COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT December 15, 2015 Meeting

3. CAR No. 15-158 (K. Sherry & A. Braddock) 307 North 29th Street St. John's Church Old and Historic District

Project Description: Replace a metal porch roof with a modified bitumen roof membrane with a granulated surface.

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to replace an existing metal front porch roof on a home in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District. The existing roof is a standing seam metal roof which was installed after receiving approval from the Commission in 2006. The applicant states that this roof is failing as the panels were installed incorrectly which has caused leaks. The applicant proposes to replace the roof with a modified bitumen roof membrane with a granulated surface which is the roof material on 70% of the house. As the pitch of the roof is minor, the roof material is minimally visible from the public right of way.

Staff recommends approval of the project as submitted with a condition. The Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines state shallow pitched metal roofs with flat seams are found in the District and create a more homogenous appearance than standing seam metal roofs (pg. 62). The existing metal roof is not original to the structure and, with its standing seams, is not an appropriate design choice; therefore staff supports the removal of this material. The proposed roof membrane is compatible with the roof materials on the street and will be minimally visible. Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the metal roof with the proposed membrane roof with the condition that the membrane be black or dark grey to match the main roof color.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the condition noted above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation in Section 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.