COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT September 22, 2015 Meeting

6. CAR No. 15-117 (W. Chafe)

3110 E. Marshall Street St. John's Church Old and Historic District

Project Description: Review of siding installed by previous owner

Staff Contact: K. Chen

The applicant requests approval of siding installed on a dwelling in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District. The application is the result of enforcement activity.

The previous owner replaced the lap wood siding on the house with Hardie Plank, un-beaded, Cedarmill, textured siding. (The existing vinyl windows were approved by the Commission in 2002 because there were no windows.)

The Substitute Materials section of the *Guidelines*, as cited on page 56, restrict the use of fiber cement siding to new freestanding buildings, secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right-of-way, new additions with limited visibility from the public right-of-way, and new outbuildings. The use of fiber cement siding products as a substitute material for original wood trim and siding on historic buildings is discouraged. Fiber cement siding should reveal a smooth surface, rather than faux "wood grain". The color is compatible with those recommended on page 60 and 61 of the *Guidelines*. A google street view image from 2011 suggests that the siding in the gable was installed on the diagonal.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with the condition that smooth Hardie Plank, be installed on the façade and that the siding be installed on the diagonal in the gable.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the condition above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code and with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.