COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT January 26, 2016, Meeting

2. CAR No. 16-009 (D. Kleyman)

802 North 25th Street Union Hill Old and Historic District

Project Description:

Rehabilitate a single family home to include replacing windows and doors and enclosing a 2 story side porch

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate a home in the Union Hill Old and Historic District to include the enclosure of a side porch. The Greek Revival style home was constructed in 1856 and is a 2 story, 3-bay stretcher-bond brick house on a raised foundation. The applicant has pursued rehabilitation tax and has received the Part II Tax Credit conditional approval. The Department of Historic Resources (DHR) has conditioned the Part II approval with the condition that the applicant should try to limit the use of siding between in the area surrounding the new windows of the porch enclosure by using custom-sized windows.

The applicant is proposing to complete the following work:

- Install new double hung, 1/1, wood sash windows in existing window openings. The windows will be sized to fit the existing openings with new wood frames. The historic window units have been removed and infilled with plywood. There is one vinyl window at the rear of the structure on the modern addition which will also be removed and replaced with two paired 1/1 wood windows. The applicant proposes to remove the modern metal awnings.
- Enclose the existing two story side porch and construct a single story deck at the rear. The existing porch structure is severely deteriorated. The applicant proposes to enclose the porch using clap board siding and reference the existing porch configuration and railing through the installation of vertical siding and trim. The applicant proposes to install four bays of ranked 1/1 windows on the south elevation of the enclosure and one metal door on the first floor of the west elevation. The proposed deck will have railings in the Richmond rail design and will be painted.
- Replace two basement level doors with six panel doors or doors with a glazed upper portion set above raised panels.
- Repair and restore all other elements of the structure including the front porch, cornice and eaves, exterior walls, foundation, roof and chimneys. The applicant noted that the front stairs may require reconfiguration to meet modern code. Any change to the stair configuration would require review by DHR.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* state that original features and materials that define a building style should be retained and damaged elements should be repaired instead of replaced (pg. 55, #1, 7). The applicant is proposing to repair much of the deteriorated structure including the character defining front porch. The *Guidelines* note that windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair and any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation (pg. 65, #7). The applicant is replacing missing windows and one inappropriately sized replacement window with wood windows of an appropriate size and glazing pattern.

The Guidelines state that solid materials are not recommended for use in porch enclosures and that glass enclosures which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred (pg. 67, #13). The applicant is proposing to install multiple windows on the south elevation of the porch enclosure, maintain the historic columns, and add trim work to reference the historic porch. Staff recommends the applicant install larger windows to reduce the amount of space between the columns and the windows to preserve the open appearance of the porch as was recommended by DHR.

The applicant has noted that several elements including the doors and porch will be painted colors to be chosen by the owner. Staff recommends that the applicant provide paint colors for review and approval by staff. Additionally, staff recommends that the proposed deck be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure.

The Commission's approval should be conditioned upon the work being performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions. In addition, the applicant should submit any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the conditions noted above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.