



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, August 28, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Call to Order

- Present --** 8 - * Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, * Commissioner James W. Klaus, * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Carey L. Jones, * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler and * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- Absent --** 2 - * Commissioner David C. Cooley and * Commissioner Sanford Bond

Roll Call

- Present --** 7 - * Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, * Commissioner James W. Klaus, * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler and * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- Absent --** 2 - * Commissioner David C. Cooley and * Commissioner Sanford Bond

Approval of Minutes

July 10, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that the July 20, 2018 Quarterly meeting minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 2 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer
- Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Kathleen Morgan
- Abstain --** 4 - Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

July 24, 2018

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that the July 24, 2018 minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 3 - Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer
- Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Kathleen Morgan
- Abstain --** 3 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Administrative Approval Guidelines

Chairman Klaus announced the introduction of changes to guidelines concerning HVAC, porch decking, and hardscaping.

Chairman Klaus noted that the changes to other guidelines concerning gutters, downspouts, windows, and doors happened to be more in depth. Chairman Klaus suggested further review of the guidelines to address more commissioner questions and comments concerning gutters, downspouts, windows, and doors to staff until September.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that the administrative approval guidelines for HVAC systems, hardscaping, and porch decking be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Jones welcomed the new commissioners to the Commission of Architectural Review.

Chairman Klaus introduced Kathleen Morgan, Lane Pearson, and Sean Wheeler to the Commission of Architectural Review. Sean Wheeler stated that he is a local architect who lives in the Jackson Ward Historic District and further added that he renovated the 1885 house that he currently lives in. Kathleen Morgan stated that she currently does historic preservation consulting and lives in the museum district after living in Jackson Ward for around four years. Lane Pearson stated that he is a real estate attorney with an additional Masters degree in Urban Planning.

Ms. Chen announced that a new Planner I would be joining staff in the Planning and Preservation Division and added that the designated period for advertisements for the Administrative Assistant position had ended.

Administrative Approvals

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries announced that staff met with property owners at 3422 East Broad Street where they changed out the windows and added a window opening in the rear. Staff had discussed ways in which the violation could be mitigated, and staff hoped to have an application from the property owners for the September meeting.

Ms. Jeffries further announced that there had been a couple of other minor new enforcements that mostly concerned fences and paint.

Other Committee Reports

There were no other committee reports.

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

Mr. Hendricks made a motion to move the 10th item, COA-039896-2018, 101 North Boulevard to the consent agenda. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The commission unanimously approved moving the item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, that the consent agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 10** [COA-039896-2018](#) 101 North Boulevard - Install ADA compliant wheelchair lift at the rear of the building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the lift mechanism be installed in such a way that does not damage the existing masonry including anchoring to the mortar, not the brick. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

REGULAR AGENDA

- 1** [COA-034556-2018](#) 411 Chimborazo Boulevard - Construct a new two story frame garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(5/22/2018\)](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report \(5/22/2018\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(6/26/2018\)](#)
[Staff Report \(6/26/2018\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(08/28/2018\)](#)
[Staff Report \(08/28/2018\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)
[Staff Report \(09/25/2018\)](#)

The applicant, Caitlin Wise, emphasized her desire, when constructing the garage, to use actual materials that match the home. She stated that she would prefer to construct a two-story structure, if this could be acceptable. She suggested that a two-story garage should not be visible from the street and that a 1.5 story garage could render the space less usable.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Ms. Jeffries confirmed that there are a number of two story brick garages in the district. Chairman Klaus expressed his strong support for staff recommendations, noting that the Church Hill Association also supports the staff recommendation that the proposed garage be 1.5 stories high. Mr. Wheeler diverged from the Chairman's position, stating that 1.5 stories would not appear appropriate and reiterated that a two-story garage would not be overly noticeable in the district.

