

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
March 24, 2015, Meeting**

12. **CAR No. 15-032** (M. & P. Prescott)

**3000 Libby Terrace
St. John's Church Old & Historic District**

Project Description: **Replace roofing in-kind, install gutters,
and replace doors**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate an existing garage in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District. The proposed work includes repairing or replacing with in-kind materials the slate roof, repairing the existing brick, installation of white half round gutters, and replacing the existing doors with a new flat panel metal garage door.

Staff recommends approval of the project with a condition. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* recommends repairing damaged elements instead of replacing them; and when replacement is necessary, the use of materials that match the original type is recommended (pg. 55). The existing garage is in poor condition. The applicant has advised that the structure appears to have been framed with salvaged materials and has leaked for years causing the framing system to fail. The proposed project includes repairing or replacing with in kind materials both the slate roof and brick walls. Though there are downspouts present, the applicant states that these downspouts are not functional, and the fascia appears to never have had an internal or external gutters. The installation of gutters is consistent with the Guidelines which state that well maintained gutters and downspouts help prevent water damage to structures (pg. 83).

The applicant has stated that the existing doors are non-operational and made of plywood. The applicant believes that the doors may not be the original doors due to the age of the materials and the use of plywood. Additionally, the applicant has noted that the main garage door girder has failed and will be replaced. Though staff noted that they are considerably weathered, the existing carriage styles doors are character defining features of this garage, and the proposed flat panel metal garage door does not relate to the design of the existing doors. As the Guidelines recommend retaining all fundamental architectural features (pg. 54, #9) and in the absence of other documentation confirming the historical appearance of the garage, the visual continuity established by the existing doors should be maintained. Staff recommends that the existing carriage style doors should be retained and repaired or reworked to become operable while maintaining the same exterior appearance.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the condition noted above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code, and with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.