

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
July 24, 2018, Meeting**

12. **COA-036774-2018** (J. & A. Pardue) **3408 East Broad Street
Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Construct a new, 3-story single family dwelling.**

Staff Contact: **C. Jeffries**

Proposal: The applicant seeks approval for the construction of a new detached single-family house on a vacant lot in the Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District. From East Broad Street, the proposed structure appears to be a 2-story brick structure set on a high, brick foundation, with a balcony and a recessed frame third story. A proposed rooftop deck will be enclosed by a metal horizontal railing with brick columns. The structure has a 2-bay façade and a full façade front porch with a horizontal metal railing, double metal posts, and a wood lattice between brick piers. The façade has a simplified cornice and ranked double casement windows with transoms. The front door will be wood with three-quarter glazing, flanked with sidelights with a transom above. The window bay of the façade will project 1'-4". The rear of the dwelling appears to be four stories with a split-face block basement level. The dwelling will have wood casement and 1/1 double hung fiberglass windows and cementitious siding on the sides and rear. The recessed upper story will have a sloped façade clad in standing seam metal. The façade will be brick with 2 foot returns on the side elevations. The structure will have a low-pitched shed roof clad in TPO.

Surrounding Context: The proposed new construction will be located on the north side of East Broad Street on a narrow lot between two historic houses. Chimborazo Park is directly across East Broad Street from the subject lot. Buildings in the immediate area include houses with Late Victorian and Queen Anne stylistic elements. The adjacent property to the east at 3406 East Broad Street is one of the later historic houses in the block constructed in 1931 in the Classical Revival style. The single-family dwelling in a simplified Late Victorian Style at 3404 East Broad Street was approved by the Commission in 2015. The property at 3400 East Broad Street is representative of the more typical, demonstrative, frame, Late Victorian dwellings found in this prominent block fronting on Chimborazo Park.

Previous Reviews: The applicant came before the Commission on May 22, 2018 and June 26, 2018 with a proposal to construct a Colonial Revival inspired home. Several of the Commissioners expressed concerns with the design and visibility of the third story and roof deck. Commissioners also voiced concerns regarding the mixture of siding and brick not being typical for the district, and provided comments regarding the proposed architectural detailing. The Commission deferred the application at the June meeting.

Changes to the Plans: The applicant has modified the project as follows in response to concerns raised during the previous review:

- The Colonial Revival details have been removed to create a more contemporary design utilizing a simplified cornice, horizontal railings, and casement windows.
- The brick screening below the porch was replaced with wood lattice.
- The façade of the third story is now sloped and clad in standing seam metal.
- The transom window in the rear was eliminated.

The applicant is seeking **Final Review** for this project. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the “Standards for New Construction: Residential” on pages 46-51 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* utilizing the checklist below.

S=satisfies

D=does not satisfy

NA=not applicable

S D NA

 New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns in the surrounding district

The front yard setback is shown as 16 ½ feet which will match the surrounding structures. The minimal side yard setbacks appear to match the structures on the block. The owner is seeking an administrative variance to the side yard setback requirement on this narrow lot.

 Where the adjoining buildings have different setbacks, the setback for the new building should be based on the historical pattern for the block

The adjacent properties have similar setbacks.

 New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site

The structure addresses East Broad Street.

 New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district. Form refers to the combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.

The project utilizes some elements found on structures on the block including a front door with sidelights and transom, a full façade porch, and a 2-bay, asymmetrical façade. The majority of the houses on the block have decorative cornices and shed roofs or false mansard roofs. Staff finds that the proposed recessed third story and balcony have been designed to more closely resemble building forms found within the district. The majority of structures on this block are 2 or 2 ½ stories with a gable or false mansard roof and dormers. The sloped third story wall and metal cladding will appear similar to

a false mansard roof. In addition, the use of a parapet wall and a shorter railing creates the appearance more similar to a rooftop balustrade than a rooftop deck.

- New construction should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps.**

The proposed project incorporates human-scale elements including a front porch, a cornice, and front steps.

- New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding buildings**

The structure is similar in height to the structure to the west and significantly taller than the structure to the east. The block is characterized by a variation in heights, however structures are 2 or 2 ½ stories. The applicant has demonstrated that the third story will not be visible from the street, however it will be visible from the adjacent park. Staff finds that the contemporary design minimizes the impact of the third story.

- New construction should respect the typical width, organization of bays, vertical alignment and symmetry of surrounding buildings.**

The proposed dwelling is similar in width to the adjacent houses and maintains the 2-bay configuration, vertical alignment, and symmetry of the surrounding buildings.

- The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings should be compatible with patterns established in the district.**

The fenestration pattern on the rear elevation has been altered to remove a transom window. In addition, the windows on the façade are now proposed to be paired casement windows with transoms, to reflect the contemporary design. Staff finds that the fenestration pattern is compatible with patterns in the district.

- Porch and cornice heights should be compatible with adjacent buildings**

The porch and cornice heights are compatible with the varying porch and cornice heights of the adjacent structures.

- Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted.**

The applicant is proposing brick veneer on the façade with a two-foot return on both sides. The remainder of the structure will be clad in fiber cement siding. Though this combination of materials is not consistent with buildings found in the district, staff finds the sides of the structure will be minimally visible due to the proposed narrow side yard setbacks. Staff recommends a siding color closely matching the brick color be used. A brick sample and siding color should be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The applicant is also proposing wood and fiberglass windows with black sashes on the front and white on the rear and side. The proposed trim color is also black on the front

and white on the sides and rear. As black is not a color recommended for trim on the Commission's paint palette staff recommends a color that is consistent with the palette be used. The new trim color should be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The applicant is proposing wood lattice between brick piers under the front porch. Details of the proposed lattice should be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. Staff finds the proposed project responded to the Commission's concerns and is a building form compatible with the historic and new structures in the district and on the subject block.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the acceptance of the stated conditions, the application is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.