



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, September 24, 2019

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Call to Order

Call to Order

James Klaus, the Chairman, called the business portion of the September 24 meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review to order at 3:30 pm.

Roll Call

Present -- 9 - * Commissioner Sanford Bond, * Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, * Commissioner James W. Klaus, * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and * Commissioner Mitch Danese

Approval of Minutes

August 27, 2019

A motion was made by Commissioner Neville Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Jason Hendricks, that the August 27 2019 Meeting minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Carey L. Jones, Secretary to the Commission of Architectural Review, stated that the location and agenda have yet to be set for the upcoming CAR quarterly meeting on October 8th. Two agenda items which Ms. Jones stated she would like to add are: updating guidelines for new construction to make them more context-sensitive; and updating demolition guidelines. Commission members should contact Ms. Jones with any other items they would like added. Ms. Jones asked if there was an alternate location for the meeting, hearing none, it was decided that the upcoming quarterly meeting would be held in City Hall.

Commissioner Morgan asked what the process is for updating the Guidelines. Ms. Jones stated that updates are proposed and discussed by Commission, usually at quarterly

meetings, and then voted on by the Commission.

Chairman Klaus mentioned that the Guidelines have not been changed recently, but that there have been recent updates to administrative approval guidelines, and to standard operating procedures. Ms. Jones affirmed that operating procedures have changed, and that this would be reflected in the number of items on the consent agenda for the current meeting.

Ms. Jones stated that Commission staff had a productive meeting with contractors for a project at 2009 Venable Street.

Administrative Approval Report

No items from the Administrative Approval Report or Building Permit Report were discussed.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jones had no updates to share in regard to the Enforcement Report.

Other Committee Reports

The agenda for the upcoming Urban Design Committee meeting, to be held on Thursday October 10, was distributed to Commission members. There are two items on the agenda, one of which is security enhancements on 9th Street in front of St. Paul's Episcopal Church, which is a City Old and Historic District. Comments or questions about the UDC items can be passed along to Ms. Jones, who would then confer with Mr. Joshua Son, the UDC Secretary.

The meeting recessed at 3:36 PM.

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

The Chairman invited the Commission to suggest projects that they would like to move from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. He explained to the applicants and the general public that items are placed on the consent agenda if they do not seem to require much discussion. However, if an application is placed on the consent agenda and the applicant does not think it belongs there, they have an opportunity to have it moved back to the regular agenda. Also, members of the public have an opportunity to comment on any items placed on the consent agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, with Commissioner Bond seconding, to move the 13th item, 511 North 21st Street, to the consent agenda. Commissioner Hendricks expressed concern about the size of the proposed building and an expanse of blank street-facing wall. Commissioner Morgan expressed agreement.

The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye – 4 - Commissioner Ashleigh Brewer, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James Klaus, Commissioner Sean Wheeler

No – 5 - Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Neville Johnson, Commissioner Lane Pearson, Commissioner Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, with Commissioner Bond seconding, to move the 11th item, COA-060028-2019, 3006 Monument Avenue, to the consent agenda. The motion passed by the following vote:

Aye – 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh Brewer, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James Klaus, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Lane Pearson, Commissioner Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

No – 1 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler

Commissioner Klaus asked if there was any public comment. There was none. Commissioner Morgan recused herself from voting on items 1 and 5 from the consent agenda.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that the consent agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 9 - Commissioner Ashleigh Brewer, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James Klaus, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Neville Johnson, Commissioner Lane Pearson, Commissioner Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

Sarah Crews, owner of 3006 Monument Avenue Unit 1, stated that she had not heard the request for public comment regarding the consent agenda, and that she would like to comment on it.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, with Commissioner Wheeler seconding, to move the 11th item, COA-060028-2019, 3006 Monument Avenue, back to the regular agenda. The motion passed by the following vote:

Aye – 8 - Commissioner Ashleigh Brewer, Commissioner James Klaus, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Neville Johnson, Commissioner Lane Pearson, Commissioner Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler

No – 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that the consent agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

- 1 [COA-060589-2019](#) 14 1/2 West Leigh Street - Rehabilitate an existing, single-family residence; demolish a rear addition and reconstruct a front porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the windows on the front façade be arched; the applicant use a flat lock metal or a dark TPO roof for the porch; the applicant submit a site plan with the location of the proposed HVAC system and any proposed site improvements for review and approval; and any additional conditions imposed by the Virginia Department of Historic Resources and/or the National Park Service be submitted for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