Chairman Klaus further encouraged the applicant to understand that the Zoning Division had not yet approved her plans for a kitchen and bathroom and therefore, a 1.5 story garage may not interfere with her plans. He suggested that the applicant seek zoning approval. Mr. Hendricks noted that a Special Use Permit process may take up to 180 days to obtain an approval and, therefore, did not find it helpful for the applicant to initially pursue an approval from the Zoning Division. However, Mr. Hendricks also emphasized that the garage needs to conform to either the standards that apply to a 'guest house' or to the standards that apply to a 'carriage house.' He noted that a two-story garage would only be appropriate for a guest house. Mr. Hendricks and Chairman Klaus both suggested that a gable roof could be appropriate for the 1.5 story garage, and Ms. Morgan further specified that a side gable would be more appropriate for a 1.5 story garage.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the plans to propose a one-and-one-half story outbuilding more in keeping with the architectural style of the house, including a gable roof form. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 6 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- No --** 1 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler

- 2 [COA-037946-2018](#) 3309 Monument Avenue - Demolish an existing porch and sunroom to construct a rear addition; construct a two-car garage in the rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(7/24/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(7/24/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans \(08/28/2018\)](#)

[Staff Report \(08/28/2018\)](#)

The applicant, Kim Cho, expressed her support and willingness to adapt to staff recommendations. Mr. Wheeler asked the applicant how she would reconcile the existing roof pitch with the new one. The applicant suggested that one would mimic the other. Chairman Klaus asked Ms. Cho if she is comfortable with staff's recommendation that she install copper roofing on the addition. Ms. Cho replied that she is comfortable with the copper recommendation but aims to use whatever is most practical and cost effective. Chairman Klaus explained that staff is interested in differentiating the new roof from the existing one but conceded that options other than copper roofing exist for the applicant to use for the addition.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Commissioners unanimously expressed support for staff recommendations.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the windows in the addition and the garage be wood or aluminum clad wood windows with true or simulated divided lites with a spacer bar between the glass; the windows on the side elevations of the addition be 6/6 to match the existing side windows; the specifications for the new doors and roof material be submitted for administrative review and approval; details of the garage doors be submitted for staff review and approval; the fiber cement siding be smooth and without a bead and colors be submitted for staff approval; and the rear stairways be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color to be submitted for staff approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 3 [COA-039288-2018](#) 2717 West Grace Street - Replace a deteriorated deck with a new deck of the same size and shape.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Lorin Sodell, introduced himself to the commission. Chairman Klaus asked the applicant if the stair configuration is changing. Mr. Sodell stated that the original stair construction was unsafe and wished to modify the construction to allow the stairway to be as safe as possible. Chairman Klaus noted that between the 2011 photograph and now, there is a lot of additional electrical equipment at the rear. The applicant explained that he needed to re-do the electrical service to ensure that it would meet current requirements. Chairman Klaus asked the applicant to confirm whether the

new stairway would adversely affect the HVAC unit. Mr. Sodell assured that the stairway configuration would not adversely affect the HVAC unit since it would be installed in front of the HVAC unit.

Chairman Klaus asked Mr. Sodell if he had any problem with staff recommendations. Mr. Sodell admitted that he had some difficulty with finding examples of Richmond pickets that he would need to use. He further insisted that the wood would need time to season appropriately before he could paint it. Chairman Klaus agreed that delaying the painting would be reasonable and suggested that Richmond rail would be the most common railing to find in the Richmond area.

Ms. Morgan asked Mr. Sodell if he foresees actually installing the stairs. Mr. Sodell admitted that he would need to determine what requirements apply to stairway construction but would prefer not to install the stairway if it was not necessary.

Chairman Klaus asked Mr. Sodell if he would want the Commission to approve the stair plan at the current meeting. Mr. Sodell emphasized that he needs to ensure that the stair plan does not interfere with the Zoning Department's setback requirement. If the current stair plan does interfere with the setback requirement, he would need to modify the stair plan.

