

COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

MINUTES

November 24, 2015

The meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review was held on Tuesday, November 24, 2015 at 3:30 p.m. in the Fifth Floor Conference Room in City Hall.

Members present: Mr. Bryan Green, Chair
 Mr. Joseph Yates, Vice-Chair
 Ms. Rebecca Aarons-Sydnor
 Mr. Jason Hendricks
 Mr. Nathan Hughes
 Mr. Mathew Elmes (arrived at 3:34)
 Mr. Andrew McRoberts
 Mr. James Klaus
 Mr. Sanford Bond

Members absent: None

Staff Present: Ms. Marianne Pitts, CAR Secretary
 Ms. Tara Ross, Recording Secretary
 Ms. Kimberly Chen, PDR

Others present: See attached sign-in sheet

Mr. Green called the meeting to order at 3:31 p.m.

Approval of the Minutes:

The October minutes will be approved at the December meeting.

Secretary Report

Ms. Pitts stated that Mr. James Hill is longer with the City of Richmond and stated that he is now working at Sadler & Whitehead Architects. Ms. Pitts discussed the December CAR meeting and noted that it will be earlier on December 15th and there is a large agenda.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts distributed an Administrative Approval report. Staff issued 68 approvals for the period from October 27, 2015 through November 12, 2015.

Address	CoA Received	BP Received	BP No.	Date Approved	Approval No.	Summary of Work	Condition of Approval	Issued By
1838 W GRACE ST		10/28/2015	B15102810	10/29/2015	A15-496	Light interior renovation and repair, new kitchen. Interior work only, no change of use, no add sq	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized by this permit	MP
2013 W GRACE ST		10/28/2015	E15102810	10/29/2015	A15-497	Upgrade service, relocate service disconnect	Exterior work will be in the same location as existing	MP
119 E LEIGH ST		10/23/2015	H15090901	10/29/2015	A15-498	Certificate of Occupancy application	No exterior changes authorized by this permit	MP
521 N 1ST ST		10/27/2015	M15102408	10/28/2015	A15-499	Replace natural gas furnace. Like for like	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized by this permit	MP
320 N 32ND ST		10/23/2015	B15102209	10/28/2015	A15-500	Construction of new mixed use commercial and residential structure	Approved at the CAR meeting on 1/28/15. Windows are to have simulated-divided lites. The mechanical units are to be on the roof, out of the public view	MP
507 N 26TH ST	10/30/2015			10/30/2015	A15-501	Repairs to the siding and porch balusters. Painting the structure the following colors: Siding - light blue/gray color similar to Colonial Revival Gray. Trim - porch columns and fascia, handrails, and cornice Needlepoint Navy. Window sashes and porch pickets - White		MP
211 W BROAD ST		11/2/2015	E15102909	11/3/2015	A15-502	Relocate four light fixtures, add four switches and five receptacles	Approved for interior work	MP
2205 E BROAD ST		10/30/2015	B15102912	11/3/2015	A15-503	Install roof-mounted 3900 watt solar PV electric system - 15 panels with microinverters	Roof mounted equipment will not be visible from the public right-of-way	MP
2205 E BROAD ST		10/30/2015	E15102916	11/3/2015	A15-504	Wiring for 3900 watt solar PV electric system - 15 panels with microinverters	Roof mounted equipment will not be visible from the public right-of-way	MP
2712 E FRANKLIN ST		10/30/2015	E15103004	11/3/2015	A15-505	Rewire kitchen and bathrooms and relocate service panels from outside to inside of each unit	Approved for all interior work and exterior work limited to the relocation of service panels to the inside of each unit	MP
418 N 25TH ST		11/4/2015	N15110306	11/5/2015	A15-506	Install gas pipe for cooking equipment	Interior work only	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 2 of 7

Partial List of Administrative Approvals (Building Permits and Certificate Applications) Issued by Commission Staff

Address	CoA Received	BP Received	BP No.	Date Approved	Approval No.	Summary of Work	Condition of Approval	Issued By
823 MOSBY ST		9/30/2015	B15092808	10/27/2015	A15-484	Add deck per drawings, restore kitchen cabinets and repair insulation and drywall, new flooring	Approved by CAR on 9/22/2015 provided the deck, stairs and railings are painted or opaque stained. Applicant should coordinate color selection with CAR staff	JCH
312 N MONROE ST		10/13/2015	N15100604	10/23/2015	A15-485	Run gas line to space heater	Approved for interior work	JCH
1142 W GRACE ST		10/14/2015	K15101401	10/23/2015	A15-486	Install automatic NFPA-13R sprinkler system	Approved for interior work	JCH
418 N 25TH ST		10/13/2015	P15101204	10/23/2015	A15-487	Install new waste, water, vent, and fixtures for tenant uplift, first floor restaurant	Approved for interior work	JCH
418 N 25TH ST		10/14/2015	J15101402	10/23/2015	A15-488	Install 18" stainless captiveaire U.L. hood	dust to exit through rear of building and terminate on roof	JCH
602 1 N 21ST ST		10/29/2015	M15102807	10/29/2015	A15-489	Install new HVAC and ductwork. Metal trunk liner and flex line	Roof top equipment should not be visible from the public right of way. Equipment on the ground should be located in the rear yard and screened from public view	MP
602 1 N 21ST ST		10/22/2015	E15102201	10/22/2015	A15-490	Rewire whole house and upgrade service	Meter to be located in same location where previously located	MP
602 1 N 21ST ST		10/22/2015	P15102203	10/22/2015	A15-491	Replumb whole house	Approved for interior work only. No exterior changes authorized as part of this work	MP
418 N 25TH ST		10/29/2015	E15102809	10/29/2015	A15-492	Wire restaurant to drawing	Approved for interior work	MP
1838 W GRACE ST		10/29/2015	M15102806	10/29/2015	A15-493	Relocate ductwork as needed to accommodate new work	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized by this permit	MP
1838 W GRACE ST		10/29/2015	E15102805	10/29/2015	A15-494	Relocation and addition of outlets and fixtures to accommodate new work to code, electrical work for interior remodel	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized by this permit	MP
1838 W GRACE ST		10/29/2015	P15102801	10/29/2015	A15-495	Renovate kitchen (new cabinets and appliances), turn old bath into two baths, add two w/d closets	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized by this permit	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 1 of 7

