



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

7. COA-121951-2022	Conceptual Review	Meeting Date: 12/20/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Dave Johannas	
Project Description	Construct a new five story multi-family building and rehabilitate existing buildings.	
Project Location		
Address: 1801 & 1805-1809 E. Broad Street		
Historic District: Shockoe Valley		
High-Level Details:		
<p>The applicant requests conceptual review of a proposal to construct a new 5-story mixed-use building in the rear of four, two-story buildings.</p> <p>The mixed use building will be contemporary in design and feature industrial materials such as metal and glass. It will be joined to the existing buildings by a glass and steel hyphen that will function as an entrance and stair tower.</p> <p>1801 E. Broad is the old Branch Public Baths ca. 1908.</p> <p>1805-1809 E. Broad are three attached commercial buildings with large storefront windows ca. 1909.</p> <p>The existing buildings will be converted into residential units.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Conceptual Review	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, 804-646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More information be submitted with the final review that specifies exterior repairs needed to the existing buildings including any necessary replacement elements and materials. • Additional information on the treatment of the residential entrance to the new building along E. Broad Street be submitted with the final review including any canopies, hardscaping, lighting, and signage. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed new construction be reduced in height by at least one-story. • The new construction use brick as a cladding material. • Larger windows be used on the northern, southern elevations. • An elevation drawing of the rear eastern elevation be provided for final review. • Applicant consider ways to further minimize the impact of the new construction on the chimney attached to 1801 E. Broad Street.
--	--

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Secretary to the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, pg. 4	<i>2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.</i>	1801 & 1805-1809 E. Broad Street will be rehabilitated to residential units. 1801 features high, small windows and 1805-1809 E. Broad Street have large storefront windows. The application states that elements of the existing buildings will be repaired as needed. <u>Staff recommends that more information be submitted with the final review that specifies exterior repairs needed to the existing buildings, including any necessary replacement elements and materials.</u>
Siting, pg. 46, #2-3	<p><i>2. New residential infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimum setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.</i></p> <p><i>3. New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site.</i></p>	<p>The new construction will be setback at a similar distance to 1801 E. Broad Street's 18th Street façade.</p> <p>The front façade of the new building will face 18th Street which is the most prominent street that the building is able to front.</p> <p>While the main front façade is located along 18th Street, this entrance will only be for the retail space. The primary residential entrance will be along Broad Street in the space between 1801 and 1805 E. Broad. This entrance will be visible from E. Broad Street. Information was not provided on the treatment of this space. <u>Staff recommends that additional information on the treatment of the residential entrance to the new building along E. Broad Street be submitted with the final review including any canopies, hardscaping, lighting, and signage.</u></p>

Form, pg. 46, #1-3	<p><i>1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district.</i></p> <p><i>2. New residential construction should maintain the existing human scale of nearby historic residential construction in the district.</i></p> <p><i>3. New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design.</i></p>	<p>The proposed building will be contemporary in design, and connected to 1801 & 1805-1809 via a steel and glass stair tower. The form of the new building will be rectangular with the exception of the stair tower, which will connect perpendicularly with the building's main massing.</p> <p>The application states that the form of the building is tall and slender which relates to the historic industrial buildings found within the district. While there are industrial buildings found within the district, the block context of the subject site is not industrial, but rather commercial and residential. The neighboring buildings reflect these uses.</p> <p>The new construction will feature projecting front balconies.</p>
Height, Width, Proportion, & Massing, pg. 47, #1-3	<p><i>1. New residential construction should respect the typical height of surrounding residential buildings.</i></p> <p><i>2. New residential construction should respect the vertical orientation typical of other residential properties in surrounding historic districts.</i></p> <p><i>3. The cornice height should be compatible with that of adjacent historic buildings.</i></p>	<p>The subject property is located within the B-5 (Central Business) zoning district which allows for new construction up to five stories. The proposed building will be five stories in height which is taller than the neighboring historic buildings which are 2-3 stories. Staff supports additional height in this location in order to increase density and dwelling units; however, finds that five stories is too tall and out of context for this location. Staff believes that a four-story building may be more appropriate and would be a more gradual step-up from the existing historic buildings. <u>Staff recommends that the proposed new construction be reduced in height by at least one-story.</u></p> <p>Staff notes that there is a larger multi-family building located across E. Broad Street. That property is not located in a COHD.</p> <p>There are newer five story buildings near the intersection of E. Grace and 20th Streets; however, the existing context for those new buildings consisted of taller industrial buildings.</p> <p>The new construction does not feature a traditional cornice feature, however It appears from the drawings that the floors of the new building will generally align with the neighboring dwellings on 18th street.</p>