Ms. Jeffries clarified that due to setback requirements the proposed structure would not be able to project more than ten feet from the face of the structure.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Johnson acknowledged the complications that setback requirements create. Chairman Klaus stated that the commission can approve what is before them at the current meeting, and if the applicant has future issues due to zoning requirements, the applicant can appear before the commission again.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: Richmond rail be installed to replace the nailed-up pickets; and the structure be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

- 4 [COA-039283-2018](#) 2712 East Leigh Street - Renovate a former horse stable, construct an addition in the rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, David Johannas, introduced the nature of the project to the commission. Mr. Johannas noted that although the building plans that he submitted to the commission depict the proposed roof construction incorrectly, he assured the commission that the elevations on the plans are correct. Mr. Johannas further explained various parts of the proposed construction, stating that the HVAC unit would be behind the screening areas

and out of sight, portions of the wall may need to be reconstructed, the horizontal mullion on the second story window may change, and the fence would be natural, rather than stained, wood. He also confirmed that he would submit more details on the fence construction.

Chairman Klaus stated that the applicant leaves open many questions and that the presentation more closely resembles a conceptual review. Mr. Wheeler asked if the brick used for the proposed construction would contrast the brick on the existing building. Mr. Johannas replied that the brick used for the proposed construction would not match the brick on the existing building. Mr. Johannas explained to the commission that the addition would be a new construction that is intended to be modern and, therefore, not intended to match the existing building.

Ms. Morgan asked whether the siding material on the new addition is intended to be painted a color similar to the brick on the existing structure. Mr. Johannas replied that he intends to use a softer blend of colors that fall within the subset of colors that staff would administratively approve. Ms. Morgan further asked Mr. Johannas if the doors that he installs on the new construction will replicate the historic doors on the existing building. Mr. Johannas clarified that the existing building does not contain historic doors and, therefore, differentiation from them would not be as crucial.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Chairman Klaus expressed concern with leaving the front door of the proposed construction for administrative approval. Mr. Johannas clarified to the commission that he, also, needs to wait for more feedback from DHR before bringing forward more details, and he intended to seek approval from the commission for aspects of the proposed construction other than the front door. Chairman Klaus noted that the commission appreciates if proposed new additions contain materials that distinguish them from the materials used to construct the existing structure, even if the existing structure is not composed of historic material. Mr. Hendricks stated that he has general reservations with the proposed construction and is concerned with the number of openings being added to the existing structure. Mr. Wheeler questioned whether three sides of the proposed construction would face the public: Mr. Hendricks stated that the presence of the fence would mitigate the exposure to the public view.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Commissioner Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the roof replacement material be submitted to staff for administrative approval; details of the proposed fence, including a detailed site plan with the location of the fence and materials, be submitted for staff review and approval prior to installation; the front doors fit the existing openings and details of the new doors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval prior to installation; the location of heating, ventilation, and cooling equipment be submitted to staff for administrative approval; proposed dimensioned elevations be submitted for staff review and approval; the site plan be updated to clarify the direction of roof gable and submitted for staff review and approval; all work be performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by the Department of Historic Resources or the National Park Service be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

No -- 1 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

5 [COA-039284-2018](#) 1600 Monument Avenue - Install brick screening wall, light poles, and 22 parking spaces.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Kevin Pennock, expressed general support for staff recommendations but added two concerns of his own. Mr. Pennock asked the Commission whether its members would recommend a height for the lighting fixtures. He further asked if stairs could be adequate vertical elements to break up the length of the wall. The applicant stated that he would support adding one set of stairs in the middle of the wall to break up the wall's length.

Chairman Klaus stated that the addition of the stairs and the ultimate lighting plan likely could be administratively approved, with the added suggestion that a lighting consultant may be useful to evaluate the lighting plan.

Bill Gallasch introduced himself as a neighbor at 2336 Monument Avenue and President of MAPS. He admitted that he is concerned that the proposed brick wall may not match the character of the Old and Historic District. Mr. Gallasch further emphasized his strong fear that the lighting would be far too obtrusive and bright.

Aaron Goldberg, another neighbor in the area, agreed with Bill Gallasch's concerns about the lighting plan. He further expressed concerns with the wall's impact on water flow and the potentially drastic increase of traffic that additional parking spaces could create.

Mr. Hendricks asked Mr. Goldberg if lower but additional light fixtures would be acceptable solutions to the problem. Mr. Goldberg replied that he is uncertain what the right design solution to the potential lighting problem would be.

Chairman Klaus agreed that lowering the light fixtures makes a lot of sense. He further noted that having the opening for the stairs at the turn-around is preferable to having an opening for the stairs in the center of the wall.

