



# City of Richmond

City Hall  
900 East Broad Street

## Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

---

Tuesday, April 25, 2017

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

---

### BEGINNING AT 3:30 P.M.

#### 1 Call to Order

#### 2 Roll Call

**Present --** 5 - \* Commissioner David C. Cooley, \* Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, \* James W. Klaus, \* Andrew Ray McRoberts and \* Joseph Yates

**Absent --** 3 - \* Sanford Bond, \* Bryan Green and \* Nathan Hughes

#### 3 Approval of Minutes

February 28, 2017

The February minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

March 28, 2017

**A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Klaus, that the March 2017 minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

#### 4 Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts stated that the quarterly meeting was April 11th and reported that she wasn't able to attend and only 3 Commission members attended so no items were voted on. Ms. Pitts stated that there was a discussion on the establishment of the City Old and Historic District in Shockoe Bottom and added that the Commissioners wanted to examine a larger area and to follow up with council members to see if there is a patron for the legislation. Ms. Pitts stated that she thinks Ms. Edwards, who submitted the request, is going to reach out to council members Newbille and Robertson to get their thoughts on the proposal. Ms. Pitts stated that there was also discussion of some terminology that they use such as 'beyond repair,' specifically in regards to windows, and stated that she believes the direction of the discussion was to remove the use of that phrase from the Guidelines as it is vague. The alternative discussed was to create some sort of standard or scale of conditions, especially when it comes to windows and doors. Ms. Pitts stated that staff will be working with Mr. Green on developing a scale and added that the other term that was discussed was primary and secondary elevations on corner properties. She reported that the discussion was leaning toward considering the side elevation of a corner property as a primary elevation and using that

terminology throughout the Guidelines. Ms. Pitts stated that staff is going to look at where the phrase 'beyond repair' is used in the Guidelines and how it could be removed. She then stated that some of the definitions are defined within the ordinance so to make certain changes the ordinance will need to be amended.

Ms. Pitts then reported that she and Ms. Jeffries attended the Historic Richmond Foundation Rehab Expo to answer questions and provide information to citizens. She stated that questions about windows were the most common. Ms. Pitts concluded by stating that the audio system in the conference room is going to be replaced by next May and we will have big televisions on the wall, new mics and a new audio system.

#### Administrative Approvals

The administrative approvals consist of permits that were signed off by staff.

#### Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries reported that there weren't many updates this month, adding that she issued a few more Notices of Violation and as a result staff has been in contact with some property owners. Ms. Jeffries stated that they have some applications on the agenda today as a result of enforcement activity. She also stated that she had issued a Notice of Pending Prosecution for one property and hopefully the violation will be resolved relatively quickly.

Ms. Pitts stated that for the house with the graffiti they have been in contact with the property owner who informed staff that he is an accountant and will be extremely busy until the middle of April. Ms. Pitts added that staff gave him until May 1st and stated that if no work has begun they will be issuing a summons May 1st.

Ms. Jeffries stated that staff already anticipates receiving a few applications next month from enforcement activities.

Ms. Pitts gave an update on the property where the owner had painted his foundation a blue color that came before the Commission and was denied. The applicant has removed the paint from the foundation. Ms. Pitts also added that Ms. Aarons-Sydnor has provided staff with some addresses of properties that are not within a City Old and Historic district where changes have been made and though they cannot from a CAR perspective follow-up on these, there are properties that Ms. Chen has reviewed as part of the tax abatement process. She added that staff has been able to follow up on some properties where the work has not been done in conformance with the tax abatement application.

#### Other Committee Reports

Recess at 3:40

Resumed with a presentation on Robert's Rule by Commissioner McRoberts

Mr. McRoberts led a brief discussion on Robert's Rules of Order and stated that the Commission can establish their own rules of procedures if they wished.

**\*\*\*Please Note\*\*\***

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

**BEGINNING AT 4:00 P.M.**

**CONSENT AGENDA**

Mr. Klaus made a motion to move item number #11 from the regular agenda to the consent agenda with staff recommendation, seconded by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor. 7-1-0 (Hendricks opposed).

Mr. Klaus made a motion to move item #10 from the regular agenda to the consent agenda with staff recommendations, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor and passed 8-0-0.

