

5. COA-072899-2020

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

May 26, 2020

PROPERTY ADDRESS

3102 E. Grace Street

DISTRICT

St. John's Church

Commission of Architectural Review STAFF REPORT



APPLICANT

V. Chiariello

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jeffries

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

New construction of a garage in the rear yard.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant proposes to construct a new garage in the rear yard of a 1 1/2 story brick residence in the St. John's Church City Old and Historic District. The existing home is a Colonial Revival Cape Cod house built in 1941.
- The proposed garage is one story in height and is 18 feet wide and 25 feet deep with a hipped roof. Proposed materials include brick to match the home in pattern and color, asphalt roof tiles, and wood windows and doors.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

None.

STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- The garage have a gable roof, to match the existing home.
- A different roofing material, rather than the asphalt shingles proposed, be used and specifications be submitted to staff for administrative approval.
- The garage be clad in a brick that is consistent with but does not match the existing home.
- A contemporary garage door be installed, and specifications be submitted to staff for administrative approval.

STAFF ANALYSIS

New Construction, Residential Outbuildings, #1, pg. 51	<i>Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos and other auxiliary structures, should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection.</i>	The brick exterior is compatible with the existing building. However, staff finds that the proposed roof material is not consistent with the existing home, which has a slate roof. As asphalt shingles are generally not consistent with City Old and Historic Districts, <u>staff recommends a different roofing material, such as standing seam metal, be used and specifications be submitted to staff for administrative approval.</u>
New Construction, Residential Outbuildings, #2, pg. 51	<i>Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i>	The proposed garage is consistent with existing outbuildings in terms of siting, massing, and materials. However, staff finds that the roof profile is not consistent with the existing home or outbuildings in the surrounding area. <u>Staff recommends a gable roof be used, to match the existing home.</u>
New Construction, Residential Outbuildings, #3, pg. 51	<i>New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary structures.</i>	The proposed garage is smaller than the main residence, and is located at the rear of the property.
Standards for Rehabilitation, #10, pg. 59	<i>While it is acceptable to use salvaged materials as in-kind replacement, adding features or salvaged architectural elements that suggest an inaccurate or undocumented sequence of construction should be avoided because this confuses our understanding of the evolution of Richmond's historic built environment.</i>	Staff finds that the proposed brick, though consistent with the main building, would confuse the understanding of the evolution of the property. <u>Staff recommends the garage be clad in a brick that is consistent with but does not match the existing home.</u> Similarly, staff finds that the proposed garage door design appears to replicate a historic carriage house or garage door. As this is new construction, <u>staff recommends a contemporary garage door be installed, and specifications be submitted to staff for administrative approval.</u>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES



Figure 1. 3102 East Grace Street, façade



Figure 2. Existing outbuilding at 3102 East Grace Street



Figure 3. Outbuilding on subject block



Figure 4. Outbuilding on subject block