

# City of Richmond

*City Hall  
900 East Broad Street*



## Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, January 24, 2023

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

**Commission of Architectural Review**

[PDRPRES  
2022.097](#) Public Access and Participation Instructions - CAR

**Attachments:** [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW](#)

**Call to Order**

This meeting was called to order at 3:30pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are present in City Hall.

**Roll Call**

**Present --** 8 - \* Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., \* Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, \* Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, \* Commissioner Andrew Moore, \* Commissioner Sean Wheeler, \* Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, \* Commissioner John Grier and \* Commissioner Mitch Danese

**Absent --** 1 - \* Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

**Approval of Minutes**

December 2022

These meeting minutes were approved by Commissioners.

January 2023 Quarterly

These meeting minutes were approved by Commissioners.

**Secretary’s Report**

Secretary Dandridge provided updates on the refinement of the enforcement process for outstanding, unresolved enforcement cases. He said previous cases haven’t gone as far as a court process in his time working for the city.

The substitute materials list is still in progress. Staff are trying to acquire additional samples to have a better understanding of what’s out there. The one example of faux slate that’s been approved by CAR was an EcoStar material on W. Grace Street.

Grier arrived at 3:50pm.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

The consent portion of the meeting began at 4:01pm.

Mr. Dandridge re-read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the Regular Agenda to the Consent Agenda or vice versa.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to move 2715 E. Broad Street to the consent agenda.

The applicant is comfortable with staff conditions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Wheeler, Moore, Morgan, Johnson, Danese, Rodriguez, Grier, Brewer

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to move 509 N. 29th Street to the consent agenda.

Vice Chair Moore asked Commissioner Johnson about his thoughts on this project.

Johnson is basing his decision on what the Commission has done historically.

The applicant is comfortable with staff conditions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Wheeler, Moore, Morgan, Johnson, Danese, Rodriguez, Grier, Brewer

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commission Chair Wheeler, to move 7 E. Franklin Street to the consent agenda.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if this property is a tax credit project.

The applicant says it is not and that they are comfortable with staff conditions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Wheeler, Moore, Morgan, Johnson, Danese, Rodriguez, Grier, Brewer

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Brewer to approve the consent agenda as amended.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 8 -** Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

1. [COA-123206-2023](#) 519 N. 28th Street - Construct a front yard concrete retaining wall.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**The Commission approved the application for the reasons cited in the staff report.**

4. [COA-123207-2023](#) 2715 E. Broad Street - Replace asphalt shingles on a front porch roof with metal.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

- Aye --** 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

6. [COA-123343-2023](#) 509 N. 29th Street - Replace deteriorated wooden architectural elements with substitute materials.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Rear of building: approval of the replacement of all architectural elements listed in the application with the condition that the PVC be a cellular PVC with a matte finish that can be painted, and that the PVC match the exiting materials in dimension and design; and final rear door design be submitted to staff for review and approval. Front of building: front porch and second-story cornice molding, fascia, and soffit be repaired rather than replaced; and new front door design be simple and submitted to staff for review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

- Aye --** 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

5. [COA-123204-2023](#) 7 E. Franklin Street - Rehabilitate an existing dwelling and carriage house.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commission Chair Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Graffiti be removed from the rear carriage house using the gentlest means possible as to not damage the existing brick; and any additional repairs not listed in the application found to be needed during the rehabilitation process be submitted for CAR review and approval.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

2. [COA-123205-2023](#) 313 N. Monroe Street - Installation of a mural on the side of a single-family semi-attached dwelling.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

Samantha Lewis presented this application.

Commissioner Morgan asked about the conditions of the brick wall when it was unpainted.

Lewis said an image from August 2022 had some graffiti on the lower portion of the building.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if there were examples of other murals on a residential building in a City Old & Historic District.

Lewis said no.

Commission Chair Wheeler said there are residential-looking building precedents but that the murals are all on commercial buildings.

Rodriguez asked when murals were added to CAR guidelines.

Morgan said she recalls language about murals being added around 2012. Historic Richmond spoke against having murals on historic buildings at that time.

Mr. Dandridge said the biggest thing to take away is that murals are typically approved on previously painted brick or on a frame that's removable. The guidelines really only address commercial buildings, however. The underlying zoning also doesn't prohibit murals.

The applicant, Josh Shaheen, said when he bought the house in September, there was extensive graffiti and thought his mural installation seemed in keeping with Richmond's history of mural projects. He doesn't recall receiving a letter about the historic designation. The artist has some renown around the world and Shaheen thought the mural could prevent future graffiti as well as mask what was already there. The bottom 15 feet of the mural has an anti-graffiti coating.

Morgan asked if the artist used spray paint.

Shaheen said the base was some kind of roll-on paint with a white base.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Morgan said it'll be tough to remove the paint in a way that won't damage the brick.

Commissioner Johnson said this case is a tough one. Most of the mural will be hard to take off without damaging the structure. However, he doesn't want the Commission to set a bad precedent by allowing the retention of the mural.

