



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, October 23, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Call to Order

James Klaus, the Chairman, called the October 23rd meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review to order at 3:36 pm.

Roll Call

- Present --** 7 - * Commissioner David C. Cooley, * Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, * Commissioner James W. Klaus, * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and * Commissioner Sean Wheeler
- Absent --** 2 - * Commissioner Sanford Bond and * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Approval of Minutes

September 25, 2018

Ms. Jones noted that a minor edit to the minutes would need to include Mr. Pearson's recusal on one item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, seconded by Commissioner David C. Cooley, that the September minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler
- Abstain --** 1 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Jones thanked Ms. Mackiewicz for her time with the Planning and Preservation Department and announced that Matthew Everett would be joining the department the following week. Ms. Jones stated that Mr. Everett had assisted with boards and commissions at the Rhode Island School of Design and Trinity Church, benefited from knowledge of planning principles, and worked as a professional editor. Ms. Jones expressed hope that Mr. Everett would take an active role in assisting callers, taking notes, preparing minutes, and helping with guideline and Master Plan updates.

Ms. Jones further announced that she met with residents to discuss upcoming November projects and finalized the schedule for the CAR 2019 Commission meetings.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Jones noted two minor edits to the Administrative Approval Report. Chairman Klaus announced that future Administrative Approval Reports would be sent out to commissioners in advance of the scheduled monthly Commission meetings.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jones noted minor paint violations and further stated that Commission applications may appear next month as a result of enforcement activity.

Revised Staff Reports

Ms. Jones stated that staff is employing a new staff report format for the first time this month. Chairman Klaus and commissioners stated that they are highly pleased with the new staff report format, with Chairman Klaus adding that he would appreciate even more access to historic pictures.

Other Committee Reports

Chairman Klaus announced that the Convention Center is wanting to put up electronic signage on 3rd Street across from the Jackson Ward Historic District, adding that the Urban Design Committee members suggested that the lighting on the signs be turned off between 11 pm. and 8 am and, ultimately, approved the addition of the signage.

Window Materials:

Chairman Klaus announced that the Commission had, during its previous monthly meeting, deferred a decision on windows with vinyl parts that Matt Jarreau had proposed to install. Mr. Jarreau had given staff a list of locations with these windows already installed, Chairman Klaus visited these locations, and the Commission reviewed the pictures of these windows at the recent Quarterly meeting.

Chairman Klaus stated that staff had spoken with other Commission staff across the state and obtained confirmation that vinyl window materials are not appropriate for use in historic districts. Chairman Klaus explained that vinyl window materials are not durable and negatively affect the historic integrity of a historic neighborhood.

Chairman Klaus acknowledged that Mr. Jarreau had, however, proposed to install windows with vinyl pieces on a home that already contained vinyl window materials. Admitting that the Commission had approved these windows after misunderstanding window specifications, Chairman Klaus asserted that the Commission would wish to avoid making this mistake again. To avoid future misunderstandings, Chairman Klaus proposed that window specifications be administratively approved by staff before building permits are approved.

A motion was made by Commissioner James W. Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Neville C. Johnson, Jr., to deny windows with vinyl pieces, provided that the following conditions are met: that the applicant work with staff to administratively approve the installation of new window materials. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

Ms. Morgan made a motion to move the 4th item, COA-042469-2018, 726 North 27th Street to the consent agenda. Chairman Klaus seconded the motion. The Commission unanimously approved moving the item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Neville C. Johnson, Jr., that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

- 4 [COA-042469-2018](#) 726 North 27th Street - Construct a pergola on an existing rear deck.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

REGULAR AGENDA

- 1 [COA-041237-2018](#) 511 North 21st Street - Construct a two-story porch on the rear and alter the openings on the rear elevation.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(09/25/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(09/25/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Cooley questioned how the Commission distinguishes between structures that qualify as porches and structures that qualify as additions, noting that the distinction is difficult to reconcile.

The applicant, Antwaun D. Griffin, explained that he is looking for clarity from the Commission. He expressed that it is important for him to determine whether the proposed construction meets setback requirements, improves upon the existing structure, and appears similar to neighboring properties. Mr. Griffin stated that the proposed construction is similar to porches in the surrounding area.

Mr. Fields, on behalf of the applicant, expressed general support for staff recommendations but emphasized his opposition to staff recommendations concerning door size, noting that the applicant would appreciate more light into the kitchen. Mr. Fields confirmed his support of French doors on the lower level and confirmed the porch screening will not have any visible framing.