**A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Klaus, that the consent agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 1 [COA-015023-2017](#) 2501 Monument Avenue - Install pedestrian gate in existing brick wall and install sidewalk to connect parking area.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Map](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the vote of 6-0-0.**

- 10 [COA-015356-2017](#) 3625 East Broad Street - Construct new single family home on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded and the simulated divided lite windows include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 11 [COA-015426-2017](#) 708 North 24th Street - Construct new single family dwelling.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded; the windows be true or simulated divided lite to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; a window sample be provided for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed fence be provided for administrative review and approval; and paint colors be provided for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

- 2 [COA-014997-2017](#) 2023 West Grace Street - Reface front steps and add brick knee walls.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: brick steps be repaired or replaced in-kind to not include the proposed flanking walls. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 3 [COA-015011-2017](#) 2711 East Clay Street - Repair front steps and porch, demolish a rear addition, and construct a new rear addition.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

This item was moved to the end of the agenda as the applicant was not present.

- 4 [COA-015016-2017](#) 815 North 22nd Street - Rehabilitate the existing structure and construct a 2 story rear addition.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a

Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the size of the ground floor door opening on the façade be increased to be more consistent with the historic opening as shown in the photographic documentation in a manner to be reviewed and administratively approved by staff; the proposed siding be smooth and unbeaded; and paint colors be provided to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Gerald Jason Hendricks

**Recused --** 1 - Joseph Yates

**5** [COA-015017-2017](#) 2327 West Grace Street - Replace two rear doors with new double door.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by McRoberts, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: a modified design that maintains the appearance of the width and height of the original door openings be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; any infill of the openings included in the modified design be recessed a minimum of 3/8"; and the original jack arches shall remain. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

**No --** 1 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

**6** [COA-015042-2017](#) 2312 M Street - Replace siding, install new window openings.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[COA-015042 2312 M Street](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as presented for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the condition of the wood siding be assessed in coordination with CAR staff and if possible, a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged and installed with the historic reveals on the façade; the poly-ash siding be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal; a revised paint scheme be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval to include the trim painted a color from the paint palette, the porch details including the railing and columns painted the trim color, and the details on the façade painted the trim color; and the new windows and window locations be as shown in the alternate elevation presented at the Commission meeting with any minor

changes to the location of the second story window to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 7 [COA-015043-2017](#) 2320 Venable Street - Construct two story addition on the rear of an existing building.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the applicant restore any existing windows in the openings that will remain visible at the rear of the structure; a dimensioned setback for the addition be provided and that the setback be a minimum of 6" from the existing building wall to clearly delineate the addition from the historic structure; a single building material be used to clad the upper two stories in a manner to be reviewed and administratively approved by staff; paint colors be provided for administrative review and approval; the deck be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one of more of the colors found on the main structure to be reviewed and administratively approved by staff; and dimensioned details of the railings be provided for administrative review and approval.. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 8 [COA-015224-2017](#) 2705 East Clay Street - Construct rear addition, paint structure, replace front steps and handrail.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Cooley, seconded by McRoberts, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission denied the installation of vinyl siding. The Commission approved the painting, new addition, and the front steps and railing provided that the following conditions are met: the trim, porch columns, and lattice be painted white to match the existing cornice or another more appropriate color to be reviewed and administratively approved by staff; all window sashes be painted the same color; the addition be clad in a compatible material to be reviewed and approved by staff that differentiates the addition from the original section; and the railing design be modified to match the front porch railing to include a handrail and pickets in the Richmond rail design to be reviewed and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 9 [COA-015323-2017](#) 2900 East Leigh Street - Construct new single family home on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as presented for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the dormer at the rear be reduced in size as shown in the elevations presented by the applicant at the Commission meeting; the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded; details of the proposed railing be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the fence be painted or opaquely stained a color to be reviewed and approved by staff; paint colors not to include a dark gray color as submitted in the application for the siding be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and the windows on the west elevation of the portion of the structure with a side gable roof be the same width. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

## **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

- 12 [COA-015013-2017](#) 2901 Monument Avenue - Construct three new attached single family dwellings.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Klaus commented that he has some concerns with the differentiation of the 3 units and stated that it should read as a single building. Mr. Klaus stated that the separate units is not a pattern seen Monument Avenue and that it should read as an apartment building.

