



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, May 22, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Call to Order

James Klaus, the Acting Chairman, called the meeting to order at 3:30 pm.

Roll Call

Present -- 7 - * Sanford Bond, * Gerald Jason Hendricks, * James W. Klaus, * Andrew Ray McRoberts, * Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Carey L. Jones and * Ashleigh N. Brewer
Absent -- 2 - * David C. Cooley and * Joseph Yates

Approval of Minutes

January 16, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Jones, that the January Quarterly meeting minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

February 27, 2018

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that the February minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

March 27, 2018

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that the March minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

April 10, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

The April quarterly meeting minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

April 24, 2018

The April meeting minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

Review of National Register Nominations

[NR 2018-02](#) Manchester Commercial and Residential Historic District 2018 Expansion

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Kim Chen stated that as a Certified Local Government, as a courtesy, the Commission is given an opportunity to review and comment on National Register Nominations.

The nomination was for the Manchester Commercial and Residential Historic District 2018 Expansion. This area contains a diverse mixture of building types, building forms, and architectural styles. The Commission briefly commented on the amount of vacant land that was included within the proposed expansion, noting that these properties would not be eligible for tax credits regardless. The Commission supported the nomination's eligibility under Criterion A and C: A for being associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history and C for architectural merit.

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks that a recommendation for approval be forwarded to the Virginia Department of Historic Resources for reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

[OHD 2018-01](#) 1222 East Marshall Street - Amendment of White House of the Confederacy Old & Historic District

Attachments: [Amendment Request and Staff Report](#)

Request to Amend the White House of the Confederacy Old and Historic District

Ms. Chen stated that the proposal requests the removal of the museum building surrounding the White House of the Confederacy from the City Old and Historic District. Upon removal of the museum building from the Old and Historic District, the White House of the Confederacy and the gardens that accompany it would still remain within the Old and Historic District. MCV planning staff revealed that the back portion of the museum building would continue to be used by the White House of the Confederacy, but the rest of the museum building would be used by MCV short term as a staging point for contractors and architects while they work on major new buildings on the campus. Afterwards, the remainder of the museum building would be adapted as a training location for staff and students on the campus itself.

Staff, however, remained concerned about the future of the museum building. The museum's design responds to the back portico and the White House itself and was designed to enclose the garden space and create an area of tranquility. When the City Old and Historic District was established in 1970, the boundaries that were used were the same as the boundaries of the property when it was sold in 1894 to the Confederate Memorial Literary Society. Ms. Chen affirmed that the primary purpose of the Commission of Architectural Review is to protect and preserve historic properties. To protect and preserve historic buildings, staff believes it necessary to have buffers around them and the museum building serves the function of a buffer for the White House of the Confederacy. Staff expressed concerns that by allowing for the reduction of a district, the

Commission would set a precedent that would lay the groundwork for a cascade of future requests for removal from Old and Historic Districts. Therefore, staff recommended denial of the proposal to the Planning Commission.

The Chairman asked the applicant if he would like to speak.

Rob Banachia, representing the museum, urged the Commission to accept the museum's proposal. He insisted that only forty percent of the museum building actually lies within the boundaries of the Old and Historic District. He further insisted that the slippery slope argument suggesting that the museum's removal from the Old and Historic District would open the door to many other removals from Old and Historic Districts does not apply, because the request for removal is from a museum organization whose standing purpose is the preservation of history. A certain amount of deference, from Mr. Banachia's perspective, should be given to the American Civil War Museum and its mission of preserving the White House in perpetuity.

Mr. Banachia explained that the museum's current request for removal grew out of a desire to construct a new museum building in a different location that would more adequately house the museum's exhibits. He admitted to being unable to guarantee indefinite preservation of the museum building but disagreed with the claim that the museum building is necessary as a buffer. The Zoning Ordinance, he alleged, expressly contemplates the repeal and amendment of Old Historic and District boundaries, and he maintained that his request is, therefore, consistent with the spirit of the ordinance.

Cyane Crump, Executive Director of Historic Richmond, stated that as a matter of policy, she is concerned about any proposal that would reduce, rather than expand, a historic district.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Chairman stated that as the Commission of Architectural Review, it is their role to preserve historic districts, and therefore, it would be problematic for the Commission to give a recommendation to reduce a district. Mr. Hendricks added that the negative space from buildings adjacent to a historic building is just as vital to historic preservation as the preservation of the historic building itself. Mr. Johnson agreed that although the museum's mission may be to preserve certain historic exhibits, the Commission's historic preservation interests are broader and independent of the museum's interests.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that a recommendation for denial be forwarded to the Planning Commission for reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Chen announced that Chelsea Jeffries will be the Acting Secretary of the Commission of Architectural Review. Ms. Chen further announced that the Commission is seeking to fill several vacant positions in the coming months.

Administrative Approvals

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries noted that staff received multiple complaints concerning textured siding installed at 2300 Venable Street and 727 North 22nd Street. Complaints about 2300 Venable Street continue to come forward, and the Permits and Inspections Division is currently addressing issues with the property.

