



**Staff Report**  
**City of Richmond, Virginia**



**Commission of Architectural Review**

5.COA-150664-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 7/23/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Froilan Valverde	
Project Description	Re-clad an existing, rear, metal shed in fiber cement siding.	
Project Location		
Address: 409 N. 23 <sup>RD</sup> Street		
Historic District: Church Hill North		
High-Level Details:		
<p>The applicant proposes to remove corrugated metal siding from a 1930s garage, and to replace it with new sheathing and exterior fiber cement lap siding.</p> <p>The primary building is a single-family, frame, two-story dwelling ca. 1895.</p> <p>The property is in the Church Hill North National Register Historic District, which has a Period of Significance of 1850-1940.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Denial	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov; (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Conditions for Approval	<p>Staff recommends denial of the replacement of the corrugated metal siding with horizontal lap siding.</p> <p>Staff recommends that the existing metal siding be retained and repaired or replaced in-kind if found to be deteriorated beyond repair.</p>	

**Staff Analysis**

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, pg. 4	<i>2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features</i>	The applicant proposes to alter an existing rear garage. The rear garage is rectangular in form with a gable roof. It is clad in corrugated metal and has wooden and aluminum exterior doors and a metal roof. The original alley facing garage door appears to have been altered and converted into a smaller garage door and a person

	<p><i>and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.</i></p> <p><i>3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.</i></p> <p><i>5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.</i></p>	<p>door. The Church Hill North National Register Nomination Form acknowledges this rear garage as being constructed in the 1930s. The garage is not listed as being “non-contributing”.</p>
<p>Standards for Rehabilitation, Residential Construction, pg. 59</p>	<p><i>1. Retain original features and materials that define the building style, including but not limited to wood siding, shingles, stucco and masonry</i></p> <p><i>7. Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i></p>	<p>The existing corrugated metal siding is a distinctive cladding material that was commonly used on garage buildings in the 1930s. Corrugated galvanized iron, first made of wrought iron, was introduced in the 1840s. In the 1890s and early-twentieth century, improved methods of steel making led to the complete replacement of wrought iron with milled steel. Iron and steel are cheaper and stronger than most metals, but they corrode readily in air and water. However, when galvanized, protected with a thin coating of zinc, they become extremely durable. Thus, galvanized steel is strong, durable, relatively light and easily transported. These qualities made it very desirable for rural, industrial, and prefabricated buildings. The number of prefabricated garages clad with corrugated metal speaks to its wide use during the early-twentieth century. It is a character defining feature of the building and should be retained.</p> <p>Staff recommends that the corrugated metal siding be repaired and retained or replaced in-kind if found to be deteriorated beyond repair.</p> <p>Staff recommends denial of removal of the corrugated metal and replacement with fiber cement lap siding. Replacing the existing metal siding with a new material such as lap siding would compromise the historic integrity of the building.</p> <p>While the garage differs in design from the primary building and is a newer addition to the site, preserving the character of the existing garage is important to telling the history of development of this specific property.</p>

*It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.*

## Figures

Figure 1. Existing garage.

Figure 2. Other garages located in the subject alley.



Figure 3. Alley facing elevation of existing garage.



Figure 4. Corrugated metal siding on existing garage.

