



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, November 28, 2017

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

BEGINNING AT 3:30 P.M.

Call to Order

Mr. Klaus called the meeting to order at 3:31 p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 7 - * David C. Cooley, * Sanford Bond, * Bryan Green, * Gerald Jason Hendricks, * James W. Klaus, * Joseph Yates and * Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Absent -- 1 - * Andrew Ray McRoberts

Approval of Minutes

September 26, 2017

The September minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

October 10, 2017 (Quarterly Meeting)

The October quarterly meeting minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

October 24, 2017

The October minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

National Register of Historic Places Nominations

[NR 2017-6](#) Kenwyn (6 Amphill Road)

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Green commented that the building and landscape have changed over time but the integrity of the property is still intact. Mr. Cooley asked if there are other similar houses in the area which are individually listed. Mr. Green replied that there are not many, and there are not many listings in the area in general as resources tend to be too spread out for a district and not significant enough individually.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Green, that a recommendation of approval be submitted to the Virginia Department of Historic Resources. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Excused -- 1 - Joseph Yates

[NR 2017-7](#) St. Luke Building 2017 Update and Boundary Increase (900-904 St. James Street)

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Green, the author of the nomination, presented details of the property and the planned restoration. Mr. Klaus voiced his support for the restoration work that has been occurring in Jackson Ward, including historically significant properties such as this. Mr. Cooley inquired whether the residential structures will remain as a duplex. Mr. Green responded that it would, and that much of the historic fabric remains.

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that a recommendation of approval be submitted to the Virginia Department of Historic Resources. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Excused -- 1 - Joseph Yates

Abstain -- 1 - Bryan Green

[NR 2017-8](#) Lee Medical Building (1805 Monument Avenue)

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Green commented that commonly when a building is within a historic district but outside of the period of significance the district is amended rather than individually listing the building. He added that there would be a handful of other buildings that would become contributing as well if the district was amended.

Mr. Klaus commented that he did not feel the structure was distinctive enough to warrant individual listing.

Ms. Chen commented that a similar case was reviewed a few months prior where the building was within a district but outside of the period of significance and the Commission's recommendation was that the district be amended, however the board did ultimately list the building individually.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond, that the Commission submit a recommendation to the Virginia Department of Historic Resources that the building not receive individual recognition but the feasibility of expanding the period of significance for the existing district be explored to include the construction date of the Lee Medical Building. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

No -- 1 - David C. Cooley

Excused -- 1 - Joseph Yates

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts asked the Commission to review the proposed 2018 meeting dates.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired about the status of the ordinance change for her seat. Ms. Pitts replied that the paperwork was completed to allow for the legislation to be introduced in December.

[2018 CAR](#) Proposed 2018 Commission of Architectural Review Schedule

Attachments: [2018 Commission of Architectural Review](#)

Administrative Approvals

Mr. Klaus inquired about the length of the administrative approval report. Ms. Pitts replied that it is a new format generated by the city's EnerGov system and so this month may have some applications that overlap with last month's report. She explained that staff will work with the new system to try to make the reports more informative.

Enforcement Report

Other Committee Reports

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

BEGINNING AT 4:00 PM

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Bond, that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

- 3** [COA-018230-2017](#) 506 North 29th Street - Replace metal windows with aluminum clad windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(11/28/17\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(11/28/17\)](#)

[Application and Plans \(6/27/17\)](#)

[Staff Report \(6/27/17\)](#)

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Bond, that this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: metal casement windows, the product and design to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff, be installed. The motion carried by the following vote:

REGULAR AGENDA

- 2 [COA-022630a](#) 3207 1/2 Monument Avenue - Construct rooftop terrace.
[-2017](#)

Attachments: [Staff Report](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: details of the proposed roof material be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed treatment of the half walls be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and any changes to the gutters or roof form that may be required to meet zoning requirements be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus and Neville C. Johnson Jr.
- No --** 2 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 4 [COA-025773-](#) 3305 Monument Avenue - Construct a new garage, brick wall, and second
[2017](#) story entrance stairs.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the proposed garage doors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; a new design for the front wall and columns to include a wall no taller than 2' and columns no taller than 3'-6" be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the new door on the west elevation be wood with true or simulated divided lites; the posts on the proposed stairway be square and the structure be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color to be administratively approved; if the openings on the west elevation are bricked in, the brick be inset

and not toothed-in to the existing opening; the front door color be administratively reviewed and approved; the trim wrap be replaced in-kind with new metal or a composite material, the color to be administratively reviewed and approved; and a composite material to be administratively reviewed and approved be used in lieu of the proposed PVC. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

- 5 [COA-025849-2017](#) 1111 West Franklin Street - Amend previously approved plans to change exterior cladding material in rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the proposed fence design be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the color of the synthetic stucco be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and details of the proposed window and door material be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

No -- 2 - Bryan Green and Gerald Jason Hendricks

- 6 [COA-025848-2017](#) 1914 East Franklin Street - Install a new blade sign.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted provided that the following condition is met: the sign not be illuminated. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

No -- 2 - Bryan Green and James W. Klaus

- 7 [COA-026126-2017](#) 612 North 29th Street - Replace seven vinyl windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Cooley and Mr. Yates asked for clarification on the staff recommendations. Ms. Pitts stated that staff is recommending that the two windows on the facade only be a more compatible window material as they are the most visible windows.