2 [COA-060555-2019](#) 14 West Duval Street - Demolish two attached sheds, exterior repairs.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following condition is met: any additional conditions imposed by the Virginia Department of Historic Resources and/or the National Park Service be submitted for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

3 [COA-060012-2019](#) 603 1/2 North 23rd Street - Construct a new shed in a rear yard.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final window and roof specifications, including materials, be submitted for review and approval; and final paint colors be submitted to staff for review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

4 [COA-060044-2019](#) 509 West 22nd Street - Install eight solar panels on an existing residential roof.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

- 5** [COA-060051-2019](#) 305 West Broad Street - Construct a new accessory structure and pergola; install a new fabric awning.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the awning be mounted into the mortar joints to avoid damage to the historic masonry; the applicant submit the final colors for the new trash enclosure structure to staff for review and approval; and any additional conditions imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to staff for review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

- 6** [COA-060084-2019](#) 105 North 29th Street - Enclose a rear porch and install casement windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the new tongue and groove siding use a different reveal to differentiate it from the existing tongue and groove siding; the color of the new siding be submitted to staff for review and approval; and any additional conditions imposed by the DHR and/or the NPS be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

- 7 [COA-060189-2019](#) 613-615 North 28th Street - Remove an existing rear deck and construct a new screen porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the porch be inset at least 6 inches from the side walls; the porch railing be wood and utilize a Richmond Rail or the pickets be placed on the interior of the rail; the screening be installed on the interior of the columns and railings; and the porch be painted or stained a neutral color with the color submitted to staff for administrative approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

- 8 [COA-060031-2019](#) 505 North 24th Street - Construct a new one-story accessory building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the roof be clad in a more compatible material, and final roof specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; the proposed cypress trim and rainscreen be painted or opaquely stained, and the color selection be submitted to staff for administrative approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

REGULAR AGENDA

- 9 [COA-060187-2019](#) 813 North 28th Street - Demolish an existing school building and construct new community amenities.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Darin Simmons, Chief Operating Officer for Richmond Public Schools, introduced himself. Mr. Simmons stated that RPS does not currently have a need or use for the existing school building, and that the space is needed for basketball courts and other recreation

space and amenities for the school and neighborhood and to meet the state requirements for recreational space.

Jason Kamras, Superintendent of Richmond Public Schools, introduced himself and reiterated Mr. Simmons' point that recreation facilities are needed. He also stated that the existing school building and its HVAC equipment are in poor condition. Mr. Kamras argued that the cost of preserving the existing schools takes resources from other schools in the system.

Cheryl Burke introduced herself as the 7th District School Board representative and a longtime Church Hill resident. Ms. Burke expressed concern that such an old school building has been in use without improvement or sufficient maintenance, and that the space it takes will take away space for children's recreation.

Cyane Crump, Executive Director of Historic Richmond, stated that Historic Richmond has been supportive of the new school plan, but has also advocated for alternatives to demolition for the most historic component of the existing school structure. If the historic school buildings are demolished, Historic Richmond has three requests: 1) a community panel be convened to determine how best to memorialize the historic school and its complex history at this site, possibly including preserving components of the historic school and incorporating them into the landscape plan; 2) an intensive survey be performed prior to demolition to glean more historic information about the site and school, as Department of Historic Resources performed a survey in 1991; 3) the survey and nomination for Richmond public schools should be updated and expanded to bring them up to date and carried forward to current times. Ms. Crump affirmed that Historic Richmond is excited for the new school and investment it represents.

