

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
June 24, 2014 Meeting**

16. **CAR No. 14-62** (A. Auyeung)

**2107 E. Marshall Street
Church Hill North Old & Historic District**

Project Description:

Replace windows

Staff Contact:

W. Palmquist

The applicant requests permission to replace windows on the front of this structure within the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The applicant wishes to replace the home's front-facing, upper-story bedroom and bathroom windows with aluminum clad, exact replica windows. These windows would be an exact match to the existing windows with insulated clear glass, a wood clad interior, and an aluminum clad exterior replacement frame, produced by Windsor Manufacturing. This change would affect a total of three windows on the home's 2nd floor. The applicant also wishes to replace the existing front-facing, lower-story window sashes with an exact replica window having a fir sash and single pane window glass. This change would affect a total of two windows on the home's 1st floor. The applicant has provided photos of the interior and exterior of the windows which show various degrees deterioration.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project. The window guidelines outlined on page 59 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* emphasize the need to retain and repair all original windows, but provides guidance concerning the style of replacement windows if original windows are missing or deteriorated beyond repair:

- Original windows should be repaired by patching, splicing, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing them.
- Windows should be replaced only when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photographic documentation.
- Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis.
- The architectural character of windows should not be altered by inappropriate materials or finishes that radically change the sash, depth of reveal, muntin configuration, the reflective quality or color of the glazing or the appearance of the frame.
- Do not replace multi-paned sash windows with new thermal sash windows that use false muntins.

The *Guidelines* also address the inappropriate replacement of windows on page 90: *It is generally not appropriate to replace historic windows. Replacements are often made as a result of poor maintenance of the original materials, or from a belief that original windows do not provide sufficient energy efficiency; such replacements are considered inappropriate if the new windows do not duplicate the historic character of original windows in size, materials or design.*

The photos provided by the applicant demonstrate that most of the existing windows are repairable. While these windows having varying degrees of deterioration, they are not past the point of repair. The *Guidelines* state that historic windows should only be replaced when they are deteriorated past the ability to be repaired. The only window that appears past the point of the repair is the easternmost (upper-left) bedroom window on the upper-story of the primary façade. The photographs provided by the applicant show that the window has missing portions of its sash, and the lower muntin has become separated from the rest of the window sash. Therefore staff recommends that only this window be replaced with an exact replica, while all other windows be repaired.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.