Mr. Camm Tyler and Ms. Liz Tyler, the applicants, came forward to present the proposal. The applicants stated that they wished to replace their vinyl windows in-kind as the seals have broken on several of them and vinyl would be most cost-efficient. Ms. Tyler added that they also wish to maintain consistency with the window design as not all of the windows will be replaced.

Mr. Klaus inquired if the applicants would accept staff's recommendations now that they understand it is only the windows on the front that would not be in-kind. Ms. Tyler replied that they would need additional time to consider this option as the additional cost would be significant. Mr. Yates asked if it would be acceptable to the applicant if the application were deferred to allow them more time to research materials. The applicant replied that it would be acceptable. Mr. Klaus then stated that the remaining windows could be approved, and the windows on the facade be deferred.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor asked why the Commission was reviewing the application if they were proposing to replace the windows in-kind. Ms. Pitts replied that the chart in the guidelines does not address in-kind window replacement and the application could not be approved administratively as proposed.

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Green, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission approved the installation of the proposed new windows at the side and rear of the structure and deferred the review of the windows on the façade to allow the applicant the opportunity to explore the feasibility of installing another type of window with simulated divided lites. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

No -- 1 - David C. Cooley

- 8 [COA-026404-2017](#) 800 North 22nd Street - Amend previously approved rear and south elevations for the rehabilitation of a home and replace the front porch roof.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The Commission discussed the discrepancies between the approved drawing and what was built, including the proportions of the porch enclosure. Mr. Green commented that this is a common issue they have been seeing throughout the historic districts.

Mr. Mark Baker, a representative of the applicant, came forward to answer questions regarding the proposal. Mr. Baker stated that the front porch is experiencing water damage due to the failing roof. He also commented on the issues with the porch enclosure, including drafting problems and the property owner's limited experience in working with the Commission, but reiterated the owner's willingness to fix the issues.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired what elements of the front porch would need to be replaced

due to water damage. Mr. Baker replied that they would replace any rotten wood in-kind when replacing the roof.

Mr. Yates commented that he did not believe it was a drafting issue, rather the mistake was made during construction. Mr. Klaus commented that the Commission may wish to discuss this topic at a quarterly meeting. Mr. Yates added that the approved drawings were clear but what was constructed bears no resemblance to what was approved.

Mr. Klaus commented that staff's recommendations take the porch enclosure back to what was existing before rehabilitation, as the second story was already enclosed at the time. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor agreed, that the trim should be removed from the rear of the second floor but the first floor was a porch and so the design should be altered to reflect an open porch.

Mr. Bond commented that approving the design as built sets a dangerous precedent as it is not the Commission's fault that the applicant did not build it as approved.

Mr. Green commented that he would be willing to defer the application to allow the applicant additional time to create a plan, using the guidelines, that better captures the qualities of an enclosed porch.

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the plans to reflect the original approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

No -- 1 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

9 [COA-026402-2017](#) 2710 East Clay Street - Rehabilitate existing home and construct a two-story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission approved the addition, the conversion of a window to a door; and the one north most new window opening on the second story of the southeast elevation of the existing structure to provide the code required egress to the 2nd floor bedroom with the following conditions: the siding be smooth and without a bead; the proposed new door on the northeast elevation fit within the jambs of the existing window opening; and the window be true or simulated divided lite with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. The Commission denied the three additional proposed new openings on the southeast elevation of the existing structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

10 [COA-025771-2017](#) 3116-3118 East Marshall Street - Construct two duplexes.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Mary Lorino, the architect for the project, came forward to answer questions.

Ms. Lorino stated that the facade of the proposed duplex does not line up with the adjacent home but rather provides a transition between the setback of the home and the setback of the commercial structures. Mr. Green asked if 3116 could be set back further. Ms. Lorino replied that there is not enough room on the lot. Mr. Green then asked if the additional window on the facade suggested by staff could be incorporated. Ms. Lorino replied that it could probably be done. Mr. Green then asked if the entrance door to the second story unit could be moved around the corner. Ms. Lorino replied that as the duplexes will be on two separate lots it would create an encroachment and access issue.

Mr. Cooley inquired about the walkway connecting the existing storefront to the proposed duplex. Ms. Lorino replied that it is essentially required to meet zoning regulations and the occupant of the first floor apartment would then have access to the storefront to be used as a home office.