Richard Rumrill, a neighbor whose children attend Chimborazo Elementary, stated that Chimborazo Elementary has half the playground space that George Mason Elementary will have, as is the case with many local schools. He suggested other spaces in the neighborhood as options, e.g., the space adjacent to an old water tower, for playgrounds. Mr. Rumrill stated that to say the play is being stolen from the children is very strong. Mr. Rumrill stated that he is a member of Church Hill Association Transportation Committee, which has been looking at pedestrian options for the 29th Street corridor. Mr. Rumrill expressed surprise that the school is considered to be on 28th St, because the old school structure is on 29th Street, and that is where the entrance is located. Mr. Rumrill stated that the school name of George Mason, to his knowledge, dates from the 1920s when the area was rezoned, at which time the density of houses per block went from 40 to 10. Mr. Rumrill continued that this is the reason many children attending the school will be coming from far away, and the reason that more people were not at the meeting to comment on the application. Mr. Rumrill added that putting up a new school building, as opposed to using a well-maintained older building as elsewhere, could be viewed as reflecting a lack of concern about children of the neighborhood. Mr. Rumrill stated that the proposed school building, suitable for suburban areas, as opposed to a 2- or 3-story school, uses up a lot of the space which school officials claim they need for play areas. Addressing Mr. Kamras, Mr. Rumrill stated that at a recent meeting Mr. Kamras had stated that he did not know how much play time students have at the school. Mr. Rumrill stated that his understanding was that the area where the old building is currently will not be for the school, but rather for the community, and that it will actually be fenced off from the school.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any further public comment. There was none.

Chairman Klaus stated that the mandate of the Commission is to uphold the Commission

Guidelines, and that this should not be perceived as being opposed to children having playgrounds; and that there is an appeal process for Commission decisions.

Commissioner Bond suggested that, in line with Ms. Crump's remarks, that there could be alternate ways to preserve the history of this school, or perhaps the façade of the historic building could be retained and used as a gateway to the new playing fields with the suggestion that preserving the history in some way does not require preserving the whole building intact. Chairman Klaus expressed agreement, suggesting that some sort of middle ground could be figured out and that a deferral would allow time for to work on this.

Commissioner Hendricks stated that there had been considerable time for the applicants to consider alternatives to demolition in the time since the first CAR review for the project, and that the Commission had been clear in their opposition to demolition of the historic building.

Commissioner Hendricks expressed agreement with Mr. Rumrill about investigating alternate playground space, and expressed frustration that the Commission is now being placed in a position of opposition to the need for schools and amenities for children and the public.

Commissioner Morgan read aloud a portion of a public comment letter from Gail Robinson, a Church Hill/Shockoe Bottom resident of about 50 years. Ms. Robinson's letter expressed support for the preservation of African-American historical sites, especially as they relate to education, and that therefore believed the George Mason Elementary School building should be preserved and a community panel assembled to determine how best to memorialize the history of the school at its site.

Commissioner Morgan stated that the Commission often reviews properties which are in much worse condition than the current George Mason Elementary School, and that therefore it is problematic to allow its demolition. Commissioner Morgan expressed agreement that some portion of the building should be preserved, to retain the historical significance of the site.

Commissioner Morgan stated that the Commission has already approved construction of the new school, and that not allowing the demolition of the old school building does not prevent children from attending the new one. Chairman Klaus added the next application should specifically address the 1922 building.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hendricks, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to defer the application for the reasons cited in the staff report and to allow the applicant the opportunity to consider all feasible alternatives to the demolition of the 1922 section, including an appropriate new use and rehabilitation, relocation of the structure to a compatible site, re-sale of the property to an individual committed to suitable rehabilitation or relocation; and consider preservation of important architectural elements of the building. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

10 [COA-060013-2019](#) 614 North 27th Street - Rehabilitate an existing front porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Ms. Chelsea Jeffries.

The applicant representative, Alex Ricart, introduced himself. Mr. Ricart stated that one of the columns was deemed beyond repair and in dangerous condition by contractors and should therefore be replaced; and that once one is replaced, the others should also be, so that they match. Mr. Ricart stated that the proposed replacement columns are the same circumference, with a very similar cap design and that the railing may not be original and that the applicant's intention would be to replace it with as close a match as possible. Mr. Ricart stated that painting the floor of the patio was also a component of the application, and he was not sure if staff had a recommendation in regard to that.

Chairman Klaus asked if Mr. Ricart would consider a column material other than fiberglass. Mr. Ricart stated that he was open to replacing them with something better and he checked local shops and could not find something comparable to fiberglass.

