



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

11. COA-120503-2022	Conceptual Review	Meeting Date: 11/22/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Will Gillette/ Mark Baker	
Project Description	Construct a new three story attached dwelling.	
Project Location		
Address: 2210 E. Marshall Street		
Historic District: Church Hill North		
High-Level Details: <p>The applicant requests conceptual review to construct a new three-story, contemporary dwelling which will be attached to the east elevation of an ca. 1860 freestanding brick Greek Revival dwelling.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Conceptual Review	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, 804-646-6569	
Previous Reviews	Staff administratively approved in-kind exterior work at 2214 E. Marshall Street in October 2022.	
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The new construction be set back further than 2214 E. Marshall to give deference to the historic dwelling. • A building form that is more compatible with the house at 2214 E. Marshall St. should be implemented due to the close proximity of the new construction to the historic dwelling. • The new construction be brick or clad in horizontal siding, which are the two most common materials found in the district. • The canopy material be specified for final review. • Staff recommends that he more detailed information on the windows and doors be submitted. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff recommends that the location of all HVAC equipment be submitted with the final review.
--	--

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Siting, pg. 46, #2-3	<p><i>2. New residential infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimum setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.</i></p> <p><i>3. New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site.</i></p>	<p>The new construction will face the most prominent street, E. Marshall Street.</p> <p>The new construction will generally respect the prevailing front yard setbacks of the block. It will be proud of 2214 E. Marshall Street.</p> <p>In the current configuration, the new construction will only be attached to the existing building on the front side bay which minimizes the impact to the side elevation of 2214 E. Marshall which has one original window opening. There will be a small walkway/court between the new construction and 2214 E. Marshall.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the new construction be set back further than 2214 E. Marshall to give deference to the historic dwelling.</u></p>
Form, pg. 46, #1-3	<p><i>1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district.</i></p> <p><i>2. New residential construction should maintain the existing human scale of nearby historic residential construction in the district.</i></p> <p><i>3. New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design.</i></p>	<p>The new construction will be three stories with a recessed third story and will be two bays wide; one bay will project out from the front of the building.</p> <p>There are examples of projecting bays to the east of the proposed building, specifically the grouping of Victorian dwellings of 2200-2208 E. Marshall Street.</p> <p>This proposal features a recessed third floor on the front façade. Staff finds this form to not be in-keeping with historic forms found on the subject block. While this form has been approved in other districts, <u>Staff recommends that a form that is more compatible with the house at 2214 E. Marshall St. should be implemented due to the close proximity of the new construction to the historic dwelling.</u> The new dwelling should be visually subordinate and give deference to the existing historic building.</p>

		The new construction will maintain the human scale of the block by including a small covered front porch.
Height, Width, Proportion, & Massing, pg. 47, #1-3	<p><i>1. New residential construction should respect the typical height of surrounding residential buildings.</i></p> <p><i>2. New residential construction should respect the vertical orientation typical of other residential properties in surrounding historic districts.</i></p> <p><i>3. The cornice height should be compatible with that of adjacent historic buildings.</i></p>	<p>The new construction is taller than the surrounding dwellings. The new construction, since attached to a historic building, should be visually subordinate and have a compatible height. <u>Staff recommends that the height of the new construction be decreased.</u></p> <p>The new construction will respect the vertical orientation of other buildings on the block.</p> <p>The cornice of the new construction will not align with 2214 E. Marshall. There are examples of varying cornice heights on the subject block given the grace change from east to west.</p>
Materials and Colors, pg. 47, #2-4	<p><i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district</i></p> <p><i>3. Paint colors used should be similar to the historically appropriate colors already found in the district.</i></p> <p><i>4. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted for use in City Old and historic Districts. Other synthetic siding materials with a smooth, untextured finish may be allowed in limited cases, but approval by the Commission is always required.</i></p>	<p>The new construction will be clad in horizontal siding, and will have vertical siding on the front projecting bay. Staff finds that vertical siding is not consistent with materials found in the COHD. <u>Staff recommends that the new construction be brick or clad in horizontal siding, which are the two most common materials found in the district.</u></p>
New Construction, Porches and Porch Details, #5, pg. 49	<p><i>5. Porch roofs are encouraged to utilize standing- or flat-lock metal seam roofs that are hand-seamed, or closely approximate handseaming.</i></p>	<p>The front porch and the roof top terrace will feature canopies. <u>Staff recommends that the canopy material be specified for final review.</u></p>
New Construction, Doors and Windows, #3, pg. 49	<p><i>The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on free standing, new construction should be compatible with patterns established within the district.</i></p>	<p>Limited information was given on the windows and doors; however, the windows appear to have a 1/1 configuration and doors have large windows, both which are appropriate design for the district. <u>Staff recommends that he more detailed information on the windows and doors be submitted.</u></p>

Mechanical Equipment, pg. 68	<i>The visual impact of new mechanical equipment should be minimized to protect the historic character of the district.</i>	<u>Staff recommends that the location of all HVAC equipment be submitted with the final review.</u>
------------------------------	---	---

Figures



Figure 1. 2214 E. Marshall Street



Figure 2. 2214 E. Marshall Street



Figure 3. Neighboring buildings



Figure 4. Neighboring buildings



Figure 5. South side of E. Marshall Street



Figure 6. South side of E. Marshall Street