

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
June 24, 2014 Meeting**

14. CAR No. 14-60 (Quirk Hospitality, LLC)

**201-207 W. Broad Street
Broad Street Old and Historic District**

Project Description:

**Renovate buildings and construct
new rooftop addition**

Staff Contact:

C. Easterling

The applicant requests permission to renovate the buildings located at 201-207 West Broad Street in the Broad Street Old and Historic District, and construct a new rooftop addition. Work at the large, Italian Renaissance Revival-style building at the corner of Broad and Jefferson Streets includes the removal of fire escapes, the restoration of a storefront bay on Jefferson Street, the reinstallation of a missing canopy, and the creation of new window openings on the west elevation. Work at the smaller, adjacent building includes the replacement of a non-historic storefront and the creation of an inner courtyard that will allow additional window openings at 201 West Broad. (This courtyard will not be visible from the public right-of-way, and is therefore not subject to Commission review.) The applicant proposes a new penthouse, terrace, and bar at the rooftop of the building. The applicant proposes a storefront system for most of the new construction, which will be stepped up towards the alley to minimize visibility from Broad Street. The building currently has a brick elevator overrun and mechanical equipment at the roof near the rear of the building. The applicant proposes generally to maintain the height established by the existing equipment for the tallest point of the new addition. Additionally, the applicant proposes a number of encroachments into the public right-of-way. The Commission will only review the encroachments that are attached to the building, including new awnings, signage, benches, and an outdoor dining area. The Urban Design Committee will review all other encroachments that are located solely in the right-of-way.

The applicant is seeking Rehabilitation Tax Credits for this project, so the project will be reviewed by staff at the Virginia Department of Historic Resources and the National Park Service to ensure compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with conditions. The Standards for New Construction outlined on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guideline* note that new additions should be subordinate in size to the main structure and as inconspicuous as possible. The proposed rooftop addition is certainly subordinate in size to the building. The helpful exterior view renderings included in the application demonstrate that the size and placement of the new rooftop addition minimizes its impact. The addition appears to be fairly innocuous from

these views, but there are other views that are more prominent. It is the assessment of staff that the most conspicuous view of the new addition is near the intersection of West Grace Street and Adams Street, largely because of gaps in the urban fabric created by surface parking lots. By limiting the height of the new rooftop features and by using a glass storefront system, the effect of the massing has been somewhat mitigated. The Commission should evaluate the impact the proposed addition has on the historic building from this view.

Staff fully supports the removal of non-historic features and the reintroduction of missing historic features at the two properties. The setback of the new window openings from the Broad Street façade helps ensure that the new openings will not alter the historic character of the building. Staff is primarily concerned with the new glass storefront at 207 West Broad. The new storefront does not maintain the rhythm established by other historic storefronts in the immediate area, and staff recommends the addition of horizontal elements that reference traditional storefront features (such as transom windows or sign bands) of a building this scale.

Staff would appreciate it if the applicant could supply the Commission with the following additional information:

- Materials for the mechanical equipment screening, the planters, and the café barrier
- Paint and material color selections
- Specifications for the projecting wall sign

Though this project is located in a commercial corridor and an Arts District, the colors used on the exterior of the building should respect the historic character of the Broad Street Old and Historic District. The *Guidelines* recommends against the use of fluorescent or obtrusive colors in local historic districts (pg. 55). The neon pink color used at the current location of the Quirk Gallery was not approved for use in the district, and staff recommends against the use of this color on the exterior of the building at the new gallery location. (The Commission does not regulate temporary items such as non-permanent café seating, so the color and style of these items will not be controlled. The Commission also does not regulate the use of color on the interior of a building.) The proposed signage should adhere to the Commission's Standards for Signage outlined on page 65 of the *Guidelines*.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the exception of the storefront at 207 West Broad, and provided that the Commission is satisfied with updated information about materials, color selections and signage, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code. Staff recommends that any changes requested by the Department of Historic Resources or the National Park Service

for tax credit purposes be deferred to Commission staff for final review and approval.