CAR Meeting Minutes
November 24, 2015
Page 3 of 23

<i>Address</i>	<i>CoA Received</i>	<i>BP Received</i>	<i>BP No.</i>	<i>Date Approved</i>	<i>Approval No.</i>	<i>Summary of Work</i>	<i>Condition of Approval</i>	<i>Issued By</i>
1309 E MAIN ST		11/3/2015	E15110207	11/5/2015	A15-507	Remodel commercial space, add kitchenette per drawings	Interior work only	MP
2912 E LEIGH ST		11/4/2015	N15110304	11/5/2015	A15-508	Install gas logs line was already there	Interior work only	MP
601 N 23RD ST	10/30/2015			10/30/2015	A15-509	The smooth HardiePlank siding which the Commission approved for installation will be Cobble Stone with white trim		MP
2320 E MAIN ST		10/23/2015	E15102102	10/26/2015	A15-510	Disconnect 23 frozen food glass doors and reconnect 23 frozen glass doors using existing electrical	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized as part of this permit	MP
1142 W GRACE ST		10/20/2015	P15092804	10/26/2015	A15-511	Plan amendment, responses to comments	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized as part of this permit	MP
514 N 25TH ST		11/2/2015	N150103003	11/3/2015	A15-512	Install gas to code	Approved for interior work	MP
2817 E BROAD ST		11/2/2015	E15103014	11/3/2015	A15-513	Rewire building. Rough and trim electrical work. All work interior	Interior work only. No exterior work authorized by this permit	MP
2517 E GRACE ST	10/31/2015			11/2/2015	A15-514	Replacement of a chain link fence with a 6 foot tall wooden privacy fence with a gate around the rear yard of the property		MP
3508 E BROAD ST	11/2/2015			11/2/2015	A15-515	For the rehabilitation of the existing carriage house which was approved by the CAR on March 24, 2015, the proposed multi-lite French doors and adjacent windows, which face the main structure on the property, shall be single lite doors and windows		MP
2519 W GRACE ST		11/2/2015	B15110205	11/2/2015	A15-516	Replace kitchen floor, add kitchen cabinets, and coffer ceiling, for out wells in kitchen	Approved for interior work only. Any work involving alterations to the exterior, including windows, must be reviewed and approved by the Commission of Architectural Review	JCH
615 N 25TH ST		10/27/2015	M15102706	10/30/2015	A15-517	Install 1.5 mini split heat pump	Heat pump to be screened from public view by existing privacy fence	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 3 of 7

<i>Address</i>	<i>CoA Received</i>	<i>BP Received</i>	<i>BP No.</i>	<i>Date Approved</i>	<i>Approval No.</i>	<i>Summary of Work</i>	<i>Condition of Approval</i>	<i>Issued By</i>
111 VIRGINIA ST		10/29/2015	B15102901	10/30/2015	A15-518	To extend the expiration date of current permit and to establish occupant load	Temporary structure to be removed 1/11/16	MP
111 VIRGINIA ST		10/29/2015	B15102901	10/30/2015	A15-519	Erect 20x80 tent with sidewalls, exit signs, fire extinguishers	Temporary structure to be removed 11/2/15	MP
2501 PARK AV		11/20/2015	M15112004	11/23/2015	A15-520	Replace one ten-ton split A/C. Install new hydronic hot boiler to replace oil fired steam	HVAC unit to be screened by existing walls and fences. Gas meter and vents to be located on alley elevation	MP
2501 PARK AV		11/20/2015	P15112003	11/23/2015	A15-521	Provide and install two floor drains and two floor clean outs to drain condensate from boiler and air conditioners	Approved for interior work	MP
608 N 27TH ST		11/16/2015	M15111431	11/20/2015	A15-522	Installing one heat, one gas/AC and ductwork	New heat pump and HVAC equipment to be located at the rear of the property and screened either by a small, wooden picket fence or a privacy fence along the rear of the property	MP
1309 E MAIN ST		11/16/2015	E15111403	11/20/2015	A15-523	Wire for 120V circuit for data node equipment	Review determined the equipment will not be visible from the public right-of-way	MP
2910 E BROAD ST		11/12/2015	N15110907	11/20/2015	A15-524	Run gas line to fireplace heaters	Approved for gas line installation. No exterior alterations to the structure authorized by this permit	MP
1921 PRINCESS ANN AV		11/13/2015	E15111306	11/20/2015	A15-525	Provide power from existing panel to power new fountain controls. Install 4 low voltage lights in fountain	Plans are consistent with CAR approval of 12/9/14	MP
613 N 22ND ST		11/13/2015	B15111305	11/17/2015	A15-526	Renovation of single-family house	Plans are consistent with CAR approval on 8/25/15	MP
1838 W GRACE ST	11/10/2015			11/17/2015	A15-527	Painting of the structure the following colors: Previously-painted brick: Colonial Revival Gray, Front door: Caviar, Wood trim: white		MP
313 N 24TH ST		11/10/2015	B15110609	11/18/2015	A15-528	Demo new openings, pull up existing slab and demo non-bearing partitions and remove roof	Approved per CAR approval on 8/25/15	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 4 of 7

