COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT January 24, 2017 Meeting

17. CAR No. 17-014 (C. Morrison) 318 North 36th Street

Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District

Project Description: Replace the siding on the secondary elevation with fiber cement siding and

replace windows on the rear elevation.

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate a Late Victorian dwelling in the Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District by replacing the existing wooden siding on the side elevations with fiber cement siding and the replacement of two windows at the rear of the structure. Though the applicant has installed the windows and siding without Commission approval, this application is not a result of enforcement activity. The applicant contacted staff when they received the letter from the City to new property owners noting that the property was in an Old and Historic District, but unfortunately, the work was in progress. The applicant has installed textured, unbeaded fiber cement siding in a reveal consistent with historic siding and color to match the existing siding. The existing siding was deteriorated and portions had been replaced over time. The applicant states that the 2nd floor windows at the rear of the structure were deteriorated and therefore replaced with vinyl windows in the same lite configuration as the deteriorated wood windows.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that fiber cement siding is a product with limited applications which includes being used on secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right of way (pg. 56). The applicant has installed the fiber cement siding on the secondary elevations which are limitedly visually from the public right of way. Though the siding is textured, the texture is not visible from the public right of way due to the limited visibility of the side elevations. Staff recommends approval of the fiber cement siding on the secondary elevations.

The *Guidelines* note that the architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows (pg. 65 #10) which the applicant attempts to achieve by matching the size and lite configuration of the older windows. Though this attempt has been made, staff cannot recommend approval of the vinyl windows as the *Guidelines* note that "vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts." Staff recommends the applicant install true or simulated divided lite, wood or aluminum clad wood windows to match the appearance of the historic windows.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation in Section 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.