



**Staff Report**  
**City of Richmond, Virginia**



**Commission of Architectural Review**

9. COA-146161-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 4/23/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Daniel Crisler	
Project Description	Construct a rooftop addition onto an existing one-story rear garage.	
Project Location		
Address: 3202 Monument Avenue		
Historic District: Monument Avenue		
<p><b>High-Level Details:</b></p> <p>The applicant requests approval to construct a roof top addition onto a one-story, brick garage located in the rear yard of a Colonial Revival brick dwelling, built circa 1926.</p> <p>The existing one-story brick garage is 20'x20' and located on the northwest corner of the property abutting the alley.</p> <p>The rooftop addition will be clad in horizontal, fiber cement siding and will have a shed roof form clad in TPO membrane roofing.</p> <p>Applicant proposes to relocate the existing person door from the east side of the garage to the south side of the garage facing the house due to the realignment of the rear privacy fence.</p>		
Staff Recommendation		
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, <a href="mailto:alex.dandridge@rva.gov">alex.dandridge@rva.gov</a> , 804-646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Conditions for Approval	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Any new gutters and downspouts be half round or box style with round downspouts. Staff recommends that the applicant consider using a darker color TPO roof rather than white.</li> <li>• New windows be wood or aluminum clad wood.</li> <li>• The existing windows and doors on the original portion of the garage and primary house be retained and repaired as needed. (the exception being the eastern garage door).</li> <li>• Final materials and colors for the proposed canopy be submitted for administrative review and approval.</li> <li>• New deck and stairs on the garage have a finished appearance with no exposed hardware and use a Richmond Rail design. Nailed-up pickets will not be permitted.</li> <li>• The deck structure be stained or painted a color that</li> </ul>	

	<p>compliments the building after the wood has appropriately weathered.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The existing eastern door opening on the garage not be removed but infilled with brick inset at least three to six inches from the wall face.</li> </ul>
--	---

## Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
<p><b>Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, #9</b></p>	<p><i>New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.</i></p>	<p>The existing one-story garage is a simple brick building. It has a low-pitched shed roof and parapet walls along the roof line. The addition will be constructed above these elements and will not obscure them from view. Cladding the rooftop addition in white fiber cement siding will differentiate the new portion of the building from the original brick portion.</p> <p>The addition will increase the size of the garage, however, will be similar in scale to the existing garage. There are historic examples of two-story rear garages within the Monument Avenue City Old and Historic District. The applicant has provided example images in their application.</p> <p>Even with the roof top addition, the rear garage will remain subordinate to the primary building on site.</p>
<p><b>Standards for New Construction: Residential, Siting, #1</b></p>	<p><i>Additions should be subordinate in size to their main buildings and as inconspicuous as possible. Locating additions at the rear or on the least visible side of a building is preferred.</i></p>	<p>The addition will not be in an inconspicuous location; however, it will be somewhat subordinate in size to the existing garage. Staff finds that a rooftop addition onto an accessory building that fronts an alley could be an acceptable way to ensure that these historic, small-scale structures are maintained and adapted overtime for continued use which will ensure their longevity. Very little historic material will be lost with the addition, and the original masonry portion will be evident.</p> <p>Even with the roof top addition, the rear garage will remain subordinate to the primary building on site.</p>
<p><b>Standards for New Construction: Residential, Form, #3</b></p>	<p><i>New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design. In Richmond, porches were historically an integral part of residential design and provide much of the street-level architectural character of Richmond's historic districts.</i></p>	<p>The existing garage and addition will have a few elements that face the alley. There will be a garage door which is common of garages in the alley. The south side of the garage and addition will have a raised deck and canopy cover that will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way, as it faces the interior of the yard. These elements may be minimally visible from Cleveland Street. <u>Staff recommends that the final materials and colors for the proposed canopy be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u> In addition, <u>staff recommends that the new deck and stairs on the garage have a finished appearance with no exposed hardware and use a Richmond Rail design. Nailed-up pickets will not be permitted.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the structure be stained or painted a color that compliments the building after the wood has appropriately weathered.</u></p>

<p><b>Standards for New Construction, Materials &amp; Colors, pg. 47</b></p>	<p>1. Additions should not obscure or destroy original architectural elements.</p> <p>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</p> <p>3. Paint colors for new additions should complement the historically appropriate colors used on the primary structure. Paint colors used should be similar to the historically appropriate colors already found in the district (see Painting Section starting on page 60).</p> <p>4. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted for use in City Old and Historic Districts. Other synthetic siding materials with a smooth, untextured finish may be allowed in limited cases, but approval by the Commission is always required.</p>	<p>The new addition will be clad in horizontal fiber cement siding painted white. Staff recommends that fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded.</p> <p>Roofing will be TPO Membrane. The roof will slope towards the alley. <u>Staff recommends that any new gutters and downspouts be half round or box style with round downspouts. Staff recommends that the applicant consider using a darker color TPO roof rather than white.</u></p> <p>Windows on the roof top addition will be double-hung one-over-one windows. Staff recommends that the new windows be wood or aluminum clad wood.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that existing windows and doors on the original portion of the garage and primary house be retained and repaired as needed.</u></p>
<p><b>Building Elements, pg. 69.</b></p>	<p>5. Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged.</p>	<p>There is an existing person door on the east elevation of the garage. The applicant will be adding a new rear fence and parking area. Currently, this door is behind the existing privacy fence. With the new fence configuration this door will be exposed to the alley way. For security, the applicant requests to infill this door and relocate it to the south, rear yard facing elevation. While infilling existing masonry openings is discouraged, Staff is overall supportive of the relocation of this door, as there is nothing specifically ornate or prominent about the door. However, <u>staff recommends that the current eastern door opening not be removed but infilled with brick inset at least three to six inches.</u></p>

*It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.*

## Figures (See Nex Page)

Figure 1. 3202 Monument Façade, 2016, Richmond Assessor's Office.



Figure 2. 3202 Monument Avenue, rear garage, 2015, Richmond Assessor's Office.



Figure 3. 1952 Sanborn Map. Rear Masonry Garage present as well as the frame rear porch.