Address	Co A Received	BP Received	BP No.	Date Approved	Approval No.	Summary of Work	Condition of Approval	Issued By
111 VIRGINIA ST		11/6/2015	E15111803	11/16/2015	A15-529	Low voltage telephone and computer plenum wire. No fire or smoke rated assemblies to penetrate	Approved for interior work. No exterior work, including alterations to windows, authorized by this permit	MP
7 N JEFFERSON ST		11/10/2015	B15111013	11/16/2015	A15-530	Alterations and renovation of guest rooms at hotel per attached architect's plans. Phase III, 51 rooms on floors 1-6	Interior work only. No exterior work, including alterations to windows, is authorized by this permit.	MP
418 N 25TH ST		11/9/2015	L151110502	11/17/2015	A15-531	To provide and install one symmetry vertical platform lift for accessibility	Approved for interior work	MP
2225 MONUMENT AV		11/5/2015	M15110434	11/17/2015	A15-532	Replacing gas furnaces with heat pumps and a furnace with a gas furnace	Exterior heat pumps should be screened from public view	MP
2225 MONUMENT AV		11/10/2015	M15110901	11/17/2015	A15-533	Reline flue for hot water heater	Approved for interior work	MP
615 N 25TH ST		11/10/2015	E15110916	11/16/2015	A15-534	Wire receptacles/lighting in art studio/loft and detached garage. Install exterior sub panel on outside of studio/loft	Panel and AC unit to be screened by existing privacy fence	MP
317 N 23RD ST		11/12/2015	M15111206	11/16/2015	A15-535	Install stainless steel liner in existing chimney	Approved for the installation of liner	MP
601 1 N 23RD ST		10/20/2015	M15101902	11/16/2015	A15-536	Install new duct work, new indoor unit, new outdoor unit	Heat pumps to be located on the roof at the center near the rear of the structure as indicated in rooftop plans submitted 11/13/15. Heat pumps to be screened with hardiplank on three sides	MP
601 N 23RD ST		10/20/2015	M15101901	11/16/2015	A15-537	Install new duct work, new indoor unit, new outdoor unit	Heat pumps to be located on the roof at the center near the rear of the structure as indicated in rooftop plans submitted 11/13/15. Heat pumps to be screened with hardiplank on three sides	MP
2815 E BROAD ST		11/13/2015	M15110503	11/13/2015	A15-538	Install one 3-ton H.P. with all necessary ductwork	Heat pump located in the rear to be screened by existing privacy fence	MP
2817 E BROAD ST		11/6/2015	M15110504	11/12/2015	A15-539	Install one 3-ton H.P. with all necessary ductwork	Heat pump located in the rear to be screened by existing privacy fence	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 5 of 7

Address	Co A Received	BP Received	BP No.	Date Approved	Approval No.	Summary of Work	Condition of Approval	Issued By
1134 W GRACE ST		11/10/2015	P15111010	11/12/2015	A15-540	Trench 100' water service from water meter to basement	Approved for trench for water service from water meter to basement. No additional alterations to the exterior of the property permitted	MP
2625 MONUMENT AV		11/6/2015	M15110402	11/12/2015	A15-541	Replace existing gas boiler with same	Approved for interior work	MP
2604 E FRANKLIN ST		11/6/2015	N15110601	11/12/2015	A15-542	Install natural gas piping to a stove and two gas furnaces	Approved for interior work only. No work resulting in alterations to the exterior, including windows, may be performed under this permit	MP
2604 E FRANKLIN ST		11/6/2015	P15110601	11/12/2015	A15-543	Install waste, water and vent piping for new plumbing system	Approved for interior work only. No work resulting in alterations to the exterior, including windows, may be performed under this permit	MP
603 N 21ST ST		11/12/2015	P15111207	11/12/2015	A15-544	Install water and sewer line to code	Changes to the exterior of existing structure that are visible from the public right-of-way are not authorized as part of this permit	MP
2102 M ST		11/12/2015	P15111206	11/12/2015	A15-545	Install water and sewer line to code	Changes to the exterior of existing structure that are visible from the public right-of-way are not authorized as part of this permit	MP
2519 W GRACE ST		11/12/2015	M15111205	11/12/2015	A15-546	Adding two zone HVAC	HVAC unit to be located in rear of the property and screened by an existing privacy fence	MP
2519 W GRACE ST		11/5/2015	B15103001	11/12/2015	A15-547	Light remodel. Repair roof parapet (brick), interior drywall, and painting. Kitchen improvements	All exterior repairs shall be in-kind to match the existing. Any changes to the exterior in design or materials shall be submitted to the CAR for review	MP
2519 W GRACE ST		11/4/2015	P15110406	11/12/2015	A15-548	Add new bath, relocated hall bath, bath tub, relocate kitchen sink, add DW	Approved for interior work only. Any work involving alterations to the exterior, including windows, must be reviewed and approved by the Commission of Architectural Review	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 6 of 7