Chairman Klaus asked the applicant if he would support an eight foot deck. Mr. Griffin replied that he may need a deck to be as large as ten feet deep but would just wish for a deck that would be compatible with the dimensions of surrounding structures.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Ms. Jeffries noted the presence of a public comment letter. Chairman Klaus, Mr. Cooley, and Mr. Hendricks expressed support for French doors and a ten foot deck. Chairman Klaus, also, expressed support for the minimal detailing on the porch columns.

A motion was made by Commissioner Cooley, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the porch is centered on the rear of the building; the screening is installed on the interior of the railings and columns; and the window specifications are submitted for staff review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

2 [CAR-042451-2018](#) 2113 Cedar Street - Construct a new two-car garage in the rear.

Attachments: [Applications and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Jerry Heeralall, expressed general support for the staff recommendations. However, he added that a five foot setback troubles him, requesting that the Commission permit a six to eight foot setback.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Ms. Jeffries noted the presence of a public comment letter. Chairman Klaus expressed support for the applicant's request for a larger setback.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the setback from the southeast corner to the property line be 8 feet; the proposed colors for the structure are submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and garage door details be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

3 [COA-042457-2018](#) 514 North 26th Street - Construct a new single family home on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Ms. Maria Lynn McGinnis, expressed general support for staff recommendations. However, she stated her preference for keeping the HVAC unit on the roof and objected to the staff recommendation that foundation height be increased to two feet. Ms. McGinnis emphasized that she would prefer a lower foundation height to allow for easier access to the house. Chairman Klaus stated that he would support accommodations such as a ramp to allow for easier access to the home but remains skeptical about lowering the foundation height, suggesting that this would make the appearance of this house inconsistent with that of surrounding houses.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Ms. Jeffries noted the presence of a public comment letter. Chairman Klaus stated that he could support the presence of an HVAC unit on the roof if the unit would not be visible. Mr. Wheeler suggested that the HVAC unit may not be visible if it is placed in the center of the roof. Mr. Johnson stated that if the pitch of the roof is changed, the window height may need to be changed.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: simple posts or angle brackets be installed at the corners of the rear door hood; if the roof pitch increases space be added between the second floor window sills and the porch roof to be more consistent with historic structures on the block; the height of the foundation be at least one foot or at most eighteen inches; to be more consistent with the adjacent buildings; the piers beneath the front porch be clad in brick; a color consistent with the paint guidelines be used to be administratively reviewed by staff; a specification sheet for the windows be submitted for administrative review; additional details of the rear and side doors, cornice elements, and front porch roof be submitted for administrative review; all railings be Richmond rail and the side and rear stairs be painted or stained a color to complement the main structure; the HVAC units be relocated to the side or rear yard or a non-visible location on the roof; the front porch be inset from the side elevations; gutter details be submitted to staff for review and approval; and the proposed front yard fence be painted or opaquely stained a color complementary to the main

structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

- 5 [COA-042459-2018](#) 130 North 32nd Street - Demolish an existing garage and construct a new two story frame garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Matt Elmes, stated that he would prefer that garage dimensions be 18 feet by 22 feet, as opposed to the current 18 feet by 18 feet. Mr. Elmes further stated that he does not intend to change the primary façade but would just wish to keep the scale appropriate to the home. He also suggested that using brick materials to construct the garage would create a sense of false historicism.

Chairman Klaus stated that the three by two windows that the applicant proposed are unusual from a historic standpoint. Chairman Klaus asked the applicant if he would support changing the window size on the side elevation. Mr. Elmes acknowledged that the proposed window size would be unusual from the historic standpoint, but he emphasized that the garage would be a modern addition and, therefore, its construction details would not need to conform to standards appropriate for a historic structure. He further added, however, that he would support changing the fenestration. Chairman Klaus clarified that because the entire proposed construction does not seem modern, he would support construction standards that are more appropriate for historic structures. The applicant admitted that he wanted the primary façade of the garage to be more traditional, acknowledging that the fenestration is tricky. Chairman Klaus proposed that staff administratively approve the final fenestration plan. The applicant agreed to the Chairman's proposal.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Chairman Klaus noted the presence of public letters of support for the application. Mr. Hendricks expressed his support for the three by two windows, acknowledging that the proposed façade of the garage would be more traditional; he explained that the windows still remain contextually appropriate. Mr. Cooley, likewise, expressed support for the three by two windows. Chairman Klaus noted that he would vote against approval of the three by two windows.