Materials and Colors, pg. 47, #2-4	<p><i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district</i></p> <p><i>3. Paint colors used should be similar to the historically appropriate colors already found in the district.</i></p> <p><i>4. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted for use in City Old and historic Districts. Other synthetic siding materials with a smooth, untextured finish may be allowed in limited cases, but approval by the Commission is always required.</i></p>	<p>While a final material selection was not provided, the application states that the intent is to use metal and glass in order to relate to industrial styles in the district. While there are other new construction projects in and around the Shockoe Valley COHD that use metal and paneling, Staff notes that the predominant material used on historic industrial buildings in the district is brick.</p> <p>Using a material on a new building that is different than that used on neighboring historic buildings is a way to differentiate the new from the old; however, in this instance, given the height and contemporary design of the building, staff finds that cladding the building in brick would be an appropriate means of relating the new back to the old, while the overall contemporary design adequately differentiates it. <u>Staff recommends that the new construction use brick as a cladding material.</u></p>
New Construction, Porches and Porch Details, #5, pg. 49	<i>5. Porch roofs are encouraged to utilize standing- or flat-lock metal seam roofs that are hand-seamed, or closely approximate handseaming.</i>	The new construction will not feature any covered front porches.
New Construction, Doors and Windows, #3, pg. 49	<i>The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on free standing, new construction should be compatible with patterns established within the district.</i>	The doors and windows on the new construction will be vertically aligned. Other than the front façade of the building, which will feature large windows, the other elevations will have smaller windows. Staff finds the windows to be small and not proportionate to the overall scale of the building. <u>Staff recommends that larger windows be used on the northern, southern elevations.</u> An elevation drawing of the eastern façade was not provided. <u>Staff recommends that an elevation drawing of the rear eastern elevation be provided for final review.</u>
Mechanical Equipment, pg. 68	<i>The visual impact of new mechanical equipment should be minimized to protect the historic character of the district.</i>	The new construction will have a 'flat' roof with parapets to shield rooftop equipment and other items from view. The trash/recycling area will be located at the alley and screened from view.
The Secretary of the Interior Standards For	<i>New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the</i>	The new construction will be joined to 4 existing historic buildings by a five-story hyphen that will serve as a stair tower. As

Rehabilitation #9	<p><i>property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.</i></p>	<p>designed, the new construction will have minimal physical impact on the historic buildings; however, Staff has concerns how the overall scale of the building will impact 1801 E. Broad Street, a former public Bath House (Branch Bath House ca. 1908). The Branch Public Bath house's exterior is intact and it is a contributing member to the Shockoe Valley and Tobacco Row National Historic District. The building features its original men's and women's double entrances along E. Broad Street, oversized eaves and brackets, and a concrete relief sign on the Broad Street elevation. Perhaps the most interesting feature is the massive rear chimney. Chimneys help tell a visual story of the development of buildings, specifically prior to indoor heating and cooling. In this case, the Branch Bath house used coal to fuel boilers that heated the water used inside. The massive chimney tells this story; its size ensuring that the large amounts of smoke from the burning coal were released high above the residential rooftops and streets. Currently this Chimney is the tallest structure on the subject block.</p> <p>As submitted, the new building will be constructed adjacent to this chimney and will be taller. The new construction will obscure and overwhelm the chimney, which is a critical feature of 1801 E. Broad in telling its history. <u>Staff recommends that the applicant consider ways to further minimize the impact of the new construction on the chimney attached to 1801 E. Broad Street</u> (See figure 2).</p> <p>Staff notes that if the building was reduced to four stories, the height may be subordinate to the chimney.</p>
----------------------	---	---

Figures



Figure 1. 1801 E. Broad Street. Chimney Source: VCRIS



Figure 2. 1801 E. Broad Street. Chimney Source: VCRIS



Figure 3. 1801 & 1805-1809 e. Broad, Broad Street Elevations



Figure 4. Site as seen from 18th Street