Chairman Klaus asked if the applicant planned to paint the floor the same color it is currently. Mr. Ricart stated that the plan was to paint it a different color, but one on the approved Palette.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any public comment. Hearing none, he opened the floor for Commission motion and discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler stated, for clarification, that the staff recommendation was to splice in repairs to the columns, as opposed to replacing them. Chairman Klaus stated that the floor painting could be administratively approved and would not require Commission review.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the historic columns remain in place and be repaired and repainted; the existing beadboard be removed; if the historic porch ceiling is not existing beneath the beadboard, a new tongue-and-groove ceiling that matches the 2016 photograph be installed; the applicant investigate the source of the water infiltration and work with staff to develop a plan to address any drainage issues, to include roof, gutter or downspout repair or replacement; the decking be cleaned by the gentlest means possible with a low-pressure wash and any damaged floor boards be replaced in-kind with new wood tongue-and-groove decking. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

11 [COA-060028-2019](#) 3006 Monument Avenue - Replace existing ceramic tile walkway with a new brick walkway.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Ms. Jeffries.

The applicant representative, Eric Wickenheiser, introduced himself. Mr. Wickenheiser stated that the plan was to use brick pavers rather than match the existing tiles because the tiles are from the 1970s. Mr. Wickenheiser explained that the proposed pavers are for drainage and are useful for avoiding clogs and that the herringbone pattern is aesthetically pleasing and in use in some of the City's historic areas, including the state capital. Mr. Wickenheiser stated that the Monument Avenue Preservation Society had approved the use of the pavers, and that he had a letter to this effect. Mr. Wickenheiser stated that concrete is not the best material and is not aesthetically pleasing, even though it may be historically accurate.

Commissioner Johnson asked if the applicant had looked for identical replacement tiles. Mr. Wickenheiser stated that he had found them, but did not want to use them. Chairman Klaus stated that, according to the Guidelines, existing features such as tiles can be repaired, but that if a homeowner wishes to make a replacement, the replacement material must be historically accurate and that these guidelines apply to the tile. Chairman Klaus continued that in lieu of photographic evidence to the contrary, an accurate replacement material for a 1920s construction would be concrete and that in terms of the more aesthetic brick to which Mr. Wickenheiser referred, in use around the capital, it is appropriate to a much older 18th/19th century construction era. Mr. Wickenheiser expressed concern that concrete slabs are ubiquitous, not aesthetic, and not an improvement.

Chairman Klaus opened the floor for public comment.

Sarah Crews, president of the 3006 Monument Avenue Condo Association, stated that the reason brick was chosen over tile was that the existing tile on the steps and walkway is in bad repair, bowed, and also slick when wet, and thus unsafe. She stated that two falls have occurred and rubber pavers were installed to address the safety concern. Ms. Crews reiterated the concern about aesthetics of having concrete over such a large surface area, stating that brick is more aesthetic and that the building and nearby walkways are brick. She also mentioned that concrete is prone to cracking.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was further comment. Hearing none, he opened the floor for Commission motion and discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, to approve the application as submitted. Chairman Klaus stated that the Commission's purview is to adhere to the historic Guidelines, and that once exceptions are made, they will tend to multiply. Commissioner Hendricks stated that concrete, if done in a historically accurate manner, has a warm and more pleasing appearance. Commissioner Bond stated that there are ways to break up a large expanse of concrete – control joints prevent cracking and also create a pleasing patterned appearance. Commissioner Danese asked if there were reference photos from the period of construction, the 1920s or 1930s. Ms. Jeffries stated that she had looked for them via the usual research resources, but not found any. The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye – 1 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler

No – 8- Commissioner Ashleigh Brewer, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner

James Klaus, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Neville Johnson, Commissioner Lane Pearson, Commissioner Jason Hendricks, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Bond, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the existing tile walkway be repaired or the tiles be replaced with concrete. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 8 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese
- No --** 1 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler

13 [COA-060033-2019](#) 511 North 21st Street - Construct a new two-car garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Ms. Jeffries.

The applicant representative, Charles Field, introduced himself.

Mr. Field stated that his client would have liked to make the garage narrower, reducing the width from 24 feet to 18 feet to leave space for a nearby magnolia tree, but did not want to delay the approval. Chairman Klaus stated that in this case the Commission and the applicant might be in agreement.

