

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
January 24, 2017 Meeting**

13. **CAR No. 17-011** (M. Mages)

**3112 East Marshall Street  
St. John's Church Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:** **Construct a new single family dwelling.**

**Staff Contact:** **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to construct a single family dwelling on a vacant lot in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District. The residential character of the subject block consists of 2-story structures in a mix of Italianate and Queen Anne architectural styles. The structures on the even side of the block are primarily 3-bay structures while the structures on the odd side of the block include both 3-bay and 2-bay structures with double windows. The neighborhood is a mix of frame and brick structures, and Chimborazo Elementary School, a Beaux Arts brick institutional building, is located at the northern corner of the intersection of East Marshall and North 31<sup>st</sup> Streets.

The Commission conceptually reviewed the applicant's request to construct a three story frame Italianate inspired single family structure on October 25, 2016. The Commission had the following concerns:

- The three story height does not reflect the typical height in the area.
- If the building has a third story, it should be minimized and read as a small penthouse.
- The stairwell to the third story was not building form found in the district.

In addition to the concerns raised by the Commission, staff raised the following concerns in the staff report:

- The center entrance as proposed is an element that is not found on the majority of structures in the surrounding block as the primary entrance is typically found in an outer bay.
- Though lapped siding is a material that is found in the district, the mix of exposures is not something typically found in the district.

In response to the Commission's and staff's comments, the applicant has revised the plans as follows:

- The third story has been removed. The home will be 26'-11" in height which is similar in height to the adjacent structures
- The entrance has been moved to an outer bay.
- The proposed fiber cement siding has a consistent 7" exposure.

**Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted with the noted conditions.** Staff believes the proposed new construction is consistent with the

Commission's *Guidelines*. The proposed building with its three-bay composition and a single story full façade covered front porch incorporates the building form found on the subject block and utilizes materials compatible with the district. The home is a height compatible with the adjacent structures and is setback to align with these structures. The applicant has responded to the Commission's concerns regarding the incompatible third story by removing this element from the proposal.

Staff recommends the following conditions of approval:

- The siding be smooth and unbeaded.
- A paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.
- The windows be simulated or true divided lite.
- The porch roof be black or grey membrane.
- Cornice details be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.
- Deck shall meet the Commission's deck *Guidelines* to include sub-decking to be screened with wood lattice work or with brick piers and the deck to be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.