COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT September 27, 2016 Meeting

11. CAR No. 16-136 (D. & K. Pace)

2915 East Marshall Street St. John's Church Old and Historic District

Project Description:

Reconstruct garage.

M. Pitts

Staff Contact:

The applicant requests approval to reconstruct a garage at the rear of a home in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District Old and Historic District. The original garage on the property was attached to the adjacent two bay garage and was severely damaged by a winter storm in 2015. The previous garage was demolished due to the extensive damage. The previous garage was similar in design to the adjacent brick garages thought the vehicular entrance had been enclosed with concrete blocks. The applicant propose to reconstruct the garage to match the demolished garage and the adjacent garages. The applicant proposes to use the bricks from the demolished garage to clad the proposed garage. The proposed garage will match the adjacent garages in design and materials.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines note that reconstruction is the duplication of original materials, form and appearance of a vanished building at a particular moment in time and are based on solid historical evidence and documentation (pg. 43). The Sanborn Map from 1925 indicates that the demolished garage was a part of a multi-bay garage structure on both 2915 and 2913 E. Marshall Street as noted by the applicant. The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the garage to its form prior to its demolition. Though no photographs have been submitted of the garage prior to demolition, the structure was most likely similar if not identical in design to the garages of which it was attached. Additionally, the Guidelines note that garages should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection; respect the design of outbuildings in the neighborhood; and should be located in the rear (pg. 48, Residential Outbuildings #1-3). The proposed garage will be of brick construction like the primary structure, will be identical to the adjacent garages, and is located at the rear of the property. Staff recommends approval of the garage with the condition that if the applicant does not install a garage door which will match the neighboring garage doors, details of the garage door be submitted to staff for review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted conditions, is consistent with the Standard for New Construction in Section 30-930.7 (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook*

and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.