Mr. Hendricks inquired where the trash and mechanical units would be located. Ms. Lorino replied that the mechanical units would be on the roof and the trash would be in the rear.

Mr. Green asked if the door and the sidelight could be flipped at the entrance so the door could be lined up with the window above. Ms. Lorino replied that it could.

Mr. Hendricks inquired what the paving material for the courtyard would be. Ms. Lorino replied that it would most likely be brick.

Mr. Cooley inquired about the design of the windows for 3118. Ms. Lorino replied that they would be casement windows, to differentiate the facade from 3116 and to complement the storefront on the property.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if the balcony in the rear is a real projecting balcony. Ms. Lorino replied that it is not, it is just doors that open to the outside because there is very little space in the rear but it allowed for minimal outdoor interaction and ventilation.

Public Comment

Mr. Matt Jarreau came forward to speak in support of the project.

Mr. Weldon Chafe came forward to speak against the project, specifically regarding the proposed setback, the use of the alley, parking, and the potential for the garbage cans to encroach on the alley.

Mr. Kellman, the property owner, responded to Mr. Chafe's concerns regarding parking, explaining how the required parking would be provided on-site.

End Public Comment

Mr. Bond commented that the proposed setback provides a transition between the commercial and the residential buildings. Mr. Klaus inquired if this would be the only example of a residential building with a different setback in the area. Mr. Hendricks responded that there is another example on the other end of the block. Mr. Green responded that 3116 should be set back a little further, perhaps to align with the porch of the adjacent home. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor agreed, that the building should align with the porch, so the unique commercial building would be more prominent.

11 [COA-026277-2017](#) 1131 West Grace Street - Construct new multifamily building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Jeff Jacobs, a representative of the property owner, came forward to make a presentation. Mr. Jacobs informed the Commission of the church congregation's reasons and process for selling the subject property for development.

Mr. Walter Parks, the project architect, came forward to make a presentation. Mr. Parks summarized the changes that were made in response to staff's and the Commission's comments, including making the porch columns more prominent, increasing the building setback, and the accessibility of the front courtyard. He also explained the reasoning behind the corner casement windows, stating it was their desire to make the corners more prominent by using a contrasting design.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired about the depth of the proposed porches. Mr. Parks replied that they would be 5'7" deep.

Mr. Hendricks inquired if the parking garage will be entered at grade off of the alley. Mr. Parks replied that you would enter at grade and either go up or down, depending on the level of parking being accessed.

Mr. Green commented on the lack of clarity of the plans, adding that the cornice should be more prominent. Mr. Bond added that perspective renderings would also be helpful in better understanding the design.

Mr. Green commented that the building is too tall and too massive for the site within the context of Grace Street. Mr. Parks replied that this is the only block on Grace Street that does not have a taller building. Mr. Hendricks and Mr. Klaus agreed that the building is too tall.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that the plaza design needs to be adjusted and does not fit the context of the street. Ms. Lory Markham, a representative of the applicant, stated that the ground level along Grace Street is occupied space where if the plaza was lowered there would be unoccupied space along the street.

Mr. Green commented that the design does not fit the context of the site. The Commission commented generally on the height of the building and the facade's interaction with West Grace Street.

Public Comment

Mr. Rex Scudder, a member of the West Grace Street Association, came forward to comment on the project. He presented drawings of an alternate design that addressed

the Association's concerns with the project. Mr. Scudder's comments included breaking up the mass along the street, aligning the building with the adjacent structure, and adjusting the design of the porches.

Ms. Danielle Worthing, of Historic Richmond, came forward to comment on the project. Ms. Worthing spoke in support of the staff recommendations, adding that Historic Richmond supports a design derived from the Classical Revival style found in the district, the use of high quality materials, and additional ornamentation.

Mr. Yates inquired whether the parking levels could be lowered. The applicants replied that the physical restrictions of the parking levels would make that difficult. Mr. Parks added that they could investigate ways to reduce the height as much as possible.

Mr. Yates commented that the context requires greater ornamentation, including a prominent cornice. He also inquired about access to the balconies as some units did not appear to have doors onto the balcony.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor suggested terracing the front plaza to minimize the elevation change from street level. Mr. Green added that the open plaza should be visible from the street. The Commission and the applicants discussed potential changes to the plaza and the building's interaction with the street.

- 1 [COA-025770-2017](#) 2610 East Grace Street - Convert second story rear porch to screened porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 1/23/18](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report 1/23/18](#)

[Application and Plans - 11/28/17](#)

[Staff Report - 11/28/17](#)

The Commission commented that the applicant was not present and the application could be deferred.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to be present and respond to the Commission's questions. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Excused -- 1 - David C. Cooley

Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 7:33 p.m.