Other Committee Reports

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

Chairman James Klaus announced the presence of one item, COA-034624-2018, 2403 East Grace Street on the consent agenda.

The Chairman invited the Commission to suggest projects that they would like to move from the regular agenda to the consent agenda.

- a) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the second item, COA-034553-2018, 523 North 28th Street to the consent agenda. Mr. Hendricks seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item.
- b) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the fourth item, COA-034555-2018, 15 North Boulevard to the consent agenda. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item.
- c) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the fifth item, COA-034717-2018, 2609 Monument Avenue to the consent agenda. Chairman Klaus seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item.
- d) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the eighth item, COA-034581-2018, 2018 East Broad Street to the consent agenda. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item, with Mr. Hendricks opposed.
- e) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the tenth item, COA-034575-2018, 617 West 21st Street to the consent agenda. Ms. Jones seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item.
- f) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the eleventh item, COA-034682-2018, 413 Chimborazo Boulevard to the consent agenda. Mr. Hendricks seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item.
- g) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the twelfth item, COA-034906-2018, 2113 Cedar Street to the consent agenda. Chairman Klaus seconded the motion. The commission approved moving the item, with Mr. Hendricks opposed.

There was no public comment.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 1 [COA-034624-2018](#) 2403 East Grace Street - Replace the roof of a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 2 [COA-034553-2018](#) 523 North 28th Street - Construct a storage shed in the rear yard.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 4 [COA-034555-2018](#) 15 North Boulevard - Enclose the first floor of a rear porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the glazing be continued up to the bottom of the skirt board, the revised design to be submitted to staff for administrative review. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 5 [COA-034717-2018](#) 2609 Monument Avenue - Demolish an existing porch and construct an addition at the rear of a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 8 [COA-034581-2018](#) 2018 East Broad Street - Rehabilitate and demolish a portion of a commercial structure.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: additional site drawings with grading details be submitted for staff review. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 10 [COA-034575-2018](#) 617 West 21st Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: details of the paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 11 [COA-034682-2018](#) 413 Chimborazo Boulevard - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the siding be smooth and unbeaded; the windows be aluminum clad wood windows as described in the project description not the PVC clad windows noted on the plans; the windows be simulated divided lite with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar; and a railing detail be provided for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 12 [COA-034906-2018](#) 2113 Cedar Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the siding be smooth and unbeaded; paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative approval; windows be wood one-over-one sash; all exposed treated wood material should be painted or opaquely stained; and the height of the retaining wall should not be increased and there should not be a brick row lock cap. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

REGULAR AGENDA

- 3 [COA-034629-2018](#) 1805 East Grace Street - Install a wooden wall mounted sign.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Ryan O'Rourke, the applicant, expressed concerns with staff's recommendation to install the sign lower, noting that the change in placement would look awkward. He confirmed, however, that he is certainly opposed to placing any signage that would detract from the historical significance of the surrounding buildings and is open to following staff's recommendations. Ms. Jones inquired if there was any illumination proposed. Mr. O'Rourke responded that lighting was not currently planned, though it could be added in the future. Mr. Hendricks asked if the proportions of the sign could be adjusted, as suggested by staff. Mr. O'Rourke responded that this would not work with the logo for the business.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Chairman noted, with the Commission's agreement, that the sign and placement can remain the same and proposed a condition where details on installation would need to be submitted to staff.

The Chairman made a motion to approve the application as submitted with the added condition that the building plans be submitted to staff for review and approval. Mr. McRoberts seconded the motion.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by McRoberts, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the sign be installed in a manner that does not damage the brick; and detail drawings of the proposed anchoring be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval prior to installation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 6 [COA-034549-2018](#) 123 West Broad Street - Replace wood windows with aluminum clad wood windows on a commercial structure.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Rubin Unowitz, the applicant, expressed concerns about the cost, the level of labor, and the difficulty in timely access to the windows associated with repairing the windows, arguing that replacement of the windows would be cheaper and more feasible. He further noted that there would be no significant difference in appearance of the windows if they were to be replaced, claiming that there are substantially similar materials that can be purchased to replace the window sashes.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Chairman stated that there is no evidence that the windows can't be repaired; he acknowledged the burden of the cost and labor but insisted that the Commission guidelines need to be followed, regardless. Mr. Hendricks added that he has fixed windows whose condition was far worse than the condition of the windows that the applicant wishes to replace.

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be denied for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 7 [COA-034564-2018](#) 717 North 27th Street - Replace windows and siding on a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(5/22/2018\)](#)

[Staff Report \(6/26/2018\)](#)

An applicant was not present to make a presentation for this application. Therefore, Mr. McRoberts moved to defer the application.

