11. COA-063697-2019

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

November 26, 2019 PROPERTY ADDRESS

Commission of Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



3516 East Broad Street

DISTRICT APPLICANT STAFF CONTACT

Chimborazo Park M. Wind C. Jeffries

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Enclose an existing rear porch.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant proposes to enclose the first story of a rear porch on a 2 ½-story brick Colonial Revival home located on the corner of East Broad Street and North 36th Street.
- The applicant is proposing to install glazing and panels between the existing columns. A new landing at the new entrance will be constructed, and the existing stairs relocated to accommodate the landing.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

The applicant applied in October 2019 to widen a rear opening by removing the brick between two existing rear doors, while maintaining the exterior jambs, lintels, and sills. The Commission denied the application.

STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- The solid panels on the side elevations be removed from the design.
- · The entablature remain the existing color
- The design be modified in a manner to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff to reflect the existing railing or the previous paneled railing.
- The new glass panels have clear glass.
- Final specifications for the proposed lighting be submitted to staff for administrative approval.
- The landing and steps be painted or opaquely stained, the color to be administratively approved, and the railings be wood Richmond rail.

Staff recommends **against** the removal of the historic material on the rear wall of the home <u>including exterior</u> masonry walls and doors.

STAFF ANALYSIS		
Porches, Entrances and Doors, pg. 71 #13	Porch enclosures to aid in energy conservation are only appropriate on secondary elevations. Solid materials are not recommended for use in enclosure projects since they can radically alter the historic appearance of a porch. Glass enclosures which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred.	The applicant is proposing to install large fixed windows between the existing porch posts. Staff finds that the large glass panels reflect the open appearance of the porch. However, the solid panels on the side elevations are not consistent with the Guidelines and staff recommends the solid panels on the side elevations be removed from the design.
		Staff notes that a note on the plans indicates that the entablature above the new windows will be painted dark bronze. As this element is part of the existing porch and is currently painted to match the porch, staff recommends the entablature remain the existing color.
New Construction, Porches and Porch Details, pg. 49 #1	Porch railings and balustrades are important character-defining features of historic buildings.	The Guidelines recommend porch enclosures retain decorative porch elements. Staff finds that the proposed floor-to-ceiling glazing does not reflect the existing porch railing, which is a character-defining feature of the historic porch. According to photographic evidence the current railing was installed sometime 2015 and 2018. Staff was unable to locate an approval for the railing replacement. The previous railing design was bead board paneling. Staff recommends the design be modified in a manner to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff to reflect the existing railing or the previous paneled railing.
Windows, pg. 69 #10	New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings.	The plans appear to show tinted glass panels. As glass that is tinted or has a reflective coating is not appropriate in historic districts, staff recommends the new glass panels have clear glass.
Administrative approval guidelines for light fixtures	Items delegated for staff review: 1. The installation of conduit, motion detection fixtures, security lights, sconces, free-standing lights minimally visible from the public right-of-way.	The plans indicate that two modern wall sconces will be installed beside the new rear door. Staff finds that a modern minimal design reflects the modern design of the porch enclosure. Staff recommends final specifications for the proposed lighting be submitted to staff for administrative approval.
New Construction, Decks pg. 51 #s2-3	 Decks should complement the architectural features of the main structure without creating a false historical appearance. Decks should be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure. Deck design may include vertical picket balustrades or contemporary 	The proposed landing and relocated steps are consistent with the Commission's Guidelines for decks. Staff recommends the landing and steps be painted or opaquely stained, the color to be administratively approved, and the railings be wood Richmond rail.

	railing that is in scale with the house and the deck.	
Windows, #5, pg. 69	Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged.	The plans show a cased opening at the rear of the building, a modification which was denied by the Commission in October 2019. Staff finds that the rear of the building may still be visible from North 36 th Street and recommends against the removal of the historic material including exterior masonry walls and doors.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the conditions above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES







Figure 2. Rear porch, July 2011