8. COA-053434-2019 Commission of PUBLIC HEARING DATE Architectural Review May 28, 2019 STAFF REPORT



3209 Monument Avenue

DISTRICT

Monument Avenue

PROPERTY ADDRESS

APPLICANT E. & C. Boland

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jeffries

PROJECT DESCRIPTION Renovate an existing front porch.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant requests approval to replace the existing tile on a front patio with bluestone and add a brick veneer to the existing concrete front steps.
- The building is a 2-story brick Colonial Revival residence built ca. 1920.
- The patio is currently paved with red tile.



STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS

| PREVIOUS REVIEWS |
|------------------------------|
| None. |
| STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS |

- The front patio be repaired and the materials be replaced in-kind with concrete, brick and tile as required. Intact materials should be retained where possible.
- If it is determined that complete replacement is needed, staff recommends the applicant work with staff to ensure the replacement matches the existing patio.

| STAFF ANALYSIS | | | | | |
|------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| Sidewalks & Curbs #7, pg. 76 | Sidewalks and curbs should be built of common building materials found throughout the District. Generally, simple | The 3200 block of Monument Avenue contains many examples of paved walkways and front patios. Many homes have been altered with the | | | |

| | paving designs are more compatible with the diverse building styles and better unify the various elements found on streets throughout Old and Historic Districts. | addition of new materials, however there are several examples of brick, concrete and red tile. The existing materials are common for the district as well as the period of construction, and there are several surrounding examples of the same materials. Though it appears that the tile has been repaired in the past, the existing materials are likely historic. |
|---|---|--|
| Porches, Entrances & Doors #11, pg. 71 | A primary entrance should not be altered to give an appearance that was not originally intended. | The proposed bluestone and brick are not consistent with the historic materials and would alter the appearance of the front patio in a way that was not originally intended. Though the tile and concrete are simple materials, they were common during the period of construction. Quarry tile and concrete were popular materials in the early 20 th century. <u>Staff recommends</u> <u>denial of the proposed change in materials as it</u> would give an appearance that was not originally intended. |
| Standards for Rehabilitation #6-7pg. 59 | 6. Retain original entrances and porches including doors, frames, fanlights, sidelights, steps, balustrades, pilasters, entablatures, columns, and decorative features. 7. Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. | The applicant indicates that the front patio is in disrepair and has experienced settling, as seen by the separation from the home and the front steps. The owner has indicated that rebuilding the entire patio is not necessary but limited repair and replacement will be required. <u>Staff</u> recommends the front patio be repaired and the materials be replaced in-kind with concrete, brick and tile as required. Intact materials should be retained where possible. If it is determined that complete replacement is needed, staff recommends the applicant work with staff to ensure the replacement matches the existing patio. |

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES



Figure 1. 3202 Monument Ave, front walkway.

Figure 2. 1925 Sanborn Map



Figure 3. Front steps



Figure 4. Existing tile on patio