Commissioner Hendricks expressed concern that the street-facing wall of the garage might be too blank and featureless, and asked for specifics as to a reduced size. Mr. Field stated that 18 feet by 18 feet size would be agreeable to the applicant, and also that his client would be amenable to adding a window to the street-facing wall.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any public comment.

Janice Holly, a neighbor and longtime resident, expressed concern about new amenities such as additions and garages being added to the neighborhood, which makes the neighborhood more congested and less peaceful and aesthetically pleasing.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was further public comment. Hearing none, he closed public comment and opened the floor for Commission motion and discussion.

Commissioner Pearson stated that he would like some attempt made in the new garage design to reference the building which was previously on the site. Commissioner Hendricks stated that, based on the limited information available about the previous structure, keeping the new one within 18-20 feet in size would make it more line with the historic size.

Commissioner Morgan stated that there were a sufficient number of proposed changes to design and orientation of the building to make it difficult to rely on staff approvals henceforth. Commissioner Johnson expressed agreement that with a size change comes

a setback change, which without seeing plans is difficult to envision.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Hendricks, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the size of the garage be reduced to 18 feet by 18 feet; additional fenestration be added to the north elevation; and the garage doors be of a contemporary design with the final door specifications submitted to staff for administrative approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

No -- 2 - Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

14 [COA-060090-2019](#) 706 North 21st Street - Demolish an existing single-family residence.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Ms. Jones.

Mr. Enoch Pou, introduced himself as representative of the applicant, Xtreme Homes LLC.

Mr. Pou stated that there is nothing of architectural or historical value to salvage in the building. Mr. Pou confirmed that the building is unsecured, as stated in the staff report, and that this is due to vandalism. Mr. Pou stated that photos show extreme deterioration and water damage to the interior of the building, and exterior walls as well and the engineer's report states that the foundation and pier structure are over-spanned, though there is not photo documentation of this. Mr. Pou explained that the applicants were performing preliminary demolition, and that this is how they saw the condition of rot behind the walls. Mr. Pou continued that at this time the house began to sway and the applicants vacated the building and then engaged the engineer.

Mr. Pou indicated that salvaging the house would be as much work as building a new house, and that moving the house is unworkable due to lack of nearby vacant lots; the expense of rehabilitation precludes selling to someone more interested in taking it on.

Commissioner Pearson stated that there was a lack of clarity as to what happened between the Commission's approval of the house's rehabilitation in December 2018 and the demolition application being filed. Commissioner Pearson stated that the applicants' failure to respond to staff during this time could be innocent or it could be read as avoidance. Commissioner Pearson asked if Mr. Pou could provide some reassurance that this was not done so that the owner could in effect ask for forgiveness after the fact rather than ask for permission before.

Mr. Pou stated that the applicants required Commission approval before they could get a permit. Mr. Pou reiterated that, while trying to assess the condition of the house, they became aware of its deterioration.

Chairman Klaus stated that the Commission understands the house is in poor condition though the applicant's proposal to put up two houses in place of the one currently on the site goes against historical precedent for the site. Given that the Commission is unlikely to approve two new houses but could potentially approve one, Chairman Klaus asked if that changes the economics of demolishing the existing house versus not demolishing it. Mr. Pou stated that this would still not make economic sense.

Commissioner Johnson asked if, after the building swaying as stated by Mr. Pou, the applicants had made an attempt to stabilize the building. Mr. Pou stated that due to safety concerns, they did not.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any public comment.

Ms. Janice Holly, resident of the area, stated that opportunities for home improvements have not been made as available for 21st Street as for other nearby areas. Ms. Holly stated that she would prefer that the houses on the block stay as they are, and that a single-family house not be replaced with two houses since this block is old and unique and should be preserved.

Ms. Mary Field, a resident of 22nd Street, introduced herself, and stated that the block in question is a precious one and she values how well-preserved it has remained.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was further public comment. Hearing none, he closed public comment and opened the floor for Commission motion and discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Bond, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to deny the application for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission further recommends the applicant secure the building to prevent any further damage, including fixing any damaged or missing gutters and closing any openings. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 8 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese
- No --** 1 - Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 15 [COA-060066-2019](#) 2117-2119 Carrington Street - Construct two new semi-attached residences on a corner lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Ms. Jones. Commissioner Pearson recused himself from review of this project.

