COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT August 23, 2016 Meeting

6. CAR No. 16-123 (J. Som)

500 West Marshall Street Jackson Ward Old and Historic District

Project Description: Replace existing garage doors with storefronts

and install new sidewalks and concrete pads to

accommodate three apartments in the existing garages.

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to modify the exterior of a six bay garage which fronts Henry Street in the Jackson Ward Old and Historic District to accommodate three apartments. The subject garage is located behind a duplex which fronts West Marshall Street. The garage currently has two operable garage doors, and the remaining openings on the east and west elevations are enclosed with plywood. The west elevation includes six windows including a visible 2/2 window and several windows which are boarded up. The north elevation includes a door with a single lite and a transom above.

The applicant is proposing the install glass and metal storefronts in the garage door openings on the east and north elevations. Two of the openings will also include a storefront door and three of the openings will include cementious siding in addition to the storefront glazing to fill the existing openings. On the west elevation, the applicant proposes to install 1/1 metal windows. The existing door on the south elevation will be retained. In addition to the modifications to the structure, the applicant proposes to install a new concrete sidewalk and curb in front of the structure on Henry Street. Additionally, applicant proposes to create a concrete pad for parking and three air conditioning condensers between the garage and the existing duplex. To facilitate parking on this pad, the applicant proposes to remove 10 feet of the existing granite curb. The applicant is pursuing rehabilitation tax credits for this project.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with conditions.

Garage Door Openings: The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook* and *Design Review Guidelines* state that entrances should not be removed or radically changed (pg. 67, #4). The introduction of storefront windows and doors does not alter the size of the opening or result in the loss of historic fabric. Staff does have concerns about the three opening in which the applicant is proposing to install fiber cement siding. As the addition of the fiber cement siding alters the size of the existing opening which is not recommended in the Guidelines, <u>staff</u> recommends the applicant install storefront glazing to fill the existing opening as is proposed for the other openings.

Windows on West Elevation: The *Guidelines* note that original windows should be retained and repaired and that the architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows (pg. 65, #1, #10). Staff observed at least one existing 2/2 window on the west elevation. <u>Staff recommends any existing windows be retained and repaired and any new windows be 2/2 true or simulated divided lite windows to match the original windows.</u>

Sidewalk, Curb Removal, and Concrete Pad: The *Guidelines* note that sidewalks and curbs should be built of common building materials found throughout the district (pg. 72, #7). As concrete sidewalks are found throughout the District, staff supports the installation of concrete sidewalks in front of the garage and the use of concrete to construct the parking pad. As the area has granite curbing and the Guidelines note that granite is an appropriate choice in the district (pg. 75, #4), staff recommends the applicant install granite curbing if enough granite curbing can be obtained from the Department of Public Works; stockpile. The *Guidelines* also note that existing granite curbing should be retained whenever possible (pg. 72, #5). For this reason, staff recommends denial of the removal of the granite curb.

Mechanical Equipment: The *Guidelines* state that HVAC equipment should be appropriately screened with fencing or vegetation. <u>Staff recommends the proposed equipment be screened in a manner to be reviewed and approved by <u>staff.</u></u>

As the applicant is pursuing rehabilitation tax credits for this project, staff recommends the Commission's approval should be conditioned upon the work being performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions. In addition, the applicant should submit any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted conditions, is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and Site Improvements in Sections 30-930.7(b) and (e) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.