

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
June 24, 2014 Meeting**

18. **CAR No. 14-66** (M. & K. Wind)

**3516 E. Broad Street
Chimborazo Park Old & Historic District**

Project Description:

Modify front entryway

Staff Contact:

W. Palmquist

The applicant requests permission to replace the front door and associated transom and side-light windows on the building's primary façade, as well as to install missing transom windows above windows at the building's parlor room and dining room. Currently, the front entry has a glass door and two side-light windows with non-historic safety glass, which is glass having metal wire reinforcement in a grid pattern to prevent breaking. The three transom windows, one above the door, and one above each side-light window are clear glass. The transom window located above the parlor room windows, also on the primary elevation, as well as the transom window above the dining room windows on the secondary façade are missing entirely.

The applicant proposes replacing the glass front door with a five-panel wooden door with a stain matching that found on the dining room door located on the secondary façade. The applicant also proposes replacing the two side-light and three transom windows at the primary entryway with an accent leaded glass. The applicant proposes using this same transom window design to replace the missing transom windows above the parlor room and dining room windows.

Staff recommends denial of the project. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* state, "Do not remove original doors. Replacement doors and door surrounds with stamped or molded faux paneling or leaded, beveled, or etched glass is strongly discouraged and rarely permitted" (pg. 61 #13). While staff could not verify whether the existing door is original to the structure, it has historic value and similar designs can be found throughout the neighborhood. The proposed replacement door is non-historic and of a style that is not typically found in the neighborhood. The proposed leaded glass design for the side-light and transom windows runs counter to the recommendations of the *Guidelines*, while replacement clear glass, with or without beveled edges, would be more appropriate and keeping with the character of the neighborhood

It is the assessment of staff that the application is not consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.