

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
July 28, 2015 Meeting**

5. **CAR No. 15-090** (C. Parham)

**723 North 22nd Street
Union Hill Old and Historic District**

Project Description:

**Demolition of an existing garage and
construction of a new two story garage.**

Staff Contact:

K. Chen

The applicant requests approval to demolish an existing single story garage and build a new two story garage in its footprint at the rear of a property located in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. The primary structure on the property is a two-story, late-Victorian dwelling constructed in 1909.

At the time of this application submittal, the demolition of the garage had occurred, and construction had begun on the proposed new garage. The demolished garage was a single-story metal structure with a side gable roof and two garage doors fronting the alley. The footprint of the structure spanned the width of the lot. From pictures of the garage, it appears that the structure was in poor condition with the metal rusting and the roof failing.

The applicant is proposing to replace the demolished garage with a 28' by 28' two-story garage built on the foundation walls of the demolished garage. The applicant proposes a gable roof structure with two different pitches. The structure will be approximately 24'-7" in height to the ridge line. The applicant proposes to construct both the roof and the sides of the structure out of ribbed steel panels. On the alley elevation, the applicant proposes to install dormers with two, 1/1, 3' by 4½' windows and two steel garage doors. On the south elevation facing the neighboring property, three, 1/1, 2'-4" by 4' windows are proposed to be installed on the second story. A pair of 2'-4" by 4' windows are proposed to be installed on the second story of the north elevation. On the east elevation, facing the main house, there will be two, flush steel doors and a 3' by 3' window. A wood, stair and landing will be constructed leading from the second story to the ground.

Staff recommends denial of the project. *The Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that outbuildings such as sheds or garages should be compatible with the main building on the site including roof slope and material selection and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize their character as secondary structures (p. 48). The proposed garage is not compatible with the main building on the lot which is a two-story, frame building with a shed roof. The proposed garage is 2-stories in height with a gable roof and metal panel siding. The now demolished garage which had a shallow, side gable roof and was clad with metal. The *Guidelines* further state that new outbuildings should respect the siting, massing, roof

profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood and be smaller than the main residence. The proposed new garage does not respect the massing of the existing outbuildings in the neighborhood or of the garage that was demolished. The foot print of the building is similar to an adjacent metal garage and to the garage that was demolished but the proposed height is out of scale with the neighboring outbuildings as well as the main dwelling on the lot. The proposed garage is not subordinate to the primary residence.

It is the assessment of staff that the scale and massing of the proposed garage is not consistent with the Standards for New Construction – Residential Outbuildings outlined in Section 114-930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.