



**Commission of Architectural Review**

8. COA-129513-2023	<b>Final Review</b>	Meeting Date: 5/23/2023
Applicant/Petitioner	Mark and Teri Spanswick	
Project Description	Replace a non-original asphalt shingle front porch roof with a standing-seam copper roof.	
Project Location		
Address: 2006 Monument Ave		
Historic District: Monument Avenue		
High-Level Details: The applicant requests to replace a non-original asphalt shingle roof with hand-seamed copper. This is a retroactive approval request.		
Staff Recommendation	Approval	
Staff Contact	Samantha Lewis, <a href="mailto:Samantha.lewis@rva.gov">Samantha.lewis@rva.gov</a> , 804-646-5207	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Conditions for Approval	None.	

**Staff Analysis**

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
<b>Standards for New Construction, p. 49, #5</b>	<i>Porch roofs are encouraged to utilize standing- or flat-lock metal seam roofs that are hand-seamed, or closely approximate hand-seaming. Seams that, in section, are large, rectangular seams, reminiscent of pre-formed seams utilized on prefabricated industrial or commercial structures, are not acceptable. Membrane roofs are acceptable substitutes for flat-lock seamed metal roofs.</i>	Applicant’s contractor has stated: “The seams were hand turned with seaming tongs for a double locked 1-inch finished seam. The hip details were also hand turned and finished with a hand-dolly and dead blow hammer. The seams at the wall are flat locked and soldered. All the counter flashing is cut into the mortar joints and sealed.”

<p><b>Substitute Materials, p.61, #3</b></p>	<p><i>If in-kind materials cannot be found, or are impractical, substitute materials can be used. For example, modern tin-coated steel roofing is much less durable than historic tin or terne iron, which is no longer available. Modern terne-coated stainless steel or lead-coated copper is a visually compatible roof material and is a viable alternative.</i></p>	<p>Applicant has indicated when the asphalt roof was removed, there was evidence the original roof was tin. The applicant recommended copper to the owners which is an acceptable substitute material.</p>
<p><b>Building Elements, Roofs, p. 66, #5</b></p>	<p><i>The historic front and rear porches of many historic Richmond houses - particularly in the Jackson Ward and St. John's Church Old and Historic Districts- have shallow pitched metal roofs with flat seams (also called flat-lock seams). Flat seam metal roofs have a more homogenous appearance than the more typical standing seam metal roofs found on steeper slopes of the main roof.</i></p>	<p>Staff notes the porch roof is not visible standing on the sidewalk outside the property. The roof is more visible from the south side of Monument Avenue or from the median.</p>
<p><b>Building Elements, Roofs, p. 66, #6</b></p>	<p><i>Pre-fabricated and pre-finished metal roofs typically have ridge and valley pieces that are installed on top of the seams, creating visible shadow lines not typical of historic buildings. These prefabricated metal roof systems are particularly inappropriate on historic front porches.</i></p>	<p>Applicant's contractor has noted this was not a prefabricated metal roof. There are no ridge and valley pieces.</p>
		<p>Staff notes that other roofs on Monument utilize a standing seam on the front porch roof.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends approval of the application.</u></p>

*It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.*

# Figures

Figure 1. Façade photo



Figure 2. Standing at the corner of Monument and Meadow



Figure 3. Standing in the median



Figure 4. 1924-1925 Sanborn map