Mr. McRoberts commented that there are other ways to differentiate the units without changing the materials.

Ms. Aarons Sydnor commented that it is odd to see 3 columns transition into 4 columns on the front porches and added that having larger columns on the ground floor make a lot of sense because they are holding up everything above it but stated that having one column with nothing on it does not work.

### **Public Comment**

Mr. Robert Troad, speaking as a member of the public, stated that he thinks the new units should all be brick. Mr. Troad stated that the back unit of the 3 is going to be within 4' of the alley which will eliminate 3 parking spaces.

Mr. McRoberts commented that the structure itself is brick and various design elements don't make sense to him but that he is encouraged by the foundation height. He added that he is interested in seeing a more detailed drawing on how the garage entry and

foundation is going to work together. Mr. McRoberts also stated that he likes the concept of having 3 separate units that are not interrelated and stated that it is really interesting model and good to have in the market. He then commented that he likes the Juliet balconies and stated that it might break up the fenestration on the side street. Mr. McRoberts stated that he likes the garages and that they are needed and but he is very concerned about the loss of parking and agrees with the neighbor that this all needs to be considered. Mr. McRoberts concluded by stating that he likes the rooftop deck idea and other than the column design on the front he thinks it is beautiful and will be a welcome addition to the neighborhood with some minor changes.

Mr. Hendricks commented that he is okay with the brick and the stucco differentiation, adding that there is plenty of stucco up and down Monument Avenue so it okay to use it on the back of the units to help differentiate the units. Mr. Hendricks then stated that he is a little more comfortable with it as long as it reads together, it is okay to do the different materials. Mr. Hendricks stated that he was excited to see the recessed area in the plan as it afforded a lot of opportunity for an actual usable balcony as they have had problems with these Juliet balconies before. Mr. Hendricks stated that townhouse C needs some usable outdoor space where they can put a grill and get outside on their own property. Mr. Hendricks added that townhouse A has a front porch and townhouse B has a grassy area around the side but townhouse C, without a usable balcony, has nowhere to sit. Mr. Hendricks stated that the balconies on that side and the recess along the side will help emphasize that elevation as the front entry of the building for those 2 units. Mr. Hendricks stated that he is less concerned with the parking but understands that it is an issue and added that he has some concerns with the trash with units A&B and that there may be a city regulation which prohibits placing a trash can on a public way, adding that perhaps they can have a recessed area for the trash cans. Mr. Hendricks stated that on the side he was okay with the smaller windows which seem to be where the stair cases are located.

Ms. Aarons Sydnor commented that she was struggling with this new building type which isn't found anywhere in this area and added that it is not an apartment building where everyone enters through the front door as each unit has their own entrance. Ms. Aarons Sydnor stated that there are other issues with having 3 separate garages and commented that there should be a large shared garage fronting the alley rather than individual garages on the side street because having a garage face the main structure of a property is not something that is seen in the district. Ms. Aarons Sydnor then commented that she is concerned with the proportion and the look of the design and stated that the first floor elevation needs to be fixed on the front. She commented that she had thought the building was all brick and not stucco and brick, and that material choice had made sense to her because she had also thought it was a condominium. Ms. Aarons Sydnor then stated that the applicant is proposing this different building type but they are using the massing of a traditional apartment building on Monument, and so they are wanting it both ways, but she is not sure how the design is going to reconcile this. Ms. Aarons Sydnor stated that she agrees that a differentiation of materials is reasonable but states that she doesn't know if one as stark as brick to stucco is appropriate. Ms. Aarons Sydnor stated that if these are the fronts of houses then it should read as the front of the house but states it changes the building form from trying to look like a traditional apartment building and added that they need more emphasis on the side entrances.

Mr. Cooley commented that he likes the recess and the balcony concept if they can make them semi functional and added that he doesn't mind the brick and stucco, recommending brick on the front and stucco in the middle. Mr. Cooley added that they are losing 3 parking spaces and gaining 4 covered spaces which is a plus in his opinion and commented that the garage doors are offset so the trash cans have a place to go. Mr. Cooley stated that it is clever introduction of density and thinks they will sell well.



