



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

10. COA-109609-2022	Final Review	Meeting Date: 4/26/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Manuch Amir	
Project Description	Construct a new 2-story rear garage.	
Project Location		
Address: 3820 Hermitage Rd.		
Historic District: Hermitage Rd.		
High-Level Details: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant is proposing to construct a two-story outbuilding to the rear of a ca.1928 Italian Renaissance Revival Style Single-Family Dwelling. The outbuilding will feature a one-car garage, workshop space, and second-story living quarters. 		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alyson Oliver, alyson.oliver@RVA.gov , 804-646-3709	
Previous Reviews	<p>A request for a rear, detached, two-story garage was approved by CAR in October 2015. The applicant has noted the following changes from the originally approved design:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed façade materials have been updated. The original design proposed an all-brick building. The new design incorporates fiber-cement shingles and board and batten panels. The original design included a second story porch with an exterior stair. This has been removed from this design. The new design includes a port-cochere. The locations of the windows have been revised. The garage door design has been revised. <p>This application was conceptually reviewed at the March 2022 meeting, where members of the Commission suggested the applicant revise the plans to: (i) incorporate a roof style and material that is either distinctly different from the main dwelling or is substantially similar to the main dwelling; and (ii) simplify the exterior cladding to only incorporate one siding material. The applicant has responded to these suggestions by: (i) updating the roof to be clad in standing seam metal; and (ii) removing the second-story fiber cement shingles and replacing them with vertical siding to match the first-floor siding.</p>	

Staff Recommendations	<p>Staff recommends this request be approved with the following conditions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Final material and color selection for the roof and siding to be submitted to staff for review and approval. • Final window specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval.
------------------------------	--

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Residential Outbuildings, Pg. 51, #1-3	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>1. Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos and other auxiliary structures, should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection.</i> <i>2. Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i> <i>3. New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary structures.</i> 	<p>The proposed outbuilding will be located to the rear of the existing dwelling, which is compatible with other outbuildings in the surrounding area. Staff also notes that the scale of the proposed outbuilding is compatible with other outbuildings found in the surrounding area.</p> <p>The existing dwelling, which was built circa 1928, features an Italian renaissance revival design. Its plan is rectangular with a flanking porte-cochere and side porch. It is clad in stucco and has a hipped, Spanish-style roof with barrel tiles.</p> <p>The proposed outbuilding has been updated to use vertical board and batten fiber cement siding on the exterior of the building. <u>Staff recommends that final material and color selection for the siding to be submitted to staff for review and approval</u></p> <p>The proposed outbuilding features a cross-gable roof clad standing seam metal. This modifications from the March 2022 meeting (which proposed barrel tiles on the roof) was made to address the commission's suggestions that the roof be distinctly different from the main dwelling. Staff is supportive of the design and <u>recommends that final material and color selection for the roof be submitted to staff for review and approval.</u></p> <p>The proposed design will features a porte-cochere, which will be minimally visible and is compatible with the design of the existing dwelling.</p> <p>The windows on the outbuilding are six-over-one, which matches the windows on the existing dwelling. <u>Staff requests that final window specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval.</u></p>

Figures



Figure 1. Existing Dwelling



Figure 2. Previously approved outbuilding.



Figure 5. Ca. 1950s image from Assessor's office



Figure 6. Ca. 1970s image from HRF