




Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

3. COA-120546-2022	Final Review Meeting Date: 11/22/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Louise Lockett-Gordon
Project Description	Construct a pergola.
Project Location	
Address: 3833 Hermitage	
Historic District: Hermitage Road	
High-Level Details: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant requestS approval to construct a pergola off the side of a ca. 1923 Craftsman style dwelling The pergola will be simple in design and will be visible from Hermitage Road, projecting above a privacy fence. The work has been completed without review and approval by the Commission of Architectural Review. It appears that a portion on the eave has been cut into and removed to accommodate a post for the pergola. 	
Staff Recommendation	Denial
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov , (804) 646-6569
Previous Reviews	<p>The Commission reviewed an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness in response to a violation for the replacement of a historic concrete tile roof with asphalt shingles. The Commission partially approved the request, approving the general exterior rehabilitation, and denying the installation of asphalt shingles; requesting that they be removed and replaced with a roofing material that better resembles the original. As of November 2022, the roof violation has not been abated.</p> <p>Staff observed that a pergola had been constructed without approval and reached out the owner, advising that a COA would be required for the work.</p>
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff recommends <i>denial</i> of the current configuration of the pergola, and that the damaged eave be repaired to its original condition.

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Outbuildings Pg. 51, #1-3	<p><i>Outbuildings Outbuildings should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site.</i></p> <p><i>Newly constructed outbuildings should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i></p> <p><i>New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property.</i></p>	<p>The <i>Guidelines</i> offer very little guidance about small, auxiliary structures such as arbors and pergolas. It does, however, note that outbuildings should be compatible with the design of the major buildings on the site, and respect the materials and colors of the main structure. The <i>Guidelines</i> also suggests that new auxiliary structures should be located to the rear or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary to the main residence. The pergola is subordinate to the house on the site, and the proposed design, materials, and color of the pergola complement the residence. <u>Staff is supportive of the overall, scale, and design of the pergola. However its installation should not damage historic materials.</u></p> <p>It appears that new lattice has also been added atop the existing privacy fence as means of additional screening of the rear deck and pergola.</p> <p>At this time the pergola is not painted or stained. This may be to allow the wood to weather.</p>
Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation	<p><i>2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.</i></p> <p><i>5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.</i></p> <p><i>9. New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.</i></p>	<p>A character defining feature of many craftsman style residences are prominent wide, unenclosed eave overhangs. This feature is present on 3833 Hermitage Rd.</p> <p>In the images submitted by the applicant and on a site visit to the subject property, it was observed that one of the posts supporting the pergola was constructed through the existing eave. A notch appears to have been cut into the eave to accommodate the pergola's post.</p> <p>Staff finds that the current configuration of the pergola damages historic materials and architectural features that characterize the property. <u>Staff recommends denial of the current configuration of the pergola, and the eave be repaired to its original condition.</u></p>

Figures



Figure 1. Historic Photo, 3833 Hermitage Road



Figure 2. Deteriorated Concrete Tile Roof, 3833 Hermitage Road. Before



Figure 3. New asphalt shingles, 3833 Hermitage Road (After)



Figure 4. Notch cut into existing eave to accommodate pergola.