Commissioner Danese said perhaps the artist used cheaper paints that don't hold up very well. Maybe some of the paint can be easily removed if the Commission ultimately denies it.

Rodriguez says it's a shame that they have to make a decision on this because she appreciates the art of the mural and thinks the choice was made from a good place.

Commissioner Grier asked how staff would proceed if somebody asked to paint their façade to cover graffiti.

Mr. Dandridge said he would recommend graffiti removal.

Staff shared a letter of opposition to the mural that they received.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to defer the application for the reasons cited in the staff report; with the condition that the applicant, within 30 days of CAR decision, submit to the Commission a solution that would abate the violation which could include the feasibility of removing the paint from the surface of the brick.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye -- 8 -** Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

3. [COA-123392-2023](#) 2210 E Marshall Street - Construct a new three-story attached dwelling.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

Commissioner Rodriguez brought up the question Commissioners asked last submittal about whether the building is attached to the neighboring property.

The applicant, Will Gillette from Baker Development Resources, requested the Commission to approve the application rather than defer for a 4th time with new conditions. Commissioners previously verbally approved of the set-back third floor. The third floor has since been pushed back an additional two feet. Other comments made by Commissioners have been addressed such as the siding. Additionally, 4-5 feet below the dwelling is a layer of stone that prevents the owner from digging deeper, therefore, digging the basement would cause damage to both neighboring historical dwellings. The second conceptual review may have muddied waters rather than clarified design elements.

Commissioner Morgan doesn't think the porch appears to be redesigned. The direction from the Commission was to better align the first floor with the first floor of the house next door.

Vice Chair Moore said he suggested splitting the difference after the first design so that the front porch was more at level with the house next door rather than set far below. He is okay with the net result, but a robust porch may include posts rather than a simple roof form. The term "robust front porch" may not be well-defined.

Commissioner Danese asked how the buildings will be placed together.

Gillette said there will be a void between the two that will be capped at the top. The answer is still dependent on future interior drawings. The void will not be left open.

Commissioner Grier asked what the applicant anticipates the below-grade condition of the dwelling being.

Gillette says he doesn't know but he thinks it may be crawl space.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Danese to approve the application provided the following conditions are met: The porch columns to the single bay porch shall be in keeping with historic precedent and subject to staff approval; The location of the HVAC be submitted for final review.

Grier previously asked about the potential for the retaining wall. He is still interested in that prospect.

Gillette said a wall can be run on-grade to separate the two dwellings.

Wheeler thinks requiring posts on such a small porch wouldn't work too well.

Rodriguez thinks the columns would make it seem too busy in such a small space.

Moore withdrew his condition about the porch columns.

Morgan wants to include additional information about the height of the structure. There have been projects that have been built and have appeared different to plans that were submitted.

Mr. Dandridge is unsure if staff can administratively approve shifts in building footprints. If dimensions are added or height is changed, the application may need to be resubmitted to the Commission.

The Commission discussed the possibility of deferral or approval with the possibility of staff administratively approving minor changes in building dimensions.

Moore asked if the information presented is enough to inform the Commission on the proposed height dimensions.

Morgan said no.

Moore withdrew his motion.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Vice Chair Moore to defer the application for the reasons cited in the staff report to allow the applicant time to provide the following information to the Commission of**

**Architectural Review: a line of sight drawing showing the visibility of the third floor from E. Marshall Street; dimensioned drawings indicating the height of the neighboring buildings as well as the proposed new construction; location of exterior HVAC equipment; specifications, including dimensions, of the proposed retaining wall between the new construction and the neighboring building; and revised drawings indicating that the projecting bay of the front façade of the proposed building is aligned with the face of 2214 E. Marshall Street.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-123393-2023](#) 2818 Monument Avenue - Construct a new four-story, multi-family building on a vacant lot.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

Staff received a letter of support.

The applicant, Lewis Little, says the building was made narrower to provide fire escapes along the side of the building.

Commissioner Grier asked if there is any anticipated offsite impact in the historic district for parking.

Little says there will be no parking related to the building, they will just have to get a variance for screened parking.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked about the proposed materials on the front porches.

Little brought physical material samples to display to the Commission including a substitute brick sample and a portion of black, metal railing. He is comfortable with staff recommendations.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Wheeler asked if the black, metal substitute railing will be used for guard rails, as well. The landings may also need to be larger for ADA regulations.

Little said yes.

Rodriguez questioned if the building fitting other historic buildings in the districts sets it apart enough as a contemporary construction.

Commissioner Danese said the combination of everything will ensure that the building appears new rather than historic.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Morgan to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report with the following**



recommendations: Staff recommends that all final window and door specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; Staff recommends that to confirm that the height of the new construction will be similar to the neighboring buildings, a dimensioned drawing that labels the heights of the neighboring buildings be submitted to staff for review; Staff recommends that all mechanical equipment be located in a location that is screened from the public right-of way, including the rear alley.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

### **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

None.

### **Adjournment**

This meeting was adjourned at 5:28pm.