Address	CoA Received	BP Received	BP No.	Date Approved	Approval No.	Summary of Work	Condition of Approval	Issued By
2519 W GRACE ST		11/4/2015	E15110408	11/12/2015	A15-549	Wire house	Approved for interior work and exterior work that is limited to a single receptacles at both the front and rear and wiring for 3 security lights. HVAC equipment wiring approved as it is not visible from the public right-of-way. Submit lighting for CAR	MP
211 N 36TH ST		11/3/2015	B15110203	11/12/2015	A15-550	Demo work. Remove plaster and finishes, no structural work	Interior work only	MP
1921 PRINCESS ANN AV		11/3/2015	P15110302	11/12/2015	A15-551	Provide drain and water for new fountain. Fountain parts and accessories supplied by others	Plans are consistent with CAR approval of 12/9/14	MP
2 W MAIN ST		10/27/2015	E15102613	11/12/2015	A15-552	Install additional parking lot lighting, rework existing parking lot lighting, relocate service for parking lot lighting	Approved for shoebox light fixtures as submitted	MP

Tuesday, November 24, 2015

Page 7 of 7

Enforcement Report

Mr. Green inquired if they had any reports on the Allen Avenue apartments. Ms. Pitts explained to the Commission that this was the case in which the applicant painted the brick, and the Commission's decision to deny the painting was appealed to City Council. Ms. Pitts stated that since the time of introduction of the appeal Mr. Green, Mr. Yates, and staff have been working with the applicant to find a resolution with which both the Commission and the homeowners would be happy. Ms. Pitts stated that the applicants found a treatment that they could apply to the bricks which will remove some of the paint from the bricks to create the effect that was previously on the bricks. Ms. Pitts stated that Mr. Yates and Mr. Green have reviewed the proposed treatment and feel that it is an appropriate treatment. Based on this development, the applicant withdrew their appeal from City Council. Ms. Pitts stated that the treatment would not be applied until the spring because it needs to be applied in warmer weather. Mr. Green stated that it is pretty close and stated that it seems like an amicable solution that they all wanted to see. Ms. Pitts stated that they are working closely with the Building Department on several other enforcements items in Union Hill where they issued Stop Work Orders.

Mr. Green stated that they have a Memorial Resolution for Mr. Drew Carneal who passed away in late September and stated that he was a great friend of Historical Preservation, a former City Attorney and was on the CAR Commission for many years. Mr. Green read the resolution into the minutes as follows:

WHEREAS, It is with a profound sense of loss that we, the members of the Commission of Architectural Review, mark the passing of Drew St. John Carneal on September 25, 2015. The Commission honors his contributions to the preservation of the City's historic and natural resources and mourn the loss of our colleague.

WHEREAS, Drew S. Carneal served as City Attorney for the City of Richmond from

1985 until 1988; and

WHEREAS, he served on the Commission of Architectural Review from 1995 until 2000; and

WHEREAS, his book *Richmond's Fan District* (1996) is indispensable to an understanding of historic Richmond. No one can purport to understand Richmond's buildings, streets, alleys, and parks without carefully reading this book; and

WHEREAS, he enthusiastically served the City of Richmond through many boards, associations, committees, and foundations, always giving generously of his time and talents; and

WHEREAS, he served as member of the Board of the Maymont Foundation, including serving on its Executive Committee; and

WHEREAS, he served as president of the Fan District Association; and

WHEREAS, he served as on the Board of Directors of the Monument Avenue Preservation Society; and

WHEREAS, he served on the Board of Directors of the Historic Richmond Foundation; and

WHEREAS, he served on the Board of Directors of the Valentine Richmond History Center; and

WHEREAS, he served on the Board of Directors of the Massey Cancer Center; and

WHEREAS, his breadth of architectural and historical knowledge was a great gift to the City of Richmond; and

NOW THEREFORE the undersigned members of the Commission of Architectural Review hereby express our sense of loss at the passing of Drew S. Carneal, while expressing our thanks for his many contributions to the City of Richmond.

Mr. Green distributed some material samples which is a fly ash material that is similar to the cementitious boards that they approve on secondary elevations for renovation projects and primary elevations for new projects. Mr. Green stated that one of the nice things about this material is that it has some really great profiles and it is in stock and from local distributors.

