



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

10. COA-120505-2022	Final Review	Meeting Date: 11/22/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Will Gillette, Baker Development Resources	
Project Description	Renovate the exterior of an existing multi-family building.	
Project Location		
Address: 3025 E Franklin Street		
Historic District: St. John's Church		
High-Level Details: The applicant proposes to rehabilitate a brick and CMU multi-family building ca. 1968. Fiber cement lap siding will be installed over the CMU exterior and new asphalt shingle will be installed on the roof. The applicant proposes to add decorative dormer windows to the existing low-pitch gable roof. Existing windows will be removed and enlarged, replaced with 1/1 aluminum clad wood windows. The building is listed as non-contributing in the St. John's Church National Register of Historic Places Registration Form		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Samantha Lewis, samantha.lewis@rva.gov , (804) 646-5207	
Previous Reviews	The CAR approved the construction of this building in 1968.	
Conditions for Approval	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff recommends that a final window schedule with associated labeled plans be submitted for administrative review and approval. • Staff recommends that final material and color specification be submitted for administrative review and approval. • Staff recommends against the use of dormer windows. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff recommends that the canopy be rehabilitation in-kind, and any change to the current design be submitted for administrative review and approval. • Specifications on any hardscaping, HVAC, and trash receptacles be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval, as well as associated screening.
--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for New Construction: Residential, Form, pg. 46	<p><i>New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the historic district. Building form refers to the specific combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building. Form is greatly influenced by the architectural style of a given structure.</i></p> <p><i>New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design. In Richmond, porches were historically an integral part of residential design and provide much of the street-level architectural character of Richmond's historic districts.</i></p>	<p>The general form of the building will not be altered by this rehabilitation; however, the applicant is proposing to install 4 dormer windows to the front and rear elevations. Dormer windows on “frame” buildings in the St. John’s Church COHD are not common, and they would alter the existing roof form of the building. Staff finds that the use of dormer windows in the location are inappropriate, and the exclusion of dormer windows from the plan would give reference to the original form of the building. <u>Staff recommends against the use of dormer windows.</u></p> <p>Furthermore, Staff was able to locate the original COA approval for the construction of this building. The approval was specifically conditioned to include an a-frame roof.</p> <p>The rear deck and stairs is proposed for removal. Staff notes that the configuration of these stairs has change over the years, so the current configuration is not original.</p> <p>There is an existing canopy on the front elevation that appears to be retained as part of the rehabilitation. <u>Staff recommends that the canopy be rehabilitation in-kind, and any change to the current design be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
Standards for New Construction: Residential, Siting, pg. 46	<p><i>3. New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site.</i></p>	<p>The existing building currently faces the neighboring properties to the North. The applicant doesn’t propose to alter the orientation of the building/entrances. Staff finds it appropriate to leave the main entrances in their current location.</p>
Standards for New Construction:	<p><i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually</i></p>	<p>The applicant proposes to clad the CMU building with horizontal fiber cement siding.</p>

Materials & Colors, pg. 47	<i>compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</i>	<p>Staff finds that this material is in-keeping with the COHD.</p> <p>The existing roof is clad in asphalt shingles. The applicant proposes to install a new asphalt shingle roof.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that final material and color specification be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
New Construction, Doors and Windows, #4, pg. 49	<i>4. Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged.</i>	<p>The applicant is proposing to expand the existing window openings vertically. While altering existing masonry openings, Staff finds that this building is non-contributing to the St. John's Church COHD, and the new proposed windows are more in-keeping with window dimensions found elsewhere in the district. It appears that some window openings on the rear elevation will not be altered, however will be replaced. The applicant has provided a window schedule, however it doesn't coordinate with the plans. <u>Staff recommends that a final window schedule with associated labeled plans be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u></p> <p>All new windows will be aluminum clad wood, replacing the existing, what appear to be, metal sliding windows.</p> <p>The 4 exterior doors on the first and second floors of the rear façade will be converted into windows.</p>
Standards for Site Improvements pg. 76	8. Landscape design should enhance the streetscape and contribute a strong aesthetic along street frontages. Appropriate landscaping should buffer the visual severity of surface parking lots from view. Vacant lots, large expanses of blank wall and other unattractive streetscape features (i.e. utilities, rear yard trash depots, etc.) can also be screened effectively with appropriate landscaping.	<u>Staff recommends that specifications on any hardscaping, HVAC, and trash receptacles be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval, as well as associated screening.</u>

Figures

Figure 1. Façade photo. Facing wooded area.



Figure 2. rear façade, facing N 31st Street.



Figure 3. 1924-1925 Sanborn map
N/A. Building was built in 1968.

Figure 4. Similar building altered in 2016.

