COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT June 23, 2015 Meeting

18. CAR No. 15-085 (J. Armstead)

619 St. Peter Street Jackson Ward Old and Historic District

Project Description: Install new windows on all elevations and infill one rear window

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to install windows on all elevations totaling 13 windows and infill one rear window per the requirements of the building code on a structure within the Jackson Ward Old and Historic District. At the Commission's meeting on January 25, 2011, the Commission approved an application to address code violations that included a number of exterior repairs at the property. That application did not address the issue that some of the windows had been replaced without receiving the approval of the Commission. As a part of the current application, the applicant has included two options for the window type which consist of Legend HBR White Double Hung 2/2 windows which are PVC clad windows and Marvin Clad Double Hung 2/2 windows which are aluminum clad wood windows. The windows are proposed to fill the existing window openings. The applicant has been informed by the City's Building Division that the window at the rear of the structure must be infilled and is proposing to clad the entire rear of the structure with siding.

Staff recommends approval of the project, with conditions. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* state that windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair and reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation. (pg. 65, #7). The windows currently on the structure were not original to the home. From photographs, it appears that the windows were previously 2/2 windows. Staff supports the proposed reconstruction of the windows with the historic muntin configuration.

The *Guidelines* state that vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts because the material cannot be manufactured to model effectively the appearance of historic windows (pg. 65, #11). Though the PVC clad windows are not traditional vinyl windows, the Commission recommends the use of wood or aluminum clad wood windows on rehabilitation projects as they most effectively replicate the appearance of historic windows. For this reason, staff recommends the applicant install true divided lite or simulated divided lite Marvin Clad Double Hung 2/2 aluminum clad wood windows rather than the Legend HBR White Double Hung 2/2 PVC clad windows.

The *Guidelines* recommend that the number of windows should not be changed by blocking out windows (pg. 65, #8). The applicant is required to remove the

window at the rear of the home due to the proximity to the property line. As this window is not historic and the replacement of the siding has been approved by the Commission, staff recommends approval of this removal with the opening to be covered with siding.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the condition above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.