Mr. Hendricks agreed with Chairman Klaus's thoughts about the opening in the stairs, adding that even the placement of piers would effectively break up the length of the wall. However, he suggested that one opening does not sufficiently break up the length of the wall. Mr. Johnson, in response, suggested the presence of two openings to break up the wall's length.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the design of the wall be altered to include one opening at the turn-around area and another vertical element be incorporated at

the opposite end of the wall to create visual balance and the new design be submitted for staff review and approval; a sloped brick cap be installed on the wall to create visual interest and protect the wall from water infiltration; a brick sample be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and the lighting plan be revised to utilize smaller fixtures more in scale with the district and the revised plan be submitted to staff for administrative review. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

6 [COA-039281-2018](#) 2729 West Grace Street - Construct a new, two-story garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Steven Ogburn, introduced himself to the commission.

Mr. Hendricks noted that zoning regulations related to the required setbacks, the mismatch between the siting of the garage, and the siting of the main building concern him. The applicant insisted that the Zoning Department would most likely approve the current building plan. Mr. Ogburn, however, admitted that the proposed construction would require a variance.

Ms. Morgan asked the applicant if there is a material for the garage door that he would propose. Mr. Ogburn replied that he currently proposes a steel clad door but is open to other options. Mr. Wheeler asked Mr. Ogburn what the height of the garage door would be. Mr. Ogburn replied that the garage door would be seven feet tall.

Mr. Ogburn argued against staff's suggestion that few two-story garages exist in the district. He insisted that there are pictures of many two-story garages within a block of the proposed construction. Chairman Klaus conceded that there are several two-story garages in the area.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Chairman Klaus stated that although two story garages are found in the area of the proposed construction, roof decks are unprecedented in the area. He noted, however, that, historically, only a one-story structure ever existed in the area where the applicant proposed the construction of a two-story structure. Mr. Johnson agreed that a rooftop deck would be inappropriate. Mr. Wheeler suggested, however, that if railings could be set back five feet from the edge, a roof deck would be spatially consistent and not nearly as visible. Mr. Hendricks agreed with Mr. Wheeler that if the roof deck would be small enough to be invisible from the public right of way, he would approve of its construction, and he expressed that the presence of other two story garages on the street validates the applicant's desire for a two-story garage.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the entire two-story building be constructed of brick; the roof-top railing not be visible from the right-of-way and the applicant

submit documentation of the railing visibility to staff for review and approval; the garage door material be submitted to staff for review and approval; the windows be reconfigured to match the house and revised plans be submitted to staff for review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

7 [COA-039279-2018](#) 620 North Boulevard - Install a new fence with brick piers in the rear yard.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Mr. McCaskill, stated that he considers the proposed construction an improvement to the alley. He suggested that residents are concerned about trash in the area, and this fence would alleviate the burden that the trash creates. He further explained that the brick piers that he planned to include on the fence would give the fence strength and rigidity. Mr. McCaskill insisted that other fences in the area have brick piers and emphasized that the fence would not be as strong or architecturally pleasing without the brick piers.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Hendricks stated that he generally agrees with staff's recommendations but he would be more comfortable veering slightly from the standard on the fence, as it would be in the rear. Mr. Wheeler added that staff recommendations seem contrary to recommendations in the Architectural Review Guidelines. Mr. Wheeler reminded the commission that the proposed construction is at the edge of Monument Avenue, and Monument Avenue has rarely had wooden picket fences. Mr. Johnson agreed that that the fence's location would permit the construction of brick piers on the fence.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the wood fence be flat, not arched; and the design of the gate and a brick sample be submitted to staff for review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

8 [COA-039289-2018](#) 517 North 26th Street - Construct a two-story addition at the rear of the existing structure; reconstruct existing front porch and add two windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Matt Jarreau, expressed general agreement with staff's recommendations.

He noted, however, that he would rebuild the porch to match the neighbor's porch, would use EPDM in his construction, and would be comfortable with enlarging the design of his windows for the commission's benefit.

