



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, December 19, 2017

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

BEGINNING AT 3:30 PM

Call to Order

Mr. Yates called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 9 - * David C. Cooley, * Bryan Green, * Gerald Jason Hendricks, * James W. Klaus, * Andrew Ray McRoberts, * Joseph Yates, * Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and * Sanford Bond

Approval of Minutes

September 26, 2017

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that the September minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - David C. Cooley, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Sanford Bond

Excused -- 2 - Bryan Green and Andrew Ray McRoberts

October 10, 2017 (Quarterly Meeting)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Klaus, that the October quarterly minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Sanford Bond

Excused -- 1 - Bryan Green

Abstain -- 3 - David C. Cooley, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

October 24, 2017

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that The October minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - David C. Cooley, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Sanford Bond

Excused -- 2 - Bryan Green and Andrew Ray McRoberts

November 28, 2017

The November minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

OTHER BUSINESS

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts updated the Commission regarding the ordinance change for the Better Housing Coalition recommended seat to a citizen-at-large appointment. The ordinance change also added a requirement that at least one Commission member be a resident of a City Old and Historic District. Ms. Pitts stated that the ordinance will go before City Council on January 3rd. Ms. Pitts added that she has spoken to the City Clerk's office regarding applications to fill the position, which could be approved by the January meeting.

Ms. Pitts updated the Commission on the appeal that is outstanding. She explained that staff met with Councilwoman Newbille to explain the circumstances and reasoning behind the approval for 101 N. 29th Street. Staff explained how the Commission evaluates applications on a case-by-case basis. She stated that Councilwoman Newbille understood the explanation and staff met with the applicant's attorney to explain the same. Ms. Pitts stated that as of today, no legislation has been introduced to amend or return the decision.

Ms. Chen stated that there will be some changes in CAR staffing as Ms. Pitts has requested an internal re-assignment. In addition, Ms. Jeffries will be out on maternity leave in late February or early March. She stated that the department is currently advertising for a Planner II position which will close on December 24. Staff hopes to fill both Planner II positions from this applicant pool. Ms. Chen stated that staff is concerned that as CAR currently functions, providing staffing for the Commission is unsustainable. The workload does not allow staff the opportunity for anything outside of managing monthly applications. Ms. Chen stated she would like to form a committee early next year to evaluate how the CAR is staffed. Mr. Yates asked if the department director will be a part of the discussion. Ms. Chen replied that she anticipates he will. Ms. Chen added that the CAR has always had a staff person however the workload has increased and staffing has not kept pace. Mr. McRoberts offered to assist with the committee.

Continuation of discussion.

Ms. Pitts stated that the next quarterly meeting would be scheduled for January 9th. The Commission commented that it may be best to move the meeting to the following week, January 16th. Mr. Hendricks offered to host the meeting at his office, 2100 East Cary Street.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts stated that staff has been able to sign off on building permits on time this month. Several new single family homes have recently been approved, including 2900 W. Leigh Street, 717 N. 24th Street, and also many permits for the Better Housing Coalition development on Venable Street. Ms. Pitts explained that the administrative approvals issued are on the last page of the report which are separate from building permits. She provided an update on a project that was heard last month regarding the replacement of vinyl windows on a home built in 2007 and the owners returned to staff with a proposal to install aluminum clad wood windows which was administratively approved.

Enforcement Report

Staff stated that there are no updates to enforcement items this month.

Other Committee Reports

Mr. Green stated that the Urban Design Committee heard two cases this month, one regarding encroachments for cell towers and another for the Cannon Creek Greenway.

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

BEGINNING AT 4:00 PM**CONSENT AGENDA**

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Yates, that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Sanford Bond

- 2** [COA-027102-2017](#) 730 North 23rd Street - Relocate a window and door on the rear of the structure.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by McRoberts, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: details of the new door or window that will be installed as a result of the modification to the openings be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; details regarding the replacement of the window frames be submitted for administrative review and approval; and the replacement sashes be two-over-two with simulated divided lites including interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Sanford Bond

- 6** [COA-027272-2017](#) 3000-3006 East Franklin Street - Modify approved plans for three attached single family dwellings.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by McRoberts, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the visible basement level on the east and west elevations be clad in brick for the entire elevation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Sanford Bond

REGULAR AGENDA

- 1 [COA-027039-2017](#) 3118 East Broad Street - Construct a new garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 1/23/18](#)

[Staff Report - 1/23/18](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Application and Plans - 12/19/17](#)

[Staff Report - 12/19/17](#)

Mr. Ed Lane, the applicant, came forward to answer questions. Mr. Lane stated that the owner wishes to clad the garage in siding to be consistent with the house, or to do a brick face on the alley side. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor asked the applicant if it would be possible to install a garage door with a smooth finish. The applicant replied that it would.

