COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT November 28, 2017 Meeting

5. COA-025849-2017 (L. Salzman)

1111 W. Franklin Street
West Franklin Street Old and Historic District

Project Description:

Amend previously approved plans to change exterior cladding material in the rear.

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to modify plans for alterations to the Temple Beth Ahabah campus in the West Franklin Street Old and Historic District. The Beth Ahabah campus consists of 5 buildings – 1109-1125 West Franklin Street – all of which are located in the West Franklin Street Old and Historic District.

On September 27, 2016, the Commission approved with conditions the expansion of the Education Building (1121 W. Franklin St.) to include a new façade and connections to the Temple (1117 W. Franklin St.) and the Joel House (1125 W. Franklin St.). The exterior of both connectors was approved to be all glazing. The intent of the use of glazing was to minimize the visual impact of the connectors and to not detract from the historic structures. While the connector to the Temple will be transparent as there were no internal walls proposed, the connector to the Joel House was approved with interior solid walls.

With this application, the applicant is proposing to change the cladding at the rear of the connector to the Joel House. The approved glazing will be replaced with EIFS, which is a synthetic stucco, and windows. The application notes a 6 $\frac{1}{2}$ privacy fence will be installed at the rear of the property, though no application has been submitted for approval of a fence at the rear.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. With the construction of a fence at the rear of the property, the proposed changes to the connector will be minimally visible from the public right of way. Staff recommends details of the proposed fence be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. Additionally, the changes will not impact the design or transparency of the connector as viewed from West Franklin Street. The Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines state that "materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood" (pg. 53, Materials & Color #2). As stucco is a material found in the district, staff supports the use of the synthetic stucco with the condition that the proposed color be submitted for administrative review and approval. Staff recommends details of the proposed window and door materials be submitted for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.