COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT January 23, 2018 Meeting

4. COA-028036-2017 (D. Kleyman)

808 North 21st Street Union Hill Old and Historic District

Project Description:

Amend previously approved plans to change materials on new construction.

Staff Contact:

M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to amend previously approved plans for an Italianate inspired, multifamily, brick building in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. The approved structure will be located on a currently vacant lot on the west side of North 21st Street. The applicant is proposing to replace the proposed brick with fiber cement lap siding on the rear and side elevations. The applicant proposes to retain the brick on the facade and turn the corner with 2' of brick on the side elevations.

During the conceptual reviews of the project, the Commission encouraged the applicant to propose a brick structure as the subject block is characterized by brick structures. In these earlier reviews, the structure took a different form than that which was approved; and the Commission noted that it may be appropriate to clad only the façade or the front 2-story element in brick if it was not feasible to clad the entire structure. For final review, the applicant opted to propose an Italianate inspired, entirely brick structure which was approved by the Commission on March 28, 2017.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with the original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood (pg. 53, Materials and Color #2). Though lapped siding is a material that is found in the district, the subject block is characterized by brick buildings. Staff recommends that the structure should read as a brick structure when viewed from North 21st Street which will require the façade and side elevations to be clad in brick as both side elevations will be visible from North 21st Street. <u>Staff recommends approval of the change in materials on the rear elevation and denial of the change in materials on the side elevations.</u> Though the Commission had previously discussed cladding only the front of the structure in brick when the design was different than proposed, staff does not find this is appropriate for the traditionally designed structure as it is not characteristic of Italianate homes in the District to be constructed of a mix of materials.

It is the assessment of staff is partially consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the

Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.