

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
June 24, 2014 Meeting**

19. **CAR No. 14-67** (M. & K. Wind)

**3516 E. Broad Street  
Chimborazo Park Old & Historic District**

**Project Description:**

**Construct new garage**

**Staff Contact:**

**W. Palmquist**

The applicant requests approval to construct a new one-story garage located in the rear yard of this property within the Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District. The proposed garage would be visible along N 36<sup>th</sup> St and slightly less visible along the public alley that runs behind the property. Along that alley there are a variety of garage types, including one and two-story garages with flat or sloped roofs.

The applicant proposes the garage to be sited in the northwest corner of the property to minimize its visibility. The existing brick retaining wall and wood fence would remain, and the garage would be located where a wood gate along the alley currently sits. The proposed garage would be 16' wide along the alley side and 22' 8" long, with a parapet height of 13' 6". The exterior would be constructed of a turn brick pattern which would closely resemble the color, size and bond of the brick found on the rear elevation of the main structure.

The garage would have an aluminum parapet cap with a TPO roof, with black aluminum gutters and downspout. The garage would have three carriage style lanterns, the manufacturer of which is to be determined, with one on the façade facing the main structure and two on the side facing the alley. Carriage style garage doors, the manufacturer of which is to be determined, will face the alley. Two double-hung Jeld Wen Sitrine exterior clad windows, bone white with a brickmold, would face the main structure. One Jeld Wen single lite patio door, bone white with a brickmold, would also face the main structure.

The applicant is seeking **final approval** for the design. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the Standards for New Construction on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* and the resulting comments follow.

**Staff Findings based on Commission of Architectural Review Guidelines**

**STANDARDS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION**

*New construction should be compatible with the historic features that characterize its setting and context. To protect the significance of the historic context, the new work should reference the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportions, and massing of its setting. However, new construction should*

*be clearly discernible from the old to protect the authenticity of the historic district.*

### **SITING**

- 1. Additions should be subordinate in size to the main structure and as inconspicuous as possible. Locating them at the rear or least visible side of the structure is preferred.*

The proposed garage would be sited in the northwest corner of the property minimizing its visibility from public rights-of-way and would be subordinate in size to the main structure.

- 2. New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimal setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.*

This standard is not applicable.

- 3. New structures should face the most prominent street bordering the site.*

The proposed garage would have garage doors facing the alley and would have a door and two windows facing the main structure.

### **FORM**

- 1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the immediate area. Building form refers to the specific combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections, and roof shapes that lend identity to a structure. Building form is greatly influenced by the architectural style of a given structure.*

The design of the proposed is compatible with the main structure and similar structures found throughout the neighborhood. The proposed brick color, size, and bond will match that found on the rear façade of the main structure. The garage will be similar to scale and form as other garages found along the rear alley of the property.

### **SCALE**

- 1. New construction should maintain the existing human scale of historic residential and commercial neighborhoods. The inappropriate use of monumentally-scaled buildings that overwhelm pedestrians at the street level is discouraged.*

The proposed garage would be 22' 8" x 16' and 13' 6" in height, while the main dwelling structure on the property is approximately 70' x 33' and 35' in height. The proposed garage is therefore appropriate compared to the main structure and will maintain the human scale found throughout the neighborhood.

2. *New additions and infill structures should incorporate human-scale elements such as storefronts and porches into their design.*

The proposed door, windows, and carriage style lanterns are all human-scale elements which would be found on the garage.

### **HEIGHT, WIDTH, PROPORTION, & MASSING**

1. *New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding houses and commercial structures.*

The proposed garage is in proportion to the existing dwelling structure as well as to structures on surrounding properties.

2. *New construction should respect the vertical orientation typical of commercial and residential properties in historic districts. New designs that call for wide massing of more than 30 feet should be broken up by bays.*

The design respects the vertical orientation of the existing dwelling structure.

3. *Typical massing patterns throughout city historic districts are simple and block-like; therefore, new structures should avoid the use of staggered setbacks, towers, or elaborate balconies.*

The proposed garage is of a simple rectangular design without any overly-elaborate elements, and would be similar to garages found throughout the neighborhood.

### **MATERIALS, COLORS, & DETAILS**

1. *New construction should not cover or destroy original architectural elements.*

This standard is not applicable.

2. *Missing building elements should be replaced with new elements compatible in size, scale, and material to the original elements without creating a false historical appearance.*

This standard is not applicable.

3. *Materials used in new construction should be compatible with original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood.*

The proposed garage would be composed of brick whose color, size, and bond will relate well to the main structure on the property, as well as other structures found throughout the neighborhood.

4. *Paint colors for new additions should complement those of the primary structure. Paint colors used should be similar to the historically appropriate colors found in the immediate neighborhood and throughout the larger district.*

This standard is not applicable as the garage will not be painted.

5. *Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted for use in City Old and Historic Districts. Other synthetic siding materials with a smooth, untextured finish may be allowed in limited cases, but approval by the Commission is always required.*

The proposed garage will be constructed of brick.

6. *Vinyl windows are strongly discouraged and rarely permitted.*

The application calls for the installation of two double-hung Jeld Wen Sitrine exterior clad windows, bone white with a brickmold.

---

The overall building form, scale, siting, massing, and materials appear to be compatible with the Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District, and therefore **staff recommends approval of the project with a condition.** The applicant should work with Commission staff to determine the exact manufacturer and model for the proposed garage doors and carriage style lanterns.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 114-930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.