A motion was made by Commissioner Cooley, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: window details be submitted to staff for review and approval; exterior colors be submitted to staff for review and approval; and the railing should be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

No -- 1 - Commissioner James W. Klaus

- 6 [COA-042475-2018](#) 705 North 21st Street - Rehabilitate single family residential building including enclosing rear stoop.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicants, Derrick and Shawnda Parker, stated their wish to revitalize the community and restore the house to its original splendor through their rehabilitation efforts. Chairman Klaus urged the applicants to salvage as much of the original siding as possible. Mr. Hendricks added that the extra two layers of siding should be solid and usable. Mr. Parker, additionally, emphasized his wish to add Richmond railing around the home, insisting that the existing railing is deteriorating and noting his desire to comply with the VA code, and Ms. Parker added that surrounding structures in the neighborhood have Richmond rail. Chairman Klaus and Mr. Hendricks both emphasized that preserving the original railing is essential to maintaining the historic integrity of the building, and they only conceded that the applicant could add Richmond rail in locations where there is no existing railing to salvage. Mr. Cooley emphasized that the historic railing is beautiful, ornate, and unique to the home. Mr. Parker also noted his desire to keep the existing four pane glass door.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Chairman Klaus stated his desire to approve the application with the current staff recommendations. Mr. Hendricks suggested that removing the brick walkway may be detrimental to the structure's historic integrity. Mr. Parker expressed some concern with retaining the brick.

Mr. Hendricks noted the brick should be retained at the front of the walkway and the fence should follow the existing topography of the lot.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Commissioner Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: any wood siding found under the asphalt siding be consolidated on the façade. If wood siding does not exist, wood siding with a reveal to match the historic reveal be installed; a vertical trim board be installed to match the historic rear entry porch; the carved wood railing be retained on the front porch; the applicants submit a revised site plan with the location of the shed and the location of the HVAC unit for review and approval; the fence details be submitted for administrative review and approval; the front door be submitted for administrative review and approval; and the foundation color be submitted for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

No -- 1 - Commissioner David C. Cooley

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 7 [COA-042467-2018](#) 706 North 21st Street -Construct a rear addition, deck, and one story garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Enoch Pou, the applicant, expressed support for the staff recommendations, emphasizing that his client is glad to replicate the decorative bracket on the columns that the Commission referenced. Mr. Pou additionally suggested using fiber cement siding on the addition but a different reveal than what lies on the primary structure to differentiate the main structure from the subordinate structure.

Mr. Hendricks asked the applicant if he plans to repair the internal gutters that attach to the main house and asked what kinds of gutters the applicant plans to install on the addition. The applicant confirmed that he would install half round gutters and expressed no opposition to repairing gutters.

Mr. Cooley clarified that flat lock metal is the typical front porch metal treatment. In response, Mr. Pou agreed to retain the flat lock metal.

Commissioners emphasized that the garage needs to have the same materials as the rear addition and that the applicant should put in a wider reveal on the new construction. Chairman Klaus added that the proposed stamped walkway should contain brick or concrete but not stamped concrete.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

8 [COA-042472-2018](#) 807 North 24th Street - Construct two attached single family homes.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Marion Cake, stated that the submitted building plans depict the actual size of the windows that he plans to install in the new construction. Chairman Klaus critiqued that the windows on the proposed construction are not even centered, stating that they not only are different sizes but are, also, not properly spaced. Mr. Cake replied that the architect may have moved the windows after the engineering review, but he himself would support moving the windows over, agreeing that centering the fenestration would look better.

Mr. Cake suggested that the Commission consider the value of a proposed smooth PVC window manufactured by Legacy. Chairman Klaus encouraged Mr. Cake to bring a sample of the proposed PVC window for Commission review. Mr. Cake replied that he wishes to bring samples to the Commission before making any final decisions regarding window construction. Mr. Hendricks added that the applicant should align the cornice brackets with the window jambs as well.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

9 [COA-042473-2018](#) 418 North 23rd Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Marion Cake, expressed support for the staff recommendations. Chairman Klaus stated that because the applicant is constructing a house of a historic style, the house needs to relate to every other house on the block. Chairman Klaus, additionally, asked the applicant why he would not consider a two story porch. Mr. Cake replied that a two story porch would invade the homeowner's privacy, because the two story porch would reach the bedroom. Chairman Klaus asked the applicant if he is constructing a k style gutter, and Mr. Cake confirmed that he is installing a k style gutter. Ms. Brewer commented that the gutter should not overhand the house. Chairman Klaus indicated that the gutters should be moved to not block the front column.

Chairman Klaus asked the Commissioners if any of them object to the doors on the rear elevation being asymmetrical. Commissioners affirmed that they had no objection to asymmetrical doors on the rear elevation. Mr. Wheeler added that the porch column decorations appear too ornate for a structure that is beside other homes that do not have such an ornate design on their porch posts. Mr. Hendricks agreed that the detail on the columns is inconsistent with decorations on that specific block in the historic district. Ms. Brewer noted that the porch should be inset so the porch roof is located within the body of the building.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

Adjournment

Chairman Klaus adjourned the meeting at 6:40 pm.