Commissioner Morgan asked what the side-yard setbacks are supposed to be, as per Zoning. Ms. Jones stated that Zoning staff had not had an opportunity to review the application.

Chairman Klaus commented that there were no Sanborn maps with the application, and asked if there was information available about the previously existing buildings on the site. Ms. Jones stated that there was, it had not been included in this staff report but could be provided for the final review of the project, or via email to the Commissioners before then; and that she believed the last Sanborn map available had shown the lot to be vacant.

The applicant, Ms. Tiffany Person, introduced herself as the Director of Single-Family Development for the Better Housing Coalition. Ms. Person stated that the smaller window mentioned by staff is over a sink, and asked if staff wished for it to be removed. Ms. Jones clarified that staff's recommendation was that the fenestration pattern be more consistent, which can be done by incorporating interior details such that the window is the right size for the kitchen while appearing consistent from the outside. Chairman Klaus pointed out that recommendations for a street-facing façade are somewhat different than those for the opposite side, due to their being more visible.

Ms. Person asked if there were specific recommendations for the siding. Ms. Jones stated that she could provide examples of houses that have used a wider reveal. Ms. Person stated that she did not have HVAC details.

Commissioner Bond asked why the front façade had been broken up into 3 sections, while the building actually has two units. Ms. Person stated that this was part of making the house more modern and contemporary in style. Commissioner Bond stated that there are ways to make the building look contemporary while still having two parts in the front to reflect the two units.

Chairman Klaus expressed agreement with staff that the corner elevation needed to be addressed.

Commissioner Morgan stated that for final review the setbacks relative to neighboring properties should be shown. Commissioner Morgan stated that the 10-foot side yard setback seems excessive, and it would be good to know if that is reflective of zoning requirements; if it is not, the yard should be wider.

Commissioner Hendricks stated that the smaller kitchen window is not problematic, given that this is new, modern construction. Commissioner Hendricks stated that a Hardi-panel might be useful to change the proportion and scale of the cornice line; and agreed with Commissioner Morgan that the side yard setback seems extreme.

Commissioner Wheeler stated that the size of the front and rear columns seems off, and that the front porch should probably have some slope, for drainage.

Commissioner Brewer stated that the three-bay design is problematic; that the smaller kitchen window is not a problem, but that it should be shifted up so that the window heads align; and that the 2/2 light configuration is not problematic, but that 2/0 would be odd.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any public comment.

Ms. Nancy Lampert stated that historically there were two one-story cottages on the site in question.

The application was conceptually reviewed.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

- 16 [COA-060078-2019](#) 2242 Venable Street - Rehabilitate an existing building and construct a rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Ms. Jones.

Applicant Phil Cunningham, of Better Housing Coalition, introduced himself. Mr. Cunningham stated that the project under review is a rounding out of the recently completed Goodwyn at Union Hill apartment complex. Mr. Cunningham stated that, in response to staff comments, the applicants, working with Baskervill Architects, would gladly provide more details about the storefront windows, and could also reduce the massing of the addition, and reconfigure the roof form.

Mr. Cunningham stated that he had met with City zoning staff, and was told that the site is zoned R-63, and thus no off-street parking is required – though there may be potential for a tenant to lease spaces in the Goodwyn parking area.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if the 320 square feet of existing building referred to the enclosed portion or the overhang. Mr. Cunningham stated that this referred to the enclosed portion, and that the overhang is approximately the same size.

Ms. Kelly Murphy of Baskervill Architects introduced herself and stated that the reason for the proposed roof form was a response both to the sloped roof forms of the nearby station and church; and also to the corner location and the intent to show an open façade to both sides of the corner.

Commissioner Bond stated that the contemporary roof form is pleasing but has an aggressive appearance for the area.

Commissioner Danese stated that the roof slope looks as if it would send rain drainage to the existing building, which might not be desirable. Commissioner Danese also expressed concern as to where HVAC and trash will be located, and how visible they will be.

Commissioner Brewer asked if the existing and new proposed buildings need to be connected. Mr. Cunningham stated that an unconnected version had been explored, but that a contiguous space was determined to make more sense for leasing purposes. Commissioner Brewer stated that the push-back from staff regarding the building size could be less if the new construction were a new building in its own right, rather than an addition.

