

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
October 28, 2014 Meeting**

1. **CAR No. 14-108** (A. & I. Cotterell) **2716 Monument Avenue
Monument Avenue Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Modification to approved garage plans**

Staff Contact: **W. Palmquist**

The applicant requests approval for the construction of a new garage at the rear of a residence located in the Monument Avenue Old and Historic District. This application was originally approved at the May 2014 CAR Meeting, but changes were made to the design which require CAR approval. The May 2014 staff report is attached for reference. The changes made in the design of the proposed garage including narrowing the width so that the existing swing gate to the alley would remain, removing from the design the entry door and two dormers at the front elevation, and installing a standing seam painted metal roof instead of a standing seam copper metal roof.

The construction of the new garage will necessitate the demolition and reconstruction of a portion of the brick wall that runs along the side and rear of the property. The proposal calls for the removal of a 24-foot section of wall on the west side of the property and a 28'-7" section of wall along the alley. Brick from the demolition will be salvaged and reused in the construction of the new brick garage. The existing wall cap detail will be incorporated into the design of the new garage. The proposed garage will have a standing seam painted metal roof (color to be determined), paneled garage doors on the alley side of the building, and carriage house-style garage doors on the south side of the garage. The garage will reach 14'-7" at the ridge of the roof. Portions of the south elevation will be visible from Monument Avenue.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* notes that new outbuildings should be compatible with the design of the main building on the site, and that the siting, massing, roof profile, materials, and colors of the new auxiliary building should be compatible with the existing outbuildings in the neighborhood (pg. 49, #1-2). Additionally, new garages should be subordinate to the main residence. The proposed garage is subordinate to the main building on the site, and the form of the building takes its cues from the residence. Though the proposed roof is standing seam metal and not slate, it references the gable roof form of the house.

Staff had initial concerns about the amount of wall being demolished, but the proposal to build the garage using brick salvaged from the walls and incorporate the cap detail into the design helps to mitigate those concerns. Staff recommends that the applicant return to staff with color selections and a brick

sample for final review and material. The request to add lattice to the top of the existing roof appears to exceed the height restrictions imposed by the City's zoning ordinance. Staff recommends that the applicant contact the zoning administrator to ensure that the work complies with all zoning regulations. Additionally, staff recommends that the brick used on the garage is differentiated from the salvaged brick used to rebuild the wall along the alley.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 114.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
May 27, 2014 Meeting**

11. **CAR No. 14-42** (A. & I. Cotterell) **2716 Monument Avenue
Monument Avenue Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Modify rear wall and construct new garage**

Staff Contact: **C. Easterling**

The applicant requests approval for the construction of a new garage at the rear of a residence located in the Monument Avenue Old and Historic District. The construction of the new garage will necessitate the demolition and reconstruction of a portion of the brick wall that runs along the side and rear of the property. The proposal calls for the removal of a 24-foot section of wall on the west side of the property and a 34-foot section of wall along the alley. Brick from the demolition will be salvaged and reused in the construction of the new brick garage. The existing wall cap detail will be incorporated into the design of the new garage. The proposed garage will have a standing seam copper roof, paneled garage doors on the alley side of the building, and carriage house-style doors and shed dormer windows on the south side of the garage. The garage will reach 14'-7" at the ridge of the roof. Additional changes to the existing wall include new lattice paneling and a relocated gate at the alley. Portions of the south elevation will be visible from Monument Avenue.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* notes that new outbuildings should be compatible with the design of the main building on the site, and that the siting, massing, roof profile, materials, and colors of the new auxiliary building should be compatible with the existing outbuildings in the neighborhood (pg. 49, #s1-2). Additionally, new garage should be subordinate to the main residence. The proposed garage is subordinate to the main building on the site, and the form of the building takes its cues from the residence. Though the proposed roof is standing seam metal and not slate, it references the gable roof form of the house.

Staff had initial concerns about the amount of wall being demolished, but the proposal to build the garage using brick salvaged from the walls and incorporate the cap detail into the design helps to mitigate those concerns. Ideally, the garage will look as if it has absorbed the wall. The applicant should specify for the Commission the style and materials for the windows on the side of the garage. Staff recommends that the applicant return to staff with color selections and a brick sample for final review and material. The request to add lattice to the top of the existing roof appears to exceed the height restrictions imposed by the City's

zoning ordinance. Staff recommends that the applicant contact the zoning administrator to ensure that the work complies with all zoning regulations.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions noted above, the work outlined in the proposal complies with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 114-930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.