

# 11. COA-091347-2021

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

May 25, 2021

PROPERTY ADDRESS

4002 Hermitage Road

DISTRICT

Hermitage Road

APPLICANT

K and L Sales, LLC

STAFF CONTACT

A. Dandridge

# Commission of Architectural Review

## STAFF REPORT



### PROJECT DESCRIPTION

**Replace slate roof with faux slate; and repair deteriorated architectural elements.**

### PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant is proposing various exterior repairs and a roof replacement on a circa 1925 colonial revival residence located within the Hermitage Road City Old and Historic District.
- The applicant proposes to repair and replace exterior wooden architectural elements in-kind, including trim, window sills and lintels, soffit, fascia board, and siding.
- A deteriorated built-in gutter will be replaced with EPDM roofing material.
- The slate roof will be replaced with a synthetic slate roof.
- Existing metal roofing areas will be replaced in-kind.
- Exterior repairs to the existing carriage house will include the construction of new concrete footing with a brick veneer, and the reframing of the lower two feet of the outer walls. Both alterations will match the original materials in-kind, including brick and siding.
- On a site visit, staff noticed that the slate roof is unaltered on the front façade facing Hermitage Road, but all roofing material has been removed from the rear of the residence.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

## PARTIAL APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

### PREVIOUS REVIEWS

Between August 2005 and August 2006, the Commission reviewed several Certificate of Appropriateness applications for this property for the repair and replacement of the original wooden siding. Ultimately the Commission found that the original wood siding was not damaged beyond repair, and denied its replacement with hardiplank siding. The Commission approved the in-kind repair and painting of the original wood lap siding and patterned wood shingle cladding.

### STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- Staff recommends denial of the installation of synthetic slate on the main roof.
- Staff recommends that all new wooden elements match the original in material and design, including the

patterned wooden shingle cladding on the second story and front gable, and that all replacement elements be painted a color selected from the approved Commission color palette, submitted to staff for review and approval.

- Staff recommends that the built in gutter be repaired and replaced in kind.

### STAFF ANALYSIS

Standards for Rehabilitation #7, pg. 59	<i>Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i>	The applicant proposes to repair and replace exterior wooden architectural elements in kind, including trim, window sills and lintels, soffit, fascia board, and siding. <u>Staff recommends that all new wooden elements match the original in material and design, including the patterned wooden shingle cladding on the second story and front gable, and be painted a color selected from the approved Commission color palette, to be reviewed and approved by staff.</u>
Standards for Rehabilitation #4, pg. 59	<i>Retain original roof shape, size, materials and related elements including cupolas, chimneys and weather vanes; if replacement is necessary, consideration for use of slate, wood and metal, with respect to color and patterns, should be given.</i>	The applicant is not proposing to alter the existing roof form, but is proposing to replace the built-in gutter with EPDM roofing materials. Staff notes that the built-in gutter system is a character-defining architectural detail of the building. <u>Staff recommends that the built-in gutter be repaired and replaced in kind.</u> The applicant is proposing to change the material of the existing roofing units from slate to Davinci Roofscape Synthetic Slate.
Substitute Materials, pg. 60	<i>The use of synthetic materials that will alter the appearance, proportion and/or details of an historic structure is strongly discouraged.</i>	Staff finds that the main roof is highly visible from the street and <u>recommends denial of the installation of synthetic slate on the main roof.</u> Staff finds that the proposed DaVinci Roofscape slate does not effectively replicate the appearance of historic slate. In addition, staff has concerns regarding the durability of the synthetic slate, which can be easily damaged, which in turn would further reduce its resemblance to historic slate. On a site visit, staff noticed that the slate roof is unaltered on the front façade facing heritage road, but all roofing material has been removed from the rear of the residence.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

---

## FIGURES



Figure 1. 4002 Hermitage, front facade, May 2021



Figure 2. 4002 Hermitage, existing conditions, carriage house deterioration



Figure 3. 4002 Hermitage, existing conditions, built-in gutter deterioration



Figure 4. 4002 Hermitage, view from rear alley, roofing material removed from rear.