Mr. Bill Grogan, speaking as a member of the public, stated that he is not in favor of the project as it will create a problem with parking and stated that the Commission has an opportunity to have some foresight and err on the side of caution.

**This application was conceptually reviewed**

- 13 [COA-015425-2017](#) 412 North 26th Street - Replace siding and windows, repair front porch, and construct a new garage.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Klaus inquired about the addition, commenting that it appeared in the 1925 Sanborns, and inquired if staff was okay with its demolition. Ms. Pitts stated that the addition does have historic value and stated that in the past the Commission has approved some additions where there is an existing single story addition that is being demolished to allow a two story addition.

Mr. Klaus commented that a Richmond Rail would be better than the iron railings.

Mr. Yates agreed that they would prefer the wood columns and railings.

Mr. Klaus recommended that the applicant keep the bell shape roof.

Mr. Cooley commented that the three 2nd story front windows should be retained and the siding salvaged for the front.

Mr. Yates recommended that the applicant clarify the porch enclosures for the final submittal.

Ms. Aarons Sydnor recommended that the rail height on the addition align with the actual height of the rail on the rear and that the height on the second story be the same. Ms. Aarons Sydnor stated that there is a lot of blank space above the windows on the 3rd floor and if it was a porch it would have a thicker cornice board which would really help define it better. She agreed with the staff report and likes that the applicant wants to remove the iron on the front.

Mr. Klaus commented that the applicant should work on the floor plans because there are some discrepancies between what is existing and what they are proposing.

**This application was conceptually reviewed**

- 14 [COA-015024-2017](#) 2310 Venable Street - Construct a new duplex.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Klaus inquired about the double doors and stated that the design flaw is exacerbated by having a column right in front of the second door. Mr. Klaus inquired if the applicant could do the front façade in brick and do the side with another material.

Mr. Yates recommended that they need more height in the front.

Mr. Cooley cautioned the applicant about the gap between the window head and cornice.

Ms. Aarons Sydnor commented that if the applicant removed the siding between the doors and had just a jam between the double doors may work better.

Mr. Yates commented that he would prefer the single door with a recessed vestibule. It was a consensus that the Commission members would prefer to see a single door on the front of the house.

Public Comment

Ms. Nancy Lambert, speaking as member of the public, stated that there are no double doors on the block. Ms. Lambert also added that there are only two structures on the block that are frame construction and stated for consistency it will be better to have a brick façade.

**This application was conceptually reviewed**

- 15 [COA-015026-2017](#) 821 North 24th Street - Construct a new duplex.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Aarons Sydnor commented that this block has a variety of styles on it and added that she thinks the applicant has the unique opportunity to do something different.

Mr. Cooley agreed that the applicant could do an innovative design.

Ms. Aarons Sydnor added that she thinks the applicant could do something really fascinating with the fenestration and the detailing.

Mr. Yates also agreed that applicant can do something different and commented that the false mansard design really bothers him and added that the applicant should think outside of the box on this project.

**This application was conceptually reviewed**

- 16 [COA-015027-2017](#) 966 Pink Street - Construct a new duplex.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Aarons Sydnor commented that the doors should be aligned with the door on the rear.

Mr. Yates commented that a single door will be on the facade.

Public Comment

Ms. Nancy Lambert stated that the height of the building should be reduced to preserve

the pedestrian friendly environment of the district.

**This application was conceptually reviewed**

- 3 [COA-015011-2017](#) 2711 East Clay Street - Repair front steps and porch, demolish a rear addition, and construct a new rear addition.

**Attachments:** [Application and Plans](#)  
[Site Plan](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission denied the installation of the synthetic and T1-11 siding that clads the addition. The Commission approved the new addition, the front porch repair, and the new front gate provided that the following conditions are met: the addition be clad in a compatible material to be reviewed and approved by staff that differentiates the addition from the original section; the new wood elements on the porch be painted white to match the existing porch; the design of any replacement handrail be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the porch columns be reinstalled with the correct side up; and the front gate be painted or opaquely stained a color to be administratively reviewed and approved. The Commission deferred review of the replacement of the windows at the rear of the structure which were replaced without Commission review to allow the applicant the opportunity to submit a detailed application for the window replacement. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye --** 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Gerald Jason Hendricks

## Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 7:28pm