Mr. Green showed a presentation that was put together by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor, Ms. Pitts, Ms. Chen and Mr. Green which was presented to the Land Use Committee of Council regarding the Commission's annual report. Mr. Green discussed the logistics of the annual report in detail. Mr. Green also discussed the amount of projects that staff has with only a limited amount of staff and discussed ways to streamline the process. Mr. Green stated that the Commission should have a meeting to discuss ways to help staff with the projects.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if there was any feedback from members of City Council regarding the annual report, and Mr. Green stated no.

Ms. Ann Wortham inquired if this information would be available to the citizens, and Mr. Green stated that they could share the information with the neighborhood civic associations and groups.

Ms. Pitts stated that they could post it on Legistar site so that the public would have a chance to view it.

Mr. Bond stated that since he has been on the Commission, over 50 percent of the application have staff's full approval and inquired if they could consider moving anything that has staff's total approval with no conditions to the consent agenda. Mr. Bond stated that after they review it if they want to pull something off of the Consent Agenda because it needs some discussion then they could do that. Mr. Bond stated that this revision to procedures might help speed things up a little bit.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor asked if this was a request to make this a practice going forward, and Mr. Bond stated that they could start with this meeting.

Mr. Klaus inquired what the process is for finalizing the agenda, and Mr. Green stated that the Commission does not usually take action on moving items on the agenda until the meeting.

Mr. Elmes stated that in the past whoever was secretary took the temperature of the application and what has previously been approved and what was approvable not necessarily administratively. Mr. Elmes stated that the only thing he worries about when putting everything that staff approve on the consent agenda is that the Commission does not always agree with staff.

Mr. Bond stated that in the past if one person wanted to discuss something on the agenda it was automatically pulled.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that based on Mr. Bond line of thinking could they end up spending more time dealing with what's on the docket for the consent agenda versus putting things on, and Mr. Bond stated that he doubt it.

Mr. Elmes stated that an aggressive attempt to put things on the consent agenda has been helpful.

The Commission members discussed this issue briefly.

Mr. Green stated that the Chair, Co-Chair and Secretary could run through the agenda next month and see if there is anything they could push up to the consent agenda.

Ms. Pitts stated that the rules of procedure do outline what she can put on the consent agenda and stated that it notes that any item that requires direct public notice cannot be put on the consent agenda.

Mr. Green stated that they could defer new construction projects on applications that are not complete and stated that they could discuss that.

*Ms. Aaronson-Sydnor recused from the consent agenda

Consent Agenda

Mr. Bond made a motion to move item #5 for 1600 Monument Avenue from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. The motion was seconded by Mr. Yates and passed 8-0-0.

Mr. Bond made a motion to move item #6 for 2604 E. Franklin Street from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hughes. Mr. Elmes stated that he has a great deal of concern on what the repair sash replacement are going to be and stated that he thinks further discussion is needed. After further discussion the motion failed 3-5-0(Elmes, Kraus, McRoberts, Hendricks and Green opposed).

Mr. Bond made a motion to move item # 7 for 2606 E. Franklin Street from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. There was no second and the motion failed.

Mr. Bond made a motion to move item # 9 for 2028 Monument Avenue from the consent agenda to the regular agenda. There was no second and the motion failed.

Mr. Bond made a motion to move item #10 for 812 N. 2nd Street from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. There was no second and the motion failed.

Mr. Bond made a motion to move item #11 for 814 N. 23rd Street from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. There was no second and the motion failed.

Mr. McRoberts made a motion to approve the consent agenda. The motion was seconded by Mr. Bond.

Mr. Elmes inquired if the applicant had a sample of the evolve synthetic decking material, and Mr. Robert Lytle showed the Commission a sample of the evolve material which is 90 percent recycled material and stated that it is similar to AZEK which the Commission has previously approved.

After further discussion the motion passed 8-0-0(Aaronson-Sydnor recused from the consent agenda).

VOTE:	Affirmative:	Elmes, Hendricks, Klaus, McRoberts, Yates, Hughes, Green and Bond
	Negative:	None
	Abstain:	None

Application No. 15-137 (S. Kiatsuranon)

1600 Monument Avenue

There being no Commission discussion, this item was approved as submitted. The staff report reflects the Commission's reasons for consent agenda approval. Mr. Mc. Roberts introduced a motion to approve Application No. 15-137 for the reasons stated in the staff report as being consistent with the guidelines in the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*. Mr. Bond seconded the motion, and it passed 8-0-0.

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to install two signs, and
 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted,
 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission
 approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of
 Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE: Affirmative: Elmes, Hendricks, Klaus, McRoberts, Bond, Green,
 Yates and Hughes
 Negative: None
 Abstain: None

REGULAR AGENDA

Application No. 15-133 (C. Dosier)

725 N. 24th Street

Ms. Pitts presented the staff report and summarized the applicant's request for approval to paint elements on the front façade and install a plaque adjacent to the front door of a Greek Revival home in the Union Old and Historic District. This application is the result of enforcement activity as the work was completed without obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff recommends denial of the painting of both the previously unpainted brick piers and the previously painted masonry foundation. Staff recommends approval of the installation of the wall plaque. Staff also noted that the proposed color a bright blue is not appropriate for Greek Revival style homes and is not a color included in the Guidelines paint palette, therefore staff cannot recommend approval of the painting the wooden elements to include the rails, decking, treads, and door this color.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Mr. Christopher Dosier, owner, came up to answer questions.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Elmes made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that previously painted masonry piers be painted a red brick color to be determined by staff and that the applicant work with staff to determine a usable blue color from the color palette for the element of the front façade of the house per the Guidelines.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made a friendly amendment that the applicant has the option to use a more appropriate blue or another color listed for Greek Revival style structures.

