

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, February 25, 2025

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2025.004](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner John Grier, * Commissioner Mitch Danese, * Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, * Commissioner Erik Bootsma, * Commissioner Emily Striffler and * Commissioner Catherine Easterling

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner Larry Nutt

Approval of Minutes

There were no minutes for approval.

Secretary's Report

Interim Chair

Chairman Andrew Moore anticipated leaving at 5:30p.m. and recommended that Commissioner Rodriguez serve as interim Chair.

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to elect Commissioner Rodriguez as Interim Chair.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

Excused -- 2 - Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Erik Bootsma

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to move item #4 209 North 28th Street to the Consent Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: (7) BOOTSMA, EASTERLING, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, RODRIGUEZ, STRIFFLER

No: (0)

Excused: (2) DANESE, NUTT

Recused: (0)

A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to move item# 7 to the Consent Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: (7) BOOTSMA, EASTERLING, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, RODRIGUEZ, STRIFFLER

No: (0)

Excused: (2) DANESE, NUTT

Recused: (0)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve the Consent Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

1. [COA-161191-2025](#) 318 North 27th Street - Construct a new rear shed and install a fence and gate.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met; Staff recommends that final material specifications, including windows, doors, and exterior color, be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

4. [COA-161171-2025](#) 209 North 28th Street - Alter a masonry opening on a secondary elevation.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to partially approved the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met:

Specifically the Commission approved: Retention of the already in filled window on the south, alley facing elevation, as reversal of the work could cause additional damage to the historic masonry. The exterior painting, provided that all wooden and/or previously painted masonry be painted a color in-keeping with the Commission's paint guidance; colors submitted to staff for approval.

Specifically the Commission denied the conversion of any other existing windows into transom windows. The installation of vinyl windows. The removal of any original wooden windows. The exterior painting of unpainted masonry.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling
- No --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-161218-2025](#) 2401 East Broad Street - Rehabilitate and repair an existing masonry retaining wall.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Striffler to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Staff recommends that masonry cleaning be performed by a qualified contractor using non-invasive techniques, with low-pressure water washing and mild detergent as the preferred method. Sandblasting is strictly prohibited. Staff recommends that repointing mortar should match the strength of the existing mortar, and no waterproofing or water-repellent coatings should be used, as these products can trap moisture within the masonry. Staff recommends that the brick veneer on the new concrete retaining wall match the existing brick wall in brick dimension, bond pattern, and joint profile as closely as possible. Staff recommends that existing fence / railing to be repaired, cleaned, and repainted in-kind, as well as protected during construction.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling
- No --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

REGULAR AGENDA

2. [COA-161192-2025](#) 500 North Arthur Ashe Boulevard - Enclose side porch and patio; remove a rear porch and construct an addition and covered porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Grier, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: The windows used on the conservatory enclosure does not include transom windows, but rather single, taller windows. Staff recommends approval of the enclosure of the side porch with the condition that all character defining architectural features such as the columns, entablature, and brick be retained and not altered by the installation of the glass; the glass be non-reflective and installed on the interior side of the columns; extant planters be retained on the exterior of the covered porch's glass enclosure; and a simplified knee board at the base of the conservatory be further simplified, design submitted to staff for approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

No -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

3. [COA-161220-2025](#) 2917 East Broad Street - Install an aluminum front yard fence, a rear vinyl fence, and site lighting.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Grier, to partially approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: Specifically, the Commission denied the proposed rear and side fencing. Specifically, the Commission approved the front metal fence and lighting fixtures.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

5. [COA-161197-2025](#) 2211 Venable Street - Rehabilitate the exterior of an existing building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The front porch roof be built back to match the previous structure in-kind using the same materials, profiles, dimensions, and pitch. Original brick piers must be retained. The front porch roof be installed onto the face of the building in the exact location as the original, using the scaring/ghosting on the front of the building as physical evidence of the location. The new windows have clear glass and be non-reflective. Any new windows fit within the existing window openings proportionately. The applicant install new turned posts that match the original turned posts seen in the historic photograph or are a simplified design that matches the proportions and dimensions (turned to square portion ratio) of the original posts. Final post design submitted for administrative approval. All original doors, windows, trim, transoms, and decorative features be retained and repaired. If it exists, any salvageable wood siding be relocated to the façade. Documentation of the salvageable siding submitted to staff for review. If there is no original siding left, or it is deteriorated beyond repair, Staff recommends approval of the installation of the Allura fiber cement siding on the façade. The new front porch decking be installed perpendicular to the face of the building and have a dimension that matches that of historic decking found in the district. Final exterior colors be submitted for

administrative approval. Any replacement doors on the façade be wood or wood and glass or match the existing in-kind. Specifications submitted for administrative approval. Any new gutters and downspouts match the existing in-kind or be a simple box gutter with rounded downspouts; and retention of the existing vinyl windows, or replacement of windows with aluminum clad wood windows with a one-over-one or two-over-two light configuration, specifications submitted to Staff for approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