Mr. Yates inquired if the proposal is beyond the current footprint of the garage and whether the applicant has confirmed the zoning requirements. Mr. Lane replied that the new garage will be longer and narrower and they had confirmed the requirements with the zoning division.

Mr. McRoberts asked why the existing brick walls are no longer structurally stable. The applicant replied that the walls are leaning, the footings are compromised, and it is currently being braced on the side wall. Mr. Cooley stated that there was a visible crack in the masonry but the walls looked plumb to him. The Commission commented generally regarding concerns with the common wall shared with the adjacent garage.

The applicant stated that the homeowner wishes to create some extra storage and provide space to park two cars. Mr. Hendricks commented that this could be accomplished by adding an addition to the back of the existing structure which is large enough for two cars.

Public Comment:

Patrick Ludden, the homeowner, inquired if the Commission members have made a site visit to the property. He added that the existing structure is falling down and it would be too costly to repair it to be able to support any additional improvements. Mr. Johnson, Mr. Klaus, and Ms. Aarons-Sydnor all commented that it would be preferable to save the historic fabric.

Mr. Hendricks commented that the proposal is not consistent with the existing structure, which he believes can be salvaged. He inquired if additional details could be requested from the structural engineer. Mr. Cooley commented that repointing the existing structure would be more expensive than building a new garage. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if a brick garage was historically typical even if the house was frame. Mr. Yates replied that brick was typical up to the 1920's, when metal was more common. Mr. McRoberts commented that the current design does not follow the existing form and does not relate to adjacent outbuildings. Mr. Yates commented that if the roof form was changed to a shallow gable facing the alley and the front faced in brick it may be more in keeping with the district.

A motion was made by Mr. Klaus, seconded by Mr. Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the facade facing the alley be brick, and the roof form be changed to appear like a shed roof. The motion was defeated, 3-6-0.

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the plans to propose a design more in keeping with the historic garage onsite and adjacent garages. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Sanford Bond

No -- 3 - David C. Cooley, James W. Klaus and Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

3 [COA-027042-2017](#) 625 North 27th Street - Construct a new garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the height of the garage be reduced by 2 feet and the garage door be smooth, without a woodgrain. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - David C. Cooley, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Sanford Bond

No -- 3 - Bryan Green, Joseph Yates and Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

4 [COA-027104-2017](#) Final Location, Character and Extent Review for the Rehabilitation of Abner Clay Park, 200 West Clay Street.

Attachments: [CAR Report to CPC](#)

[Staff Report to CAR](#)

[Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Map](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Mr. Johnson, that this Location, Character, and Extent Item be recommended for final approval with the following conditions: a revised Tree Removal Plan be submitted to include maintaining the trees surrounding the playground; the applicant work with the City Arborist to determine if any additional healthy trees can be saved on site; an effort be made to include additional trees onsite as a part of the park's design while maintaining the desired areas of open space; and the lighting meet the Urban Design Committee's recommendations for color temperature. Mr. Yates offered an amendment to the motion to add the condition that the applicant consider providing irrigation as a part the project if feasible. His amendment was accepted by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor and Mr. Johnson.

Aye -- 9 - David C. Cooley, Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr., Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor and Sanford Bond

5 [COA-027198-2017](#) 533 Mosby Street - Modify approved plans for a new garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Jonah Green, the applicant, came forward to present the proposal. He stated that the lot is narrow and the house is very small and so the owner was interested in adding additional storage space to the garage as the house has very little storage space.

Mr. Klaus inquired if the garage could be extended into the lot rather than adding a second story. Mr. Jonah Green responded that this would impede on the interior courtyard. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if the house could be expanded. Mr. Jonah Green responded that there is no room to expand the house because of the size of the lot. Mr. Hendricks commented that the proposed height was an issue, and could possibly be reduced to 18'6". Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that it would be better if the second story was more of an attic rather than a full story. Mr. Green inquired if the intended use of the structure was a garage. Mr. Jonah Green replied that it would be used as a studio but could also function as a garage for any future owners.

