



# Commission of Architectural Review

8. COA-164459-2025	Final Review	Meeting Date: 5/27/2025
Applicant/Petitioner	Austin Farrell	
Project Description	Result of a violation: Replace original, deteriorated roofing with a new material.	
Project Location		
Address: 510 West 20 <sup>th</sup> Street		
Historic District: Springhill		
High-Level Details: <p>The applicant requests retroactive approval to replace an original hand-seamed metal roof with asphalt shingles, and a front porch roof with a standing-seam metal roof.</p> <p>The existing building is a frame, Colonial Revival, American Foursquare with a hipped roof, full-width front porch, and bb-siding ca. 1925.</p> <p>This work was completed without first obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Denial	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	<p>This application was scheduled for review by the Commission at the April 2025 meeting; however, was withdrawn due to an administrative error.</p> <p>A Notice of Violation and a Stop Work Order was posted to the property in March 2025 after the work had already been completed.</p>	
Staff Recommendations	Staff recommends denial of the proposed/installed roofing materials as the guidelines suggest that the roofs should be replaced with materials that match the original.	

## Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for Rehabilitation, Residential	<i>Retain original metal features such as cast iron porches and steps, metal cornices, roofs, roof cresting, window sash,</i>	The building originally featured a hand-seamed metal main roof, and a porch roof that was likely a terne coated

Construction, #3, pg. 59	<i>entablatures, columns, capitals, window hoods and hardware and the color and finish of all original materials.</i>	metal, but most recently appears to have been a rolled, or membrane roofing.  Both roofs have been replaced. The main roof now features asphalt shingles, and the front porch roof, standing-seam metal.
Building Elements, Roofs, Roof Replacement/  Reconstruction, #3 pg. 6	<i>Substitute materials may be used if the same kind of material is not technically feasible because the material is no longer being made. Substitute materials should match the original style and form as much as possible.</i>	Asphalt shingles are not an appropriate substitute material for hand-seamed metal roofing as standing seam metal roofing is still produced today and asphalt shingles do not accurately portray the visual qualities of a standing-seam metal roof.  <u>Staff finds that the replacement of the original metal roof with asphalt shingles is not in-keeping with the guidelines and recommends denial of this alteration for the reasons stated above.</u>
Building Elements, Roofs, Roof Repair, #'s 5 & 6 pg. 66	<i>5. The historic front and rear porches of many historic Richmond houses - particularly in the Jackson Ward and St. John's Church Old and Historic Districts- have shallow pitched metal roofs with flat seams (also called flat-lock seams). Flat seam metal roofs have a more homogenous appearance than the more typical standing seam metal roofs found on steeper slopes of the main roof.</i>	At appears that the front porch roof was replaced with a standing-seam metal roof. While the exact material of the original front porch roof is unknown, it appears that it had a flat/homogeneous appearance. The new metal roof that was installed creates shadow lines and a profile that was not previously present, and perhaps never present, on the front porch.  <u>Staff recommends denial of the replacement of the front porch roof with standing-seam metal.</u>  The roofs should be replaced with materials that match the original in design and material.

*It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.*

## Figures



Figure 1. Previous condition of 510 W. 20th Street.



Figure 2. Existing condition of 510 West 20th Street.

ROOF	
<input type="checkbox"/>	1 ASBESTOS
<input type="checkbox"/>	2 SLATE
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 METAL
<input type="checkbox"/>	4 TILE
<input type="checkbox"/>	5 BUILT UP
<input type="checkbox"/>	6 SLAG
OTHER (SPECIFY)	
FLOORS	

Figure 3. Assessor Card indicating metal roof.



Figure 4. 510 W. 20th Street, 1950s



Figure 5. Recently replaced metal roof in district.



Figure 6. Recently replaced metal roof, and an existing asphalt shingle roof installed pre district designation.