Commissioner Wheeler stated that it is hard not to overwhelm a 320-square-foot building; that the design was heading in a good direction; and that he did not have a problem with the proposed roof slope.

Commissioner Hendricks stated that, though connected, the existing and the addition

read as two separate buildings. Commissioner Hendricks stated that the distance from the street and the distance between buildings might need adjustment, that it looks somewhat crowded; and agreed with Commissioner Bond that the slanted roof form is good but could be a bit less aggressive.

Commissioner Morgan stated that the National Park Service has guidelines which allow additions to read as new buildings. Commissioner Morgan stated that she is generally favorable toward the design, and the siting, but that the roof form could be a bit less exaggerated.

Chairman Klaus stated that a point Commissioner Brewer may have been hinting at is that, if a new construction is not connected, it does not have to be smaller than the existing building. However, there are also constraints on the size of unconnected accessory buildings. Chairman Klaus stated that the height of the new construction should be reduced, but that this square footage could be made up by increasing the width.

Commissioner Johnson stated that the corner site is unique, and that the design and roof form are good, though siting of HVAC and trash will be important.

Commissioner Bond made the suggestion that the structure connecting the existing and new buildings could be glass, as a compromise, so that they can be both connected and distinct.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any public comment.

Ms. Lampert thanked Commission for bearing in mind that the new construction needs to be subordinate. Ms. Lampert stated that the parking lot on the existing property has major issues with drug dealing and dumpsters overflowing, and that a drug overdose recently occurred there; and she encouraged the Commission to consider safety issues both in terms of layout and management. Ms. Lampert stated that she understands also that the nearby church feels imposed upon spatially by the proposed construction.

The application was conceptually reviewed.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

- 17 [COA-060093-2019](#) 706 North 21st Street - Construct two new semi-attached residences and a new rear two-car garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Chairman Klaus suggested that, as this application goes along with the already-reviewed demolition application for the same address, which was on the regular agenda, the staff presentation could be abridged. Ms. Jones asked to go clarify one aspect of the proposal.

Ms. Jones stated that the staff report for the proposed new construction overlooked the proposed two-car garage. Ms. Jones stated that the proposed garage is similar in width to the proposed main structure, and that this is not in keeping with other outbuilding in the area.

Commissioner Pearson asked, as a procedural matter, if this application should be reviewed, as the rejection of the demolition application would tend to render it moot. Chairman Klaus stated that, in the event that Mr. Pou does get a demolition permit, he should have the information which a conceptual review will provide him as to what types of structures the Commission might or might not approve for the site. Commissioner Pearson pointed out that there is already an approved rehabilitation plan in place for the site, and questioned whether the Commission should review a new plan while that is still on the table.

Mr. Pou asked how, were the demolition of the existing house be allowed, the Commission would justify only allowing one house instead of two, to be built on that site. Chairman Klaus stated that the Commission strives to maintain historical continuity, and that there is sound historical evidence for the site only having one house on it. Ms. Jones stated that she, and perhaps a member of the zoning staff, could meet with Mr. Pou to explain further.

Commissioner Bond stated that one house with two units in it could be an option in such a circumstance but that a clever design would be necessary to maintain the feeling of the area. Commissioner Hendricks stated that the scale and proportion from the street would be the critical elements to preserve, depth being less of a critical factor.

Chairman Klaus asked if the Commissioners had any other comments on the application.

Chairman Klaus reiterated that the Commission's main priority is to save the building.

Commissioner Pearson stated that the Commission staff puts considerable effort into helping out with challenging projects and circumstances, and that some opportunities were lost by not maintaining better communication with staff. Commissioner Pearson suggested that going forward the applicants keep those channels of communication open.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

12 [COA-060095-2019](#) 3013 Libby Terrace - Reclad front porch and steps.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

This application was heard as part of the regular agenda, but was moved to the end of the meeting because the Applicant was not present.

Chairman Klaus asked if the applicant was present. They were not.

The application was presented by Ms. Jones.

Chairman Klaus asked if there was any public comment. Hearing none, he opened the floor for Commission motion and discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Bond, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, that the application be denied for the reasons cited in the staff report. A revised application should address drainage under the column bases; details of

the front edge of porch, such as skirt board and trim; and additional information about how the steps will be wrapped. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 9 - Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Adjournment