the project team has met with the WGA several times and have made changes based on their feedback. Mr. Parks added that when the setback was increased the square footage lost was added to the sixth floor however it could probably be reduced to match the previous design.

Mr. Yates inquired about the staff comments regarding the alignment of the water table. Mr. Parks responded that the current design was intended to be unique but they could adjust it if the Commission requested.

Mr. Tom Papa, the applicant, came forward to state that the project has involved ample opportunities for community input which have helped shape and improve the project. Mr. Papa asked that the Commission conditionally approved the application, to allow the project to meet its funding deadlines.

Public Comment

Mr. Jonathan Marcus, President of the West Grace Street Association, came forward to comment on the project. He stated that overall the community is supportive of the project but are concerned with some of the details, such as discrepancies in the drawings and clarification of setbacks and grading.

Mr. Jeff Jacobs, a representative of the property owner, came forward to reiterate the importance of the success of the project to the church.

Mr. Rex Scudder, a member of the public, came forward to comment on the project. He stated that he is also concerned with the details of the design including setbacks and grading.

End Public Comment

Mr. Johnson stated that the design had responded to the Commission's comments but he was concerned with how the community could be involved in resolving the remaining details.

Mr. Green stated that the project had improved, but it was still out of scale with West Grace Street, adding that the design does not improve the street. He also stated that the details still needed to be worked out, which is difficult to do after approval. Mr. Green also

stated that the proposed courtyard was a vast improvement to previous designs.

Mr. Yates stated that the design has vastly improved. He agreed that the structure is still out of scale, and he agrees that there are details that need to be resolved.

Mr. Klaus stated that he did not have a problem with the proposed massing if the six story portion is pushed back. He added that there are too many details that need to be resolved before it can be approved.

Mr. Yates commented that he is also concerned that there are only four Commission members voting this evening.

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to work with staff to amend the plans to clarify the plans in regard to the setbacks, the treatment of changes in the grade of the property, and discrepancies between the elevations and the renderings and to address concerns raised in the staff report and regarding the porch columns details. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

14 [COA-028569-2018](#) 2200 -2202 M Street - Construct a new duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Green, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the front porch columns be relocated to the edge of the front porch in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff; the bracket placement be consistent throughout the structure including areas with no proposed windows; the windows on the North 22nd Street elevation be vertically aligned; details of the proposed cornice and brackets be submitted for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed porch columns be submitted for administrative review and approval; the siding be smooth and without a bead; paint and brick colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; the windows be simulated divided lite with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; the rear deck railing be Richmond rail; and the deck be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found in the main structure to be reviewed and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

15 [COA-028570-2018](#) 2825 M Street - Construct a new duplex

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Green, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the entire roof to be clad in standing seam metal; details of the proposed porch columns be submitted for administrative review and approval; the siding be smooth and without a bead; paint and brick colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; all porch railings be Richmond rail; and the porches be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found in the main structure to be reviewed and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

- 16 [COA-028609-2018](#) 2901 Monument Avenue & 708-712 Colonial Avenue - Amend previously approved plans for three attached single family homes to alter the fenestration on the alley elevation.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The Commission did not review this application as a quorum of the members of the Commission were not present to vote on the application. The application will be heard at the next Commission meeting February 27, 2018.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 18 [COA-028034-2017](#) 820 North 23rd Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Charlie Field, the applicant, came forward to present the project. He stated that the foundation will be precast concrete walls, though it could be brick if requested. Mr. Fields added that he believed the roof was too low of a pitch to be metal, so TPO was proposed.

Mr. Green inquired about the two-bay porch. Mr. Field responded that the porch design was a replication of 310 North 22nd Street and is designed to be more decorative than functional.

Mr. Yates inquired if additional windows could be incorporated into the corner elevation. Mr. Field replied that he would have to examine the floor plans but it may be possible on the second floor, but probably not the first floor.

Mr. Green stated that a 3:12 pitch roof might be ok for a metal roof, a lower pitch would require a flat seam.

Public Comment

Ms. Emily Cook Asaro, a member of the public, came forward to comment on the project. She stated that the other new construction on the block is very large and sits closer to the street. She asked that this new construction be the same height and setback as the existing historic home.

Ms. Cook Asaro read a letter from Ms. Liz Opalak, a member of the public, which stated that the proposed home should match the setback of the existing historic home next door.

Mr. Green inquired what the proposed setback was. Mr. Field responded that the intent is to match the setback of the existing home next door.

Mr. Bryan Duncan, a member of the public, came forward to comment on the project. He stated that the new homes constructed on the block were supposed to line up with the existing home and they do not. He added that the existing new construction is also too tall.

Ms. Nancy Lampert, a member of the public, came forward to comment on the project. She stated that the proposed house is located on a corner, as Burton is a street, not an alley.

Mr. Yates stated that he was concerned with the elevation facing Burton Street. He suggested incorporating a bay window on the first floor.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

- 19 [COA-028608-2018](#) 2108 1/2 E Broad Street - Construct a new three-story single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Dave Johannas, the applicant, came forward to answer questions on the project.

Mr. Klaus inquired if the height of the English basement could be reduced to line up the porch with the house to the east? Mr. Johannas replied that he preferred no to as the current design reflects the staggered heights across the street. Mr. Klaus commented that the design interrupts the rhythm of the porches stepping up the block.

Mr. Yates and Mr. Johnson commented that they preferred the traditional design. Mr. Yates added that the building height could be reduced slightly, perhaps another foot. Mr. Klaus agreed that the traditional design was preferred, but he was still uncomfortable with the height.

Public Comment

Ms. Martha Broughton, a member of the public, came forward to comment on the project. She expressed her support for the traditional design, and asked that the porches be more aligned.

End Public Comment

Mr. Green commented that the current design fits better with the surrounding area, adding that the height should be reduced a foot or two to better align the porches.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 7:17 p.m.