Public Comment

Mr. Bobby Duhart of 539 Mosby Street, came forward to speak against the project, specifically concerning the building's siting, compatibility, drainage issues, and access to the property.

Ms. Carolyn Mullaney, the property owner, came forward to respond, stating that there is a deeded right-of-way that provides access to the rear of the property.

Close Public Comment

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor and Mr. Cooley commented that the roof will overhang the property line as proposed.

Mr. Yates commented that he agreed with the staff report, that the building is too large.

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be denied for the reasons cited in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates and Sanford Bond
- No --** 4 - David C. Cooley, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 7 [COA-027097-2017](#) 2108 1/2 East Broad Street - Construct new three-story single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Dave Johannas, the applicant, came forward to present the project. He explained that he examined the English basement approach but came to realize that the most dominant element along the street were the front porches which an English basement would interrupt. Mr. Johannas also stated that structurally it would be difficult to lower the foundation because of concerns with the footings of the adjacent buildings.

Mr. Cooley inquired about the proposed sideyard setbacks and whether they met zoning. Mr. Johannas responded that an administrative variance would be required and the neighbors would have to be contacted regarding the setbacks and the fenestration on the sides. Mr. Cooley asked if the house could be two stories, Mr. Johannas replied that the home would be too small. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that the narrowness of the building emphasizes its height.

Public Comment

Ms. Martha Broughton came forward to speak against the project, specifically regarding the modern design, the height, the second story front balcony, and the proposed dark colors.

Mr. Dave Siebert came forward and asked the Commission to provide as much feedback as possible, as they are still open to changing the design.

Close Public Comment

Mr. Yates commented that he liked the contemporary design but was still concerned with the height. Mr. Green commented that he preferred the previous design and agreed that the building is too tall. Mr. Cooley commented that he preferred the modern design but would like to see the first floor pushed down and the height to step up the street between the existing buildings. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that the cornice should be stronger and the building should be a lighter color. The Commission generally agreed that the building was too tall.

This Application was conceptually reviewed. No vote or action was taken on this item.

- 8 [COA-027040-2017](#) 3020 East Franklin Street - Construct a new duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Zach Kennedy, the applicant, came forward to answer questions about the project.

Mr. Hendricks commented on the proposed pier construction and the use of this element in the surrounding area.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that an entrance is typically located within a recess rather than a bay, adding that alternating the bays and recesses would be preferable. Mr. Klaus agreed, stating that the facade should appear as two distinct units with alternating rather than mirrored bays.

Mr. Yates cautioned the applicant about the size limitation of casement windows, as the proposed windows appeared very large. He had no concerns with the proposed facade.

Mr. Green commented that more detail should be added to the facade, such as a porch structure across the entire facade and a more detailed cornice.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor commented that the plans and elevations submitted do not match.

This Application was conceptually reviewed. No vote or action was taken on this item.

9 [COA-027041-2017](#) 2200 - 2202 M Street - Construct a new duplex

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Matthew Jarreau, the applicant, came forward to answer questions about the project.

The Commission generally commented that the side elevation needed more architectural interest, the bays should be square and deeper to better fit in with the block, and a roof should be added to the front porch over the two entrances.

This Application was conceptually reviewed. No vote or action was taken on this item.

10 [COA-027043-2017](#) 2825 M Street - Construct a new duplex

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Mr. Matthew Jarreau, the applicant, came forward to present the project. He stated that the building faces 29th street to create a wider structure while providing a back yard behind the building.

Mr. Bond commented that the facade appeared flat and could be improved by adding a

front porch.

Mr. Green commented that he was concerned with the proportions of the facade, adding that four bays would appear more similar to a Greek Revival style, with one dormer per bay. He agreed that a simple front porch would be appropriate. Mr. Yates agreed with Mr. Green's comment regarding increasing the number of bays and noted that some grand Greek Revival structures have five bays. Mr. Green also commented that additional windows should be added to the corner elevation.

This Application was conceptually reviewed. No vote or action was taken on this item.

Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 6:27pm.