

**14. COA-053439-2019**

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

May 28, 2019

PROPERTY ADDRESS

2320-2326 Burton Street

DISTRICT

Union Hill

APPLICANT

S. Budwell

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jones

Commission of  
Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



PROJECT DESCRIPTION

**Renovate four existing, single-family attached residences.**

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant proposes to renovate four attached, single-family residences including: removal of the vinyl siding, porch columns, railing, and the porch deck.
- The applicant proposes to install wood siding on the front of the buildings and fiber cement siding on the sides and rear, to install new columns and Richmond Rail, and new brick pier supports for the porch.
- The applicant intends to paint the building colors from the approved palette.
- Proposed site improvements include a new dog-eared fence along the property line.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

**APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS**

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

None.

STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- The applicant utilize simple, square posts for the porch supports with the specifications to be submitted for staff review and approval.
- The applicant install wood lattice between, not in front, of the new brick piers.
- Staff recommends the applicant submit a paint scheme for the body, trim, and replacement porch materials including the columns, railings, and deck, and the fence using colors from the wood frame Italianate palette for staff review and approval.
- The vinyl shutters not be re-installed.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Standards for *Repair damaged elements instead of* The applicant proposed to remove the non-

Rehabilitation, Residential Construction, pg. 59 #7	<i>replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i>	original elements from the buildings, including the siding, columns, porch railing, and porch deck. The applicant has provided evidence that the original wood cladding is no longer extant and proposes to re-clad the building in wood on the front elevation and the sides and rear in smooth, fiber cement siding. Staff finds this is in keeping with the <i>Guidelines</i> .
Porches, Doors and Entrances, Inappropriate Replacement, pg. 101	<i>“Colonial” columns or suburban style wrought iron rails and fencing are often added when the original porch supports deteriorate. Such alterations to an historic structure are inappropriate.</i>	The applicant plans to install “Colonial” porch posts. Staff has found photographic evidence of an Italianate column with brackets. <u>Staff recommends that since there are no historic elements extant on the porch, the applicant utilize simple, square posts for the porch supports with the specifications to be submitted for staff review and approval.</u>
Porches and Porch Details, pg. 49 #2	<i>When designing a new railing for a new infill building, or for an existing building which has lost its railing and for which no documentary or physical evidence survives, the balusters in the traditional Richmond rail are generally rectangular in section (with the narrow dimension facing the street) or square.</i>	The applicant proposes to remove a deteriorated railing and install a Richmond Rail. Staff finds that this is in keeping with the <i>Guidelines</i> .
Paint, Frame Structures, pg. 63, #s 2, 4, and 6	<p><i>2. It is important that color selections blend with and complement the overall color schemes on the street.</i></p> <p><i>4. Number and variety of colors should be limited. With the notable exception of the Queen Anne style, traditional paint schemes do not use more than two or three colors.</i></p> <p><i>6. The handrails of wooden porch railings are often painted a dark color while the pickets are painted white or off-white.</i></p>	The applicant proposes to the paint the exterior of each of the four dwelling units a different color. Staff finds that this is not in keeping with <i>Guidelines</i> which call for a limited number and variety of paint colors. <u>Staff recommends the applicant submit a paint scheme for the body, trim, and replacement porch materials including the columns, railings, and deck, and the fence using colors from the wood frame Italianate palette for staff review and approval.</u>
Building Elements, Shutters, pg. 70 #22	<i>Metal and vinyl shutters are not recommended, particularly for the front façades of buildings.</i>	Staff recommends against the retention of the vinyl shutters, which will be removed as part of re-cladding the building, as they will create an appearance that is incompatible with the style of the building.
Decks, pg. 51 #s2 & 4	<p><i>2. Decks should complement the architectural features of the main structure without creating a false historical appearance. Decks should be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure.</i></p> <p><i>4. Deck sub-decking should be screened with wood lattice work or with brick piers.</i></p>	The applicant proposes to install new pressure treated porch decking as needed. Staff requests any new porch decking be painted or stained a neutral color. The applicant proposes to install new brick piers under the existing porch posts. <u>Staff recommends the applicant install wood lattice between, not in front, of the new brick piers.</u>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for

Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

---

## FIGURES



Figure 1. 2320-2326 Burton Street, front façade and porch railing.



Figure 2. Rear view



Figure 3. Side view