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Jones, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to be present and respond to the Commission's questions. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 9 [COA-034556-2018](#) 411 Chimborazo Boulevard - Construct a new two story frame garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(5/22/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(5/22/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans \(6/26/2018\)](#)

[Staff Report \(6/26/2018\)](#)

Robert Wise, the applicant, stated that he currently has the colors available for submission. He noted that there are a number of two story secondary structures that are within the historic district, suggesting that the height of the garage is consistent with outbuildings in the district. He further urged that it would be his preference to maintain the two stories. However, Mr. Wise agreed to the absence of decorative hardware on the garage door.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Mr. Hendricks recommended that the applicant use a roof form that is more compatible with the district. Chairman Klaus noted that the odd third window in the rear of the structure should be eliminated.

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the plans to propose a more compatible roof form, revise the fenestration on the alley elevation, and respond to concerns raised in the staff report.. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 13** [COA-035031-2018](#) 3613-3615 East Broad Street - Construct two detached single family homes.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Charles Tysinger, the applicant, expressed his support for staff's recommendations.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Chairman made a motion to approve the application with staff conditions and the added condition that the applicant adjust the space above the windows to about nine inches to a foot to make the space proportionally similar to neighboring windows. Neville Johnson seconded the motion.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded; paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative approval; the windows be aluminum clad wood; and the roofline be raised to create a space above the second story façade windows that is proportionately similar to adjacent structures, the design to be administratively approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Carey L. Jones and Ashleigh N. Brewer

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 14 [COA-034562-2018](#) 130 North 32nd Street - Demolish an existing garage and construct a new two story frame garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Matt Elmes, the applicant, stated that there are buildings nearby that do have board and batten siding that justify his use of board and batten siding. He further stated that the proposed structure's massing and materials are consistent with the massing and materials of other structures found in the district. During the applicant's presentation, Mr. Bond stated that horizontal lines and wider siding with a deeper reveal would de-emphasize the structure's height. The Chairman added that the applicant should reuse the existing steel in the design or cladding of the structure. Mr. Hendricks recommended raising the belt line to improve the appearance of the structure and suggested that it would be desirable to see a more traditional brick structure. He noted, however, that since the proposed construction is new, he would be more comfortable with a material that differs from the traditional brick.

Public comment: Brenda Johnson, a resident in the area, stated that she would prefer to see a brick structure, because brick structures are more compatible with the historic district. New construction, in her opinion, concerns her, especially if the new construction consists of a two story garage that is surrounded by historic homes.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Mr. McRoberts noted that he is not very fond of board and batten siding and admitted that the proposed structure would be lovely if it were a brick carriage house. The Chairman added that there is some precedent for two story structures in the neighborhood. He suggested that the proposed two story structure works in the neighborhood because there is no building on the other side of the street, which would prevent the two story structure from disrupting the neighborhood's layout.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 15 [COA-034552-2018](#) 813 North 24th Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Aaron Ogburn, the applicant, affirmed that he is only proposing to install windows with PVC sashes and claimed that the material is compatible with materials in the surrounding neighborhood. He further insisted that a gable roof would not be particularly noticeable on the proposed structure. He stated that he has no issues with a standing seam metal roof for the front porch.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Mr. Hendricks expressed his concern with seeing

a gutter at the front of the home and with the roof line. Mr. Bond suggested that the applicant consider a mansard roof for the proposed structure. The Chairman added that he would not wish for the roof to be excessively visible from the street and that a context perspective could demonstrate this.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 16 [COA-034576-2018](#) 3408 East Broad Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Alex Pardue, the applicant, expressed a deep appreciation for the Historic District and the lot that she purchased. She affirmed her desire to come up with a design that would lend a hand to the historic heritage of the area without completely reproducing historic elements and making the house look like it was built decades ago. She noted that the second set of French doors on the rear of the structure would be replaced with windows. She further explained that the third floor, in particular, is an important space for her, because she envisions growing her family in the home and living there for a very long time.

Public comment: Levon Johnson, a resident of the area, stated that many aspects of the proposed construction, including the 3rd floor balcony and bay windows, were incompatible with the historic district.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Chairman stated that a mixture of brick and siding is not typical in the district. Mr. Bond added that using the roof in an urban area is a nice idea. Mr. Klaus commented that the third story should not resemble a deck. Ms. Jones added that the structure should incorporate more architectural detail on the front of the building as it is a very detailed block.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 17 [COA-034578-2018](#) 600 North 28th Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Charlie Field, the applicant, noted his desire to cooperate with the staff recommendations and that he would give the Commission the necessary information. He then distributed revisions which addressed concerns raised in the staff report. The roof line and front window were the most significant revisions.

Renee Lamb, the owner, stated that she definitely took what the Commission and neighbors said into consideration, ensured that the setback would align with surrounding buildings, added a balcony in the back, removed the third floor, and vertically aligned all of the windows.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he

commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners stated that they find the design of the proposed structure beautiful and further suggested putting the application on the consent agenda next month.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

Adjournment

Mr. Klaus adjourned the meeting at 6:46 p.m.