

## Staff Report City of Richmond, Virginia



## **Commission of Architectural Review**

1. COA-126437-2023	Final Review Meeting Date: 3/28/2023	
Applicant/Petitioner	Lizzie Drucker-Basch	
Project Description	Replace wood windows with aluminum clad wood windows.	
Project Location	72 GBD 100kgg/ 37 33 31 100kgg/ 37 33 31 100kgg/ 37 33 31 100kgg/ 37 33 31 100kgg/ 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37	
Address: 604 St. James Street	700 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 - 100 -	
Historic District: Jackson Ward	100	
High-Level Details:	600	
Applicant proposes replacing 5 deteriorated wooden windows on the front façade of a detached, Italianate, masonry dwelling ca. 1900.	119 12 8 6 604 615 7 618 701	
Staff believes that the windows show significant signs of deterioration. The lower sashes of the second-story windows do not appear original to the building.	19	
Replacement windows will be aluminum clad wood and will match the historic pane configuration.	515 518 518 518 518 518 523 500 517 510 523 500 523 500 523 500 523 500 523 500 523 500 500 500 500 500 500 500 50	
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, 804-646-6567, <u>alex.dandridge@rva.gov</u>	
Previous Reviews	The Commission reviewed and approved the rehabilitation of 604 St. James Street in 2019. This approval included repainting the entire building, repainting the front façade windows, and installing a number of new windows in previously infilled openings.	
Conditions for Approval	The new windows be installed in a way that does not damage the existing wooden sills and wood framing.	
	The width of the proposed muntins be decreased to 5/8 of an inch to better visually reference the existing windows; final window specifications submitted for staff review and approval.	

## **Staff Analysis**

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, pg. 59	5. Retain original windows including both functional and decorative elements such as frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, hood molds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, shutters and exterior blinds	The applicant proposes to replace five existing front façade wooden windows.
		Staff believes that the three second story window's lower sashes are not original based on their pane configuration.
		The existing window openings feature wooden sills and framing. Staff recommends that the new windows be installed in a way that does not damage the existing wooden sills and wood framing.
Building Elements, Windows, pg. 69	7. Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.	Based on images provided by the applicant and a site visit, Staff has determined that the windows are deteriorated and in need of replacement.
		The new windows will be based on the design of the original windows. They will have a 6/6 pane configuration and simulated divided lights. The muntins will have a dimension of 1 and 1/8 inches.
		The existing windows appear to have more narrow muntins. Staff recommends that the width of the proposed muntins be decreased to 5/8 of an inch to better visually reference the existing windows; final window specifications submitted for staff review and approval.
Buildings Elements, p. 69, #11	Because the material cannot be manufactured to model effectively the appearance of historic windows, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts.	The replacement windows will be aluminum clad wood which is an appropriate material for COHDs as mentioned in the <i>Guidelines</i> .

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

## **Figures**

Figure 1. South side elevation. New windows Previously approved by CAR.



Figure 3. Deterioration details.

Figure 2. North side elevation. New windows previously approved by CAR.













