COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT March 24, 2015 Meeting

2. CAR No. 15-033 (M. Wayne)

3508 E. Broad Street Chimborazo Park Old & Historic District

Project Description:

Replace non-historic windows and doors, rebuild deck and stairs

Staff Contact:

M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to replace non-historic windows and doors and rebuild the deck and stairs on an existing carriage house in the rear of the property which is located in the Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* state that all original windows should be retained and repaired as necessary and that reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation (p. 65 #1 & #7). One window on the south elevation is original to the structure and will be repaired. The remaining windows, which consist of three windows on the south elevation and three windows on the north elevation, are non-historic windows that do not properly fit the historic window openings. These windows will be removed and replaced with Andersen 400 series TW3060 tempered glass 2/2 windows which will be painted white to match the historic windows. <u>Staff recommends that the windows be true divided lite or simulated divided lite.</u>

The existing stairs and deck to the front of the carriage house are proposed to be rebuilt using in-kind materials on the existing footprint. The railing, pickets, and posts for the stairs will be painted white, and the treads will be painted black. There is limited visibility of the stairs and porch from the public right-of-way. The *Guidelines* recommend a traditional Richmond rail where the pickets are fitted into the recess between the top and bottom rails, and discourages the use of typical deck railings where the pickets are attached to the outside of the top and bottom rail (p. 46 #2). Staff recommends that the applicant use a standard Richmond rail for a design that is more compatible with the district, or that the applicant place the proposed pickets on the inside of the handrail for a more finished appearance.

The project includes the replacement of two non-historic garage doors. On the south elevation, which faces the main structure on the property, an existing metal roll up door has been removed and will be replaced with a pair of Andersen 400 Series Frenchwood Hinged Inswing 10-Lite Patio Doors painted white and a stationary Andersen 400 Series Frenchwood 10-Lite Patio Door painted white. Though it can be seen, this opening has limited visibility from E. Broad Street. <u>Staff recommends that doors be true divided lite or simulated divided lite.</u>

The existing garage door on the north elevation facing the alley is constructed of various pieces of plywood and is non-operational. This door will be replaced with a 10' x 8'-6" wooden carriage door which will fit the original opening and be painted

white. The proposed door will be non-operational and constructed with diagonal tongue and groove boards. The proposal will create the appearance of carriage doors found in the historic district.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the conditions noted above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code, and with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines,* specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.