Kathi Ednie, a neighbor in the area, expressed concern with the proximity of the proposed construction to her property. She particularly emphasized that the windows on the proposed construction should not be too large.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Chairman Klaus concluded that the applicant seemed amenable to all staff recommendations. He further considered exploring ways to adjust the fenestration pattern to appease Ms. Ednie.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the window materials be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the plans for the porch rehabilitation including the roof materials, railing design and materials, and column materials and its connection to the neighboring porch be submitted to staff for administrative approval; that two narrow, stacked windows be included on the projecting bay on the north facing elevation; and the right elevation be revised and submitted for staff review and approval to include the removal of the second story windows (Windows F) on the addition and the new windows on the existing building. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- No --** 2 - Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

9 [COA-039802-2018](#) 2708-2712 East Broad Street - Install suspended gutters and downspouts on the front porch of 2708-2712 East Broad Street.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(08/28/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(08/28/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)

[Staff Report \(09/25/2018\)](#)

Lizabeth Lefferts, the applicant, began with an overview of the damage to her property. She stated that her porches are deteriorating and that the bases of her columns are rotting. When she noticed this damage and needed to make a quick repair, she examined the style of gutters in her neighborhood before making the appropriate repair. Ms. Lefferts insisted that the k-style gutters that she installed do not set a precedent in the community that has not already been established. She further noted that the porch at 2708 East Broad Street contains a box gutter, and that porches at 2710 and 2712 East Broad Street do not.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Hendricks stated that he has no doubts that a box gutter was once present on the applicant's property; he added that he could not support k-style gutters at that location. He further asked the applicant if water currently

just flows off the face of the porch. Ms. Lefferts responded that water flows flat down and lamented that the previous owner did not install an appropriate gutter. She insisted that the previous owner's mishandling should have been brought to the city's attention. Mr. Wheeler stated that he would support a new downspout connection being added to the existing structure. Mr. Jones, Ms. Lefferts' contractor, explained to the Commission that k-style gutters in front of only 2710 and 2712 East Broad Street would leave an abrupt ending that would be very obvious and detrimental to the building. He further informed the commission that the previous owner eliminated the built-in gutter.

Chairman Klaus conceded that, in light of the information presented by the applicant and her contractor, the commission could be creating more problems if it failed to approve the applicant's gutter. Ms. Morgan suggested that it might be more appropriate to install a half-round gutter onto the home. Ms. Lefferts further questioned why she should be penalized for the past owner's mistakes. Chairman Klaus assured Ms. Lefferts that the commission does not wish to penalize her and only wishes to find a solution; he further stated that he would appreciate seeing photos of the gutter to understand its condition.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to provide additional photographic evidence from the porch roof of the porch gutters specifically at 2710 and 2712 East Broad Street. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

11 [COA-040111-2018](#) 412 North 28th Street - Replace metal roof material with asphalt shingles.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Chris Coyne, stated that he is curious as to why he is not able to have an asphalt roof when his neighbors are able to do so. He further explained that the rear roof of his home was damaged by a tree branch and suggested the possibility of installing shingles on the rear gable.

Chairman Klaus explained to Mr. Coyne that the houses around his own may have had asphalt installed prior to the establishment of the historic district.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Wheeler assured the applicant that asphalt roofs in the area deteriorate more quickly than metal roofs, with other commissioners voicing their general support for metal roofing, as well.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, and seconded by Commissioner Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: a metal roof with a similar design to the existing roof be installed on both sides of the front gable of the building and asphalt shingles may be installed on the rear portions of the roof provided that evidence is submitted for staff review and approval that the replacement material will not be visible

from any public right-of-way. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 12 [COA-039278-2018](#) 804 North 22nd Street - Construct a new, two-story, single family detached house on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Matt Jarreau, stated that there was a structure at the site of the proposed construction in the early 1900's. He added that he has considered multiple floor plans, he recognizes the importance of utilizing the side yard, and considers the function of the actual home more important than the side yard feature.

Chairman Klaus and the commission agreed that the applicant's building plan is fairly non-controversial.

Nancy Lampert, a local resident, expressed opposition to the proposed windows that would look like gun turrets. Matt Jarreau assured Ms. Lampert that he is moving away from that style of window.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

Adjournment