



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

4. COA-126435-2023	Final Review	Meeting Date: 3/28/2023
Applicant/Petitioner	Walid Daniel	
Project Description	Replace barrel tile with asphalt shingles.	
Project Location		
Address: 905 N. Belmont Avenue		
Historic District: Monument Avenue		
<p>High-Level Details: Applicant proposes to replace barrel tile with asphalt shingles.</p> <p>This work has been completed without the issuance of a COA. This application is the result of a Notice of Violation issued on December 20, 2022.</p> <p>Applicant has submitted a quote to install Brava synthetic barrel tile.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Partial Approval	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov , (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Conditions for Approval	<p><i>Staff recommends denial of:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The installation of asphalt shingles. <p><i>Staff recommends approval of:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The installation of Brava Synthetic Barrel Tile. 	

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Maintenance & Repair, Roofs, Typical Materials, pg. 96	<i>Asphalt shingles are made of felt impregnated with asphalt and covered with colored ceramic or stone granules. This modern roofing material is an inappropriate choice for the majority of historic structures.</i>	The applicant proposes to remove an original roofing material and replace it with asphalt shingles. The original roofing material, barrel tile, was a character defining feature of the building. Asphalt shingles do not have the same profile, dimension, and shadow lines as barrel tile. Staff finds asphalt shingles to be an

		inappropriate material for this historic building as noted in the <i>Guidelines</i> . <u>Staff recommends the denial of the use of asphalt shingles on the pitched, visible portion of the roof on the front façade.</u>
Building Elements, p. 66, #3	<i>Substitute materials may be used if the same kind of material is not technically feasible because the material is no longer being made. Substitute materials should match the original style and form as much as possible.</i>	Based on the city of Richmond's assessor's office, the original roof material of the building is metal/tin on the flat portion, and barrel tile on the visible pitched portion on the front façade facing N. Belmont Avenue. Barrel tile is an available product still being produced, and qualified craftsman are available.
Substitute Materials, p. 60-61, #1, #2, #3	<p><i>When and where to use substitute materials is a decision to be reached only after careful consideration for the consequences to an historic structure and not before more appropriate preservation options have been explored. As with other proposed exterior changes, the use of substitute materials within a designated Old and Historic District is subject to Commission review.</i></p> <p><i>#1. Unavailability of Historic Materials. ...If that source cannot produce an appropriate match, substitute materials such as dry-tamp cast stone or textured pre-cast concrete may be appropriate alternatives as long as the detail, color and texture of the original stone are matched as closely as possible.</i></p>	<p>All preservation options should be explored thoroughly before substitute materials are used. The use of substitute material may be appropriate in the following circumstances: 1. The unavailability of historic material, 2. unavailability of skilled craftsman, and 3. replacement of poor-quality materials. Barrel tile is an available historic material, and installers exist in the Richmond, Virginia area. The appropriate procedure for the employment of substitute materials was not followed for this property.</p> <p>Given that the portion of roof that featured barrel tile is a limited area of the overall front facade of the building, and that it is relatively "high-up" and can only be viewed from certain angles, Staff would support the installation of a synthetic material that closely resembles the original material in appearance, as it may not be discernable from authentic barrel tile in this location.</p> <p>The applicant is proposing Brava synthetic Barrel tile. <u>Staff finds that this material is similar in dimension and design to the original material and recommends its approval.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures

Figure 1. Assessor Card, 1950's



Figure 2. Original Assessor's photo, 2013



Figure 3. Existing roof condition, asphalt shingles



Figure 4. Existing roof condition, asphalt shingles