No -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

6. [COA-161195-2025](#) 806 North Arthur Ashe Boulevard - Rebuild a deteriorated, rear, multi-story deck with a new, larger, multi-story deck.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Grier, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The new porch have either a wooden Richmond Rail design or the proposed black powder coated aluminum; the new porch have similar detailing and molding on the roof as the existing; the original brick piers under the porch be retained, even if no longer structural, to reference the original width of the rear porch; and the new porch have a finished appearance with no exposed hardware or nailed-up pickets.

The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

8. [COA-161219-2025](#) 2715 East Broad Street - Enclose a rear, two story porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Grier, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the fiber cement siding have a smooth, unbeaded finish, as faux wood grain texture is not permitted; final paint color be submitted for administrative review and approval; new windows for rear addition be larger and without divided lights to reference the existing open porch where feasible; pilasters to be the same width and have the same detailing as existing columns; and the roof of the new addition match the roof form of the extant porch.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Andrew Moore

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. [COA-161196-2025](#) 815-821 Mosby Street - Construct a new three story multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2025-02-25 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Commissioner Striffler: Add additional space between the third story frieze board and top of the third story windows. Extend the brick face on the south elevation to at least the second window.

Commissioner Bootsma: Concerned about the building not having primary entrances on the façade. Feels that the building is "turning its back" to the street. Would like to see the building engage with the street more. Consider increasing the depth of the porches.

Easterling: Extend the brick further down the first story of the south elevation. Would like to see the first story porches address the street with entrances connecting to the sidewalk. Split on the use of board and batten siding. Could be good to have more detail images/rendering on how the board and batten siding will interact the lap siding.

Commissioner Grier: Consider regrading the side to be lower to the street level. Regrading the site could help lower the height of the building.

Rodriguez: Would like to see some additional design elements on the façade that better connect it to the street and sidewalk.

10. [COA-161194-2025](#) 711 North 26th Street - Demolish an existing one and one half story rear portion of a building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2025-02-25 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Commissioner Striffler & Commissioner Easterling: Would be opposed to the demolition of the rear projection, as they need more information on the structural integrity of the of the addition. Believes that this projection is a contributing building in the context of the district and contributes to the historic integrity of the building. It could be beneficial to

know how deteriorated the structural members of the building are deteriorated.

Commissioner Hill: More exploration and information on the condition of the building's structural integrity. Construction method of the building could help understand the age of the building.

11. [COA-161193-2025](#) 711 North 26th Street - Construct a rear two story addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2025-02-25 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Commissioner Bootsma: Believes that there are many roof forms in the Church Hill North COHD; however, the asymmetry of the proposed additions roof is not common and doesn't appear to be compatible with typical forms found. Believes that the design should feature more vertical windows rather than horizontal. Would like detail on the texture of the stucco, but also believes that lap siding could be appropriate.

Commissioner Danese: Believes that bigger windows that are vertically aligned could be helpful in meeting the guidelines and accomplishing the owner's want for more natural light. Larger windows could be better suited for an addition that takes on a greater contemporary design.

Commissioner Rodriguez: Doesn't believe that the asymmetrical roof form is in-keeping with roof forms found in the district.

Commissioner Hill: Stucco is a hard material to maintain and there are not many tradesmen that still work on it in this region. Consider the maintenance of the stucco.

Commissioner Striffler: Consider more of a hyphen to further remove the addition from the primary portion of the building. A shed roof on rear projections is common in the district and could be appropriate for the proposed addition.

12. [COA-161185-2025](#) 212-218 North 20th Street - Construct a new six-unit, three-story building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Reports](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: Commission of Architectural Review on 2025-02-25 3:30 PM

Below is a summary of the Commission's discussion:

Commissioner Bootsma: Agreed with the Staff Report regarding the window orientation. Believes that the window orientation should be more in-keeping with that of the historic district. Like the projecting stair tower and suggested that other forms of the stair tower could be explored. Would like to see brick introduced into the design of the building.

Commissioner Danese: Consider ways to screen the south elevation garage doors from North 20th Street.

Commissioner Hill: Believes that red brick could go a long way in helping the design blend into the district. Could just do brick on the front unit and continue the rest of the units in lap siding.

Commissioner Rodriguez: Believes that the garage door elevation is in-keeping with some of the industrial buildings found in the district. Applicant could consider having a garage door with metal and glass rather than something opaque. Doesn't know how to feel about the compatibility of the mixed-reveal siding with the district, as she has never seen a real-life example of it.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:08p.m.