After further discussion the motion was seconded by Mr. Bond and passed 9-0-0.

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes painting of elements on the front façade and installation of a plaque, and

 WHEREAS, all the masonry to be painted a red brick color to be reviewed and administratively approved by staff, and

 WHEREAS, the applicant work with staff to determine a blue color from the Commission's paint palette or a color from the Commission's paint palette which is appropriate for Greek Revival style structures to paint the top and bottom porch railing, the porch decking, the front door, and the stair treads, and

 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the conditions noted, and

 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE: Affirmative: Elmes, Bond, Green, Hughes, McRoberts, Yates, Aarons-Sydnor, Klaus and Hendricks

 Negative: None

 Abstain: None

Application No. 15-134 (R. & K. Gentry)

801 N. 21st Street

Ms. Pitts presented the staff report and summarized the applicant's request approval to install windows on the west side of the first floor of an existing 2 story building at the corner of 21st and Venable Streets in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. Staff recommends approval with the conditions that large single pane storefront windows and single lite transom windows that fit the entire window openings in the layout proposed be installed rather than the proposed multi-lite windows. Additionally, staff recommends that the existing masonry curb which is not shown on the plans be maintained. Staff recommends the windows should be wood or aluminum clad wood windows, and the door should be wood to match the historic materials

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Ms. Karen Gentry, the owner, came up to answer questions.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Yates made a motion to approve the application based on the staff report that the masonry curb at the bottom be retained, that the 2 large window openings be fitted without any mullions, that a transom bars be installed as in the 1970's photo, that the proposed steel door is fine, and that the windows be aluminum clad or wood windows. The motion was seconded by Mr. Bond.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made an amendment that all of the glazing will have clear glass. After further discussion the motion passed 9-0-0.

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to install windows in existing altered window openings, and

 WHEREAS, the existing masonry curb which is not shown on the plans be maintained, and

 WHEREAS, the two large windows with no mullions and 2 transoms with no mullions be installed in the storefront openings, and

 WHEREAS, the door be constructed of steel, and

 WHEREAS, the windows be wood or aluminum clad wood windows with clear glass, and

 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the conditions noted, and

 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE: Affirmative: Elmes, Bond, Green, Hughes, McRoberts, Yates, Aarons-Sydnor, Klaus and Hendricks

 Negative: None

 Abstain: None

Application No. 15-136 (L. Cluff)

25 N. Boulevard

Ms. Pitts presented the staff report for the applicant's request for approval to install a 42" black metal railing on the third floor balcony of a three story brick Colonial Revival style apartment building in the Boulevard Old and Historic District. This application is before the Commission as a result of enforcement activity. The metal railing does not match the historic balustrade as shown in previous photographs of the property, and therefore, staff cannot support the installation of the metal railing. Staff recommends the applicant install a wooden railing to match the historic railing to include rectangular pickets and square pedestals. Staff recommends the applicant consider the installation of a metal backer rail to meet this requirement.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if when code enforcement cites a property in an Old and Historic District, is there a trigger for CAR review like there is for a building permit within an Old and Historic District, and Ms. Pitts stated no. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that there was no building permit to remediate the code enforcement violation, and Ms. Pitts stated correct. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that they needed one when there is a code enforcement issue, and Ms. Pitts stated that she is not sure if the installation of rails would require a building permit. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if the code enforcement issue has gone away, and Ms. Pitts stated that she spoke with the code enforcement officer and he inspected the property last week and stated that he was impressed about how they handled all of the maintenance and repairs to the balconies.

Mr. Larry Cluff, with the ownership group, stated that they acquired this property in December, and they were promptly served with notices to immediately rectify peeling paint, and he stated that the City inspector, Mr. Walsh, gave them 48 hours to take care of the railings. Mr. Cluff stated that when they purchased the property the previous management company had taken the original railing down and there was nothing left there but plywood boxes. Mr. Cluff stated that they did not have any pictures to go by and that they also had safety issues with the peeling paint. Mr. Cluff stated that they looked at up and down the Boulevard and the majority of structures with third story balconies had metal railing. Mr. Cluff stated that his application included photographs of other properties. He stated that they typically match everything historically and that one option is to put an inaccurate metal railings on top of the wooden railings. Mr. Cluff stated that they do not agree with staff and stated that they want to have a safe building.

Mr. Elmes stated that the order of events is weird. Mr. Elmes asked the applicant if when they bought the building if the railings were gone, and Mr. Cluff stated that is correct. Mr. Elmes stated that there a lot of metal handrails on the 3rd floor balconies but states that are behind the wooden handrails.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if a 48 hour required turnaround for remediating the problem is correct. Mr. Yates stated yes, and Code Enforcement gives them a short amount of time to fix it.

Mr. Elmes stated that a permit being applied for would have caused a different outcome and stated that usually when you have a code enforcement issue and you go and apply for a permit, they allow time for abatement.

Mr. Hendricks stated that these are pretty significant elements of a façade to the scaling and proportion of the front porches and stated that to him it is important to have an element that is similar to what was there.

Mr. Bond stated that he concurs and stated that it is really about the scale of the building and the railings.

Mr. McRoberts stated that to be consistent with other applications that have come before the Commission, the railings should have to build like they were. Mr. Bond stated that the black railing behind will disappear.

Mr. Green stated that they have been pretty consistent with other railings that have come before the Commission and inquired if there was any photos of the deteriorated balcony.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that it is unfortunate sequence of events and agree that they have to be consistent.

Mr. Hendricks made a motion to deny the application per the staff report. The motion was seconded by Mr. McRoberts and passed 8-1-0(Elmes opposed).

VOTE:	Affirmative:	Elmes, McRoberts, Hughes, Kraus, Aaron-Sydnor Yates, Green, Bond and Hendricks
	Negative:	None
	Abstain:	None

Application No. 15-139 (J. Creasey)

2606 E. Franklin Street

Ms. Chen presented the staff report and summarized the applicant's request for approval to replace deteriorated windows and a door and construct a wood privacy fence on a dwelling located in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District. The windows and door have been removed and the openings boarded. The proposal to replace the deteriorated windows with windows of the same size and glazing pattern meets the Commission's Guidelines. The deteriorated door on the east elevation will be replaced with a 6-panel wood door. Staff recommends approval of the proposed replacement windows and door and the construction of a privacy fence.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Mr. Jeremy Creasey, the contractor, came up to answer questions.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Elmes made a motion to approved the application based on Guidelines referenced in the staff report for the same reasons mentioned in the previous approval of 2604 E. Franklin and stated that all the same conditions will apply. The motion was seconded by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor and passed 9-0-0.

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to replace deteriorated windows and to construct a wood privacy fence, and
 WHEREAS, that the windows be 2/2 wood simulated-divided lite windows, and
 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the condition noted, and
 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE:	Affirmative:	Elmes, Green, McRoberts, Bond, Hughes, Kraus, Aaron-Sydnor, Yates And Hendricks
	Negative:	None
	Abstain:	None

Application No. 15-140 (G. & S. Pesch)

726 N. 27th Street

Ms. Chen presented the staff report and summarized that the applicant's request to enclose an existing two story side porch and construct a new rear porch. The applicant came before the Commission at the July 2015 meeting seeking approval to enclose the existing two-story side porch, construct a one-story screened-in porch, and a garage. Staff recommended denial of the porch enclosure, modification of the screened porch to an open deck, and approval of the garage. The Commission deferred the application and requested that the applicant return with a revised application that includes a design for the deck and more information about the garage roof design. Staff recommends the approval of the rear deck with conditions that the balustrade is "Richmond-style" rail or other contemporary railing and not a suburban applied picket railing as shown on the drawings; that the supporting piers be brick or screened with wood lattice, and that the deck be painted or opaquely stained. Staff recommends approval of the porch enclosure with the condition that on the submission of colors for the porch enclosure to be approved by staff.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Mr. Charlie Field, representing the owner, came up to answer questions.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Green made a motion to approve the application based on the conditions in the staff report. The motion was seconded by Mr. Bond and passed 9-0-0.

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to enclose a two story side porch and construct a new rear porch, and

 WHEREAS, the balustrade be Richmond-style rail or other contemporary railing and not a suburban applied picket railing as shown on the drawings, and

 WHEREAS, that the supporting piers be brick or screened with wood lattice, and

 WHEREAS, the deck be painted or opaquely stained, and

 WHEREAS, the paint colors be submitted to staff for review and approval, and

 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the conditions noted, and

 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE:	Affirmative:	Elmes, Bond, Green, McRoberts, Hughes, Kraus, Aaron-Sydnor, Yates And Hendricks
	Negative:	None
	Abstain:	None

VOTE:	Affirmative:	Yates, McRoberts, Bond, Green, Klaus, Elmes, Hughes, Aarons-Sydnor And Hendricks
	Negative:	None
	Abstain:	None

Application No. 15-141 (D. Kleyman)

812 N. 23rd Street

Ms. Chen presented the staff report and summarized the applicant's request approval to construct a single-family dwelling on a small, vacant irregular shaped in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. The proposed building will be situated next to a paved parking lot and a proposed new dwelling to the north. Staff recommends approval of the project.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Mr. Jimmy Freeman, representing the owner, came up to answer questions.

Ms. Nancy Lambert, speaking as a member of the public, came up to speak on the project.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Green made a motion to approve the application in accordance with staff recommendations and with the condition that the roof color be black, silver or grey to match rooflines of neighboring buildings, that the front corbels align with the windows and that the parging be opaque and not translucent or transparent, and that the applicant consider incorporated windows on the side left elevation and the approval of any new windows on this elevation be defer to staff for review. The motion was seconded by Mr. McRoberts.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that if they make the windows optional if it is likely that they will not be included in the project, and therefore, she would like to make it a condition of approval. The Commission had a brief discussion regarding the condition that the applicant install windows on the side of the house and the motion was not amended to make this a condition of approval. The original motion passed 8-1-0 (Aarons-Sydnor opposed).

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes construction of a new single family dwelling, and

 WHEREAS, that the roof color to be black, silver or grey to match existing metal roofs in the neighborhood, and

 WHEREAS, the corbels use a traditional alignment and align with the windows,

 WHEREAS, the parging be of a thickness that the CMU outline does not show through, and

 WHEREAS, the Commission encourages the applicant to place windows on the side left elevation, and the review and approval of any new windows on this elevation shall be delegated to staff for review and approval, and

 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the conditions noted, and

 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of

Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

Application No. 15-142 (D. Kleyman)

814 N. 23rd Street

Ms. Chen presented the staff report and summarized the applicant's request approval to construct a single-family dwelling on a small vacant irregular lot in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. The proposed building is two-stories in height and four-bays wide and of a traditional design. Staff recommends approval of the project.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Mr. Jimmy Freeman, representing the owner came up to answer questions.

Ms. Nancy Lampert, speaking as a member of the public, came up to speak on the project.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Green made a motion to approve the application staff report with the condition that the roof be black, silver or grey, that the parking be opaque, that the entrance be moved to one of the two center bays and a two-bay entry porch with a shed roof with a shed roof, side stairs, and details to be resolved with staff be constructed. The motion was seconded by Mr. Klaus.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made a friendly amendment that the corbels align with the windows.

After further discussion the motion passed 5-4-0 (Yates, Elmes, Hendricks and Aarons-Sydnor opposed).

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes construction of a new single family, and

 WHEREAS, that the roof color to be black, silver or grey to match existing metal roofs in the neighborhood, and

 WHEREAS, the corbels use traditional alignment and align with the windows,

 WHEREAS, the parking be of a thickness that the CMU outline does not show through, and

 WHEREAS, the entrance be moved to one of the center bays with a 2 bay porch at the center and side stairs, and

 WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the conditions noted, and

 NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE: Affirmative: McRoberts, Klaus, Hughes, Green and Bond

 Negative: Yates, Elmes, Aarons-Sydnor and Hendricks

 Abstain: None

Application No. 15-123 (J. & J. Monopoli)

725 N. 26th Street

Ms. Pitts presented the staff report and summarized the applicant's request for approval to build a new two-story garage. The applicant requests approval to construct a two-bay two-story frame garage at the rear of this residential property in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The applicant has referenced Sanborn maps indicating that a one-story outbuilding with a similar footprint formerly stood on the site. This area of the Church Hill North Old and Historic District features granite curbs with a granite-block-paver gutter pan. The orientation of the garage doors would require a curb cut adjacent to the alley for access. Therefore, staff does not feel the application addresses the concerns raised by the Commission at September 22, 2015, when the Commission requested the applicant to return with a revised design for a smaller building to address issues with the scale of the proposed building. Staff also recommends that the garage doors should address the alley for access. This traditional orientation of the garage would avoid the introduction of a curb cut across the public sidewalk and obviate the need to modify the historic curb and gutter materials. In staff's opinion the massing of the building proposed and the orientation of the garage doors facing the street are elements that are not compatible with the Guidelines for outbuildings and the historical pattern of development in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The Commission may wish to consider if an outbuilding with the same 27' by 20' footprint and single story of the historic outbuilding as indicated in the Assessor's records would be an appropriate model for an outbuilding on this property. Staff does not recommend approval of the current project.

Mr. Green opened the floor for applicant and public comment.

Ms. Deanna Lewis, representing the owner, came up to answer questions.

Ms. Nancy Lampert, speaking as a member of the public, came up to speak against the project.

There were no additional comments from members of the public. Commission discussion began.

Mr. Hughes made a motion to defer the application. The motion was seconded by Mr. Yates, and it failed 3-6-0 (McRoberts, Klaus, Elmes, Hendricks, Green and Bond opposed).

Mr. Elmes made a motion to approve the application based on the Guidelines listed under out buildings on page 48 and to include staff recommendations that it be a 22ft wide building with a gable roof, and the applicant work with staff regarding details of the fenestration to alter the scale and proportion by increasing door heights.

Mr. Hendricks made a friendly amendment that the sill heights can be lowered.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Hendricks and passed 5-4-0 (Green, Yates, McRoberts, and Aarons-Sydnor opposed).

RESOLUTION: WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to construct a two story carriage house, and
 WHEREAS, the structure be 24; all at the ridge with a gable roof as submitted, and

WHEREAS, the structure be 22' wide along Cedar Street, and

WHEREAS, the applicant work with staff to alter the scale and proportion of the proposed openings and fenestrations to make the façade detailing be aligned with the examples of other outbuildings in Church Hill provided in the applications, and

WHEREAS, the application is approved as submitted with the noted conditions, and

NOW, THEREFORE, LET IT BE RESOLVED that the Commission approves the work as being in conformity with the intent of Division 4 Section 30-930 of the Richmond City Code.

VOTE:	Affirmative:	Bond, Elmes, Hendricks, Hughes, and Klaus
	Negative:	Aarons-Sydnor, Green, McRoberts and Yates
	Abstain:	None

The meeting adjourned at 7:43 p.m.

Marianne G. Pitts